

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
**EASTERN INTERIOR ALASKA  
SUBSISTENCE REGIONAL ADVISORY COUNCIL**

**VOLUME II  
PUBLIC MEETING**  
March 2nd, 1995  
Community Center  
9:30 o'clock a.m.  
Northway, Alaska

12  
13  
**COUNCIL MEMBERS PRESENT:**

14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
**LEE TITUS, CHAIRMAN  
JEFF ROACH, SECRETARY  
CHARLIE TITUS, JR., MEMBER  
JOHN A. STARR, MEMBER  
RANDY MAYO, MEMBER  
SELINA PETRUSKA, SR., MEMBER  
CHARLES MILLER, SR., MEMBER**

24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
**Vince Mathews, Coordinator**

**R & R COURT REPORTERS**

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

P R O C E E D I N G S

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50

(On record; 9:30 a.m.)

MR. LEE TITUS: Okay. We're gong to come back to  
order.

MR. MATHEWS: Mr. Chairman?

MR. LEE TITUS: Yes?

MR. MATHEWS: Before we get into the agenda, you  
requested over the phone and other conversations that each of  
the Council members have a copy of the transcript for joint  
meeting of the interagency staff committee and ten council  
chairs. So I'll be passing that out. I would encourage the  
Council members to kind of look at that; there will be some  
discussion about subjects that were discussed there today. You  
also asked for something that was put on one of the charts at  
the same meeting dealing with how the C&T Process may be held  
in the future. So, that's this copy here and that's taken  
directly from what was on the chart. And that's all I have, so  
I'll be passing those out.

MR. LEE TITUS: Okay. Back to the agenda; we're on  
item F, Status Report on Cooperative Management Plan. The  
first one we're going to talk about is the Mentasta Caribou  
herd.

MR. ROUTE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I guess I'll move  
this over here. I'm going to show some overheads, if that's  
all right. Will this reach or should I grab his? Okay. Well,  
see, I was here at 6:30 like you told me last night.

(Audience laughter)

MR. ROUTE: My name is Bill Route. I'm with  
Wangell-St. Elias National Park and I'm here to present a  
cooperative management plan that we've put together with the  
Alaska Department of Fish and Game and Tetlin National Wildlife  
Refuge on the Mentasta Caribou Herd. So, with that, I'm going  
to give you a few overheads to just give you a little bit of  
information on the herd. Each of you Council members should  
have been sent this Mentasta Plan. I know that some of you  
probably didn't bring it. If you need another copy, if some of  
you need another copy, I can provide you one or I can get you  
one just as soon as this presentation is over, if that's all  
right.

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET	1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE
277-0572/Fax 274-8982	272-7515

1           Like I said, this management plan is a cooperative  
 2 effort. I had the opportunity to speak a little bit with Jeff  
 3 Roach beforehand and get him kind of up to speed on it a little  
 4 bit in advance of the meeting. Originally, I was going to do  
 5 it with Lee Titus, but it worked out that Jeff had some time  
 6 and Lee didn't. So, Jeff can chime in at any time if he wants  
 7 to update things and if things aren't real clear. As I said,  
 8 this is with the Department of Fish and Game, the National Park  
 9 Service, and the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service.

10           MR. ROACH: Excuse me, Bill?

11

12           MR. ROUTE: Yeah, go ahead.

13

14           MR. ROACH: I think there's at least one person here  
 15 that doesn't have their copy. Is there anybody else on the  
 16 Council that needs a copy?

17

18           MR. ROUTE: I handed a couple out over there. Sean,  
 19 could you bring that one up? It's about 16 pages, I guess.  
 20 There's a lot going around.

21

22           MR. ROACH: Thanks, Bill.

23

24           MR. ROUTE: Everybody got a copy? Okay. For those  
 25 members that don't know much about the Mentasta Herd, this is  
 26 Gennallen, Alaska, of course, this is Tok up here. The herd  
 27 summers along the western slopes of the Wrangell-St. Elias  
 28 Range and then winters, moves with the Nelchina Herd and  
 29 winters up north of the Alaska Range up in the Flats here.  
 30 And, of course, this is what this Council will be most  
 31 interested in, is this winter range up here and the fact that  
 32 they winter with the Nelchina Herd, and we'll get into that  
 33 later.

34

35           I'm going to take you through, first of all, how we  
 36 propose to set some annual quotas on the herd in the fall. And  
 37 you won't be perhaps real interested in that, but then we'll  
 38 get into how there is incidental harvest occurring in the  
 39 wintertime and you'll be more interested in that as a Council  
 40 here. If there's any questions along the way, just don't  
 41 hesitate to ask. First of all, the herd increased slowly from  
 42 the late sixties up until about 1985, 1987 and, as you can see,  
 43 then had a quite drastic decline from '87 down to its present  
 44 low numbers of about 800 animals. That decline was around, oh,  
 45 25 percent per year. So, it declined quite rapidly. The State  
 46 season was closed in 1990, State sport season in the fall, in  
 47 MU 11. There was then a Federal subsistence season for two  
 48 years and that was closed, also, in 1992. Okay. So, we're  
 49 presently in a complete closure in the fall. There's no

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
 277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
 272-7515

subsistence harvest or sport harvest on the herd. So, this management plan is basically -- we're trying to set down into black and white under what circumstances this harvest would reopen. That's the primary goal of this management plan.

5  
6 The objectives of the herd are, to the extent possible, to allow for human harvest, to allow for a level of human harvest that will have minimal effects on the production composition and abundance of the Mentasta Herd. Now that is both utilizing mandates for the National Park Service, both within ANILCA and in our enabling legislation that provides that the National Park Service shall allow for natural fluctuations in wildlife populations, but that we also need to allow for human harvest. So, that's kind of a melding of those two mandates that we have to live within. The second, to provide harvest priority to Federally eligible subsistence users but to still allow for a State-authorized hunting to occur when possible. Okay. So, those are the primary objectives of the plan.

20  
21 Now, how do we plan to -- how do we propose meeting those objectives? For objective No. 1, to allow a level of human harvest that still doesn't have a lot of influence on the population, we propose allowing a fall harvest of between 15 and 20 percent of the previous two-year mean fall calf recruitment. Now, what that means is that we're going to use an average of the past fall's number of calves and we're going to use an average because rather than getting one real large estimate and the next year getting, you know, a small estimate and jerking the harvest around quite a bit, we wanted to use an average to kind of level it off a little bit more. It's a method that can be used as long as such recruitment is at least 80 calves. So, that means there will be some basement level, some level below which human harvest wouldn't occur. But as long as that herd is doing well enough to produce 80 calves on average, there would then be human harvest and that harvest would then be calculated at 15 to 20 percent of that number of fall calves. Any questions on that?

39  
40 MR. ROACH: Just a real quick point, Bill. The 15 to 20 percent, as you mentioned to me and the Council would probably like to know, that that's based on a historical harvest rate.

44  
45 MR. ROUTE: That's correct. And I'll give a little more representation of that later, but thanks for bringing that up, Jeff. We use 15 to 20 percent because that is what the historical harvest was, right around 18 percent. So, we selected that range so that it would be about the same as the

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

past. So, this shouldn't represent a reduction in harvest levels.

3

4 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Excuse me, Mr. Chairman. Are you just going to go right on through this or are we going to have time for questions?

7

8 MR. ROUTE: If you want to ask questions in the middle, that's fine, yeah. We can do it both ways. Either way, that's fine.

11

12 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Well, one of the things going back to the draft, I was wondering, you know, the decline in the herds, could you tell us what was the cause? Was it over-harvesting or was it due to the winter hardship on the herd or what?

17

18 MR. ROUTE: Okay. It probably wasn't due to harvest. It was a light enough harvest that I don't feel that that had anything to do with it. The winter of 1985 which was about the top of the population was a particularly heavy snow winter and that may have had something to do with it. We have a good window of research that we've been doing on calves, on calf recruitment, and predators have taken a large proportion of calves so that right now the reason the herd isn't rebuilding is because of lack of recruitment of calves due to predation. That's what in the last couple of years have showed us. What actually caused the crash in '85, '87, you know, we can only guess at this point, but there was severe winter weather in '85.

31

32 MR. STARR: Can I make a comment, too?

33

34 MR. ROUTE: Yeah, you bet.

35

36 MR. STARR: I see this herd goes into Canada. How are they managed over there? Do you know how they're managed over there on the Canada side?

39

40 MR. ROUTE: That's a good question. We've asked the Canadians to be a part of this planning process and they've been real cooperative. But they would like to see one great management plan for all of the herds that cross the Canadian-U.S. boundary. So, at this time, they aren't going to sign off on this plan until they've had time to look at all of the various plans. But, on the other hand, they've been real good in dealing with us in trying to limit that harvest that they have over there so that they don't harvest too many Montana animals. And maybe I didn't point out well enough in

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

that map where it showed they range over into Canada. Along with that, when they are wintering over there, the Nelchina Herd, of course, is part of the entire mixed herd and since this herd is only around 700 animals and the Nelchina Herd numbers now 45,000, there's a lot of Nelchina animals that are hanging there and relatively few Mentastas. So, when there is a harvest in the wintertime, what we're hoping to do is to make sure that there's very few Mentasta animals that get harvested in the winter. That's what we're trying to minimize. And, in fact, there probably is few that get harvested in most cases.

11

12 Now, that harvest, as we calculated in No. 1 here, would be a harvest of either sex if the population is above 24000 caribou, but it would be bulls-only if it's less than 25000 caribou. And in that case, the harvest would be closed if there's fewer than 35 bulls per 100 cows. That's how we propose running an annual quota and this is laid down in black and white so that at any time any of the Council members or anyone else from the public can call ourselves or Fish and Game and find out what the fall calf recruitment is, what the population level is, calculate out what the quota should be and what, in fact, should be the quota for that coming fall. Of course, you must understand that this a proposal that we would put in front of the Federal Subsistence Board and only they can make final determination of an annual quota. So this management plan, is our -- our agency is trying to come to terms with what we want to propose in front of the Federal Subsistence Board and the State Board of Game, and it's up to them to make the final decision.

30

31 Just a little simpler way to show that whole decision flow there, step No. 1 is to determine whether or not the two-year mean calf recruitment is greater than 80 calves. If "no," no harvest. If "yes," then you have to find out whether the most recent spring population estimate is greater than 2,000. If "yes," it's an either sex harvest. If "no," then, is the past two-year mean bull:cow ratio greater than 35 per 100? If "no," no harvest; if "yes," bulls only harvest. And this should end up in a harvest that's similar to the past harvest levels. And I'll show that to you right here to illustrate that. This graph shows historical harvest. The black line with the solid dots is the past harvest from 1981 through 1994. The two dotted lines are -- this is 15% of calf recruitment as suggested in this management plan. So, we've gone back and said what if we had used this plan then, what would the harvest have been? And this is 20%. So at that time we would have been trying to have harvest somewhere within these two lines. As you can see, it's quite similar to what the historical harvest was and, in fact, in recent years we would have allowed

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

a higher harvest. And when it closed down in 1992, we would have allowed a harvest to continue to occur. So, that's an important point. Under this management strategy, we would have allowed a harvest to continue to occur in '92, whereas it was closed off. Any questions about that?

6

7           So, I guess the main point there is that we attempted  
8 to have a harvest that has been very similar to what the past  
9 harvest is and, hopefully, our harvest strategy would mimic  
10 that type of a harvest. Well, now that we've calculated what  
11 the annual quota would be, now it's a matter of allocating that  
12 quota amongst the users. And this is where you folks come in a  
13 lot more and can let us know if this is desirable. In the  
14 fall -- I don't know if we should get into this. Do you guys  
15 want to know how the allocation is in the fall? It doesn't  
16 really relate to your winter use as much. Lee, do you want me  
17 to cover through this or we can....

18

19           MR. LEE TITUS: Go ahead, yeah. Yeah.

20

21           MR. ROUTE: I'll be real brief. Basically, the fall  
22 allocation would be that if there's greater than 70 caribou  
23 allowed to be harvested in the fall, it could be both State-  
24 authorized hunting and Federal subsistence hunting in fall in  
25 GMU 11. If it's 70 or less, then it would be only Federally  
26 eligible subsistence users, and if it's 30 or fewer, then even  
27 amongst those Federally eligible subsistence users as stated in  
28 ANILCA, there would be a priority based upon customary and  
29 direct dependence, local residency, and availability of  
30 alternative resources. So it's kind of a, you know, down-the-  
31 line, you know, getting more and more restricted to those users  
32 who have customary use of the herd. So, that's how the  
33 allocation process would work in the fall in GMU 11.

34

35           Is that clear? Any questions on that? Okay. So, the  
36 winter. As I've said, the winter hunt is, of course, the mixed  
37 herd because the Nelchina Herd comes over and the Mentasta and  
38 the Nelchina Herd mixes. So, those winter hunts are primarily  
39 targeted for the Nelchina Herd. We would like to see those  
40 winter hunts continue to occur as long as the cumulative  
41 incidental harvest of Mentasta Caribou is minimized. So, this  
42 small herd that's declined to a very low level, we would like  
43 to see that incidental harvest is minimized so that the fall  
44 users, the fall subsistence users can have another fall season,  
45 open their season, without a lot of incidental harvest in the  
46 winter. That's the primary concern here. And, for example,  
47 the Southcentral Regional Council is very concerned about this  
48 winter incidental harvest that's occurring up here. I just got  
49 word that they did endorse this plan just recently, just

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

yesterday I guess, but they are very concerned about this winter incidental harvest. So they're going to be watching it quite intensely.

4

5           So, what we want to do is minimize the cumulative incidental harvest of Mentasta Caribou. What we propose doing is that, as managers - Fish and Game in Tok, Tetlin National Wildlife Refuge, and ourselves - would get together every year and discuss the problem of the two herds mixing over here, what the ratio of that mix is, whether there's lots of Nelchina animals compared to very few Mentastas, where exactly the Mentasta animals are in relation to large areas of harvest; and that we would be asking Craig from Fish and Game and Tetlin Refuge in their harvest to open the harvest such that it would minimize the amount of incidental harvest on the Mentastas. And I think there's a real good atmosphere of cooperation in doing that right now and, basically, what we're saying here is we're going to continue that level of cooperation in trying to reduce the incidental harvest of Mentasta animals without stopping the winter harvest on the Nelchina Herd.

21

22           I guess that's really it and what's before you folks is the plan. I sent it out to you; hopefully, you've had a chance to read it. I'm here to answer any other questions. Craig Gardner can answer questions. Sue Matthews I know is here. And what we would like is for your endorsement, so we would like you to be able to either sign off it as an endorsement or not.

29

30           MR. ROACH: Mr. Chairman?

31

32           MR. LEE TITUS: Yes, Jeff, go ahead.

33

34           MR. ROACH: I would like to make a motion that we, the Council, endorses the Mentasta Caribou Herd Management Plan as presented.

37

38           MR. MILLER: I second that motion.

39

40           MR. ROACH: Can we -- is it okay for us go to go ahead and open the floor for discussion? The motion has been made and seconded.

43

44           MR. LEE TITUS: Okay. What was the motion?

45

46           MR. ROACH: The motion is to endorse the Mentasta Caribou Herd Management Plan as presented.

48

49           MR. LEE TITUS: Okay. It's been seconded?

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515



1  
2 MR. ROACH: Yes. Mr. Miller seconded it.  
3

4 MR. LEE TITUS: Okay. Discussion. Under this summer  
and winter range plan, the maps -- I think about the last  
seven, eight years was the only time that both the Mentasta and  
the Nelchina Herd came into this area, this region. And in  
talking with the people that live around here, that first year  
it was pretty happy for the Elders to see the caribou coming  
back. And I just think using that, I think there's going to be  
time in the future where these summer and winter ranges are  
going to kind of like switch around. I don't know where they  
wintered when they weren't here for the last 40 years in the  
wintertime. I don't know where they wintered and I don't know  
what's going to happen to us in this area if, for some reason  
or another, they don't come around again for another 40 years.  
And I don't know why I'm talking about it, but I just brought  
that up just for the record.

19  
20 MR. ROACH: Mr. Chair, I believe that this plan is an  
extremely good idea when we can get the different Federal  
agencies and the State together to come up with an idea that  
seems to meet the needs of subsistence users and also provide  
an opportunity if the harvest is large enough for other users  
to use the resource. The annual meetings, I'd like to stress  
that those are probably one of the key factors to this plan  
continuing to work, is these agencies getting back together  
annually to discuss the problems of the mixing of the herds.  
And I think with it in the plan, if there's a commitment by the  
agencies, then we'll see a much better-managed herd and we'll  
see a little more future planning, looking ahead and that will  
help the management of this herd, I think.

33  
34 MR. MAYO: Mr. Chairman?

35  
36 MR. LEE TITUS: Yeah.

37  
38 MR. MAYO: Under discussion I guess, you know, me not  
being from this area and, you know, I don't know how this plan  
came about, you know, so I don't feel comfortable endorsing  
anything unless -- you know, did this plan come from the local  
villages or from what, you know? You know, I just want to  
acknowledge the local villages here and get direction from them  
instead of, it seems like, the agency.

45  
46 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Mr. Chairman?

47  
48 MR. LEE TITUS: Charlie.

49  
50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

1 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: I think I feel the same way.  
2 was just going to ask that question to....

3  
4 MR. ROUTE: Thanks. Yeah, I hear your concern. It did  
5 come about -- the agencies got together, basically, and have  
6 talked this back and forth for quite some time and what we're  
7 doing is we have developed the plan and we're presenting it now  
8 for, you know, for the councils and the local advisory  
9 committees. There's six different public advisory committees  
10 for the whole area in which this herd roams. So, what we're  
11 doing is presenting it now to each of those six advisory  
12 councils and committees and asking for your involvement and for  
13 your endorsement. And you have the opportunity to not endorse  
14 it, in which case a non-endorsement would go before the Federal  
15 Board or the State Board of Game when we propose a season and  
16 bag limit that would be following this plan. So, the fact that  
17 you chose not to endorse it and had reasons to not endorse  
18 and that was then presented to the Federal Subsistence  
19 Board, then, they could make a decision based on those who did  
20 endorse it and those who did not.

21  
22 MR. LEE TITUS: What's your definition of incidental  
23 catch?

24  
25 MR. ROUTE: Well, it becomes incidental when the  
26 primary herd that is being targeted in the wintertime is the  
27 Nelchina Herd. You have -- you know, it varies from year to  
28 year, but in the tune of, you know, ten, twenty thousand  
29 Nelchina animals which come over here to winter and relatively  
30 few Mentasta animals. So, you're primarily trying to hold the  
31 harvest on the Nelchina Herd. So, the fact that Mentasta  
32 animals get harvested is considered incidental.

33  
34 MR. LEE TITUS: Okay.

35  
36 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Mr. Chairman, another  
37 question. Where did you get the three -- on harvesting, the 30  
38 less calves? Was that a survey or....

39  
40 MR. ROUTE: In terms of the fall allocation?

41  
42 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Who gets -- right.  
43 Allocation. Who gets the 30 in times of hardship?

44  
45 MR. ROUTE: Um-hum. That 30 -- that decision can only  
46 be made by the Federal Subsistence Board. So, what we've  
47 suggested is that at levels below 30, when there are fewer than  
48 30 caribou that can be harvested, that at that time the Federal  
49 Board must make a decision based on customary and traditional  
50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

use and those three parameters. So, we've basically said that using historical past harvest, 30 seems to be a good cut-off; that at that point, in the past, when a Tier II or a Federal Subsistence hunt had been held and any Federally eligible Subsistence hunter could hunt, they took like 23, 29, 30, that many caribou were being harvested. So, we felt that that seemed like an appropriate cut-off. And below that point, they then amongst themselves need to be limited even more so.

9  
10 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: This is taking into  
consideration geography and everything, right?

12  
13 MR. ROUTE: Yeah.

14  
15 MR. STARR: Mr. Chairman?

16  
17 MR. LEE TITUS: Yes?

18  
19 MR. STARR: I see where they cross the highways or they  
cross the highways in different locations and -- or they just  
cross in the same places?

22  
23 MR. ROUTE: It seems to vary. I mean, the Nelchina  
Herd, of course, coming across, crosses at about the same  
places each year. Maybe Craig can answer more to that. But  
from when I've been watching the Mentasta Herd, sometimes  
they'll travel up the Nebesna -- or I should say down the  
Nebesna River across here to the Flats or right over the  
mountain ranges. In some years, they'll go up Suslota Pass  
that way. It seems like most times in the fall, they'll go  
through -- funnel through the Nebesna and then come back some  
years through the Suslota Pass.

33  
34 MR. STARR: And do you have the State and Federal  
agencies watching that, where they cross down there on the  
highways?

37  
38 MR. ROUTE: Yeah, I think Craig watches it pretty  
closely so that he knows when to open a hunt. Yeah.

40  
41 MR. STARR: Um-hum.

42  
43 MR. ROUTE: What he tries to do because of the problem  
of the Mentastas mixing in with this herd is to see when the  
Nelchina animals come across prior to the Mentastas coming in  
and mixing with them and try to hold a hunt before the Mentasta  
animals get involved so that the majority of the hunt is on the  
Nelchina animals.

49  
50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

1 MR. STARR: Well, why I was bringing this up is in  
 2 Tanana there's a herd of caribou up on the Ray Mountains and  
 3 they come down towards Tanana. When they get about 24 miles,  
 4 that's the old mail trail there and as soon as they come down  
 5 this way, some boys go up there with snow-go's and they just  
 6 chase them right back and that's the end of that herd. You  
 7 don't see them around there anymore, just -- they chase the  
 8 leaders back and then -- I was just wondering how come they  
 9 don't -- when he said they never come down in this area, I was  
 10 wondering if that was their problem there, too?

11  
 12 MR. ROUTE: No, I don't think so because, in fact, for  
 13 example this year now, they have come all the way across and  
 14 they have entered into Canada. They're in Canada right now,  
 15 and so it doesn't seem as if, though, there's any level of, you  
 16 know, highways or snow machine use that has inhibited them from  
 17 traveling on. Not that I know of. Craig or Sue, either of you  
 18 feel any different?

19  
 20 MR. GARDNER: (Shakes head "no.")

21  
 22 MR. ROUTE: So, I don't think there's been any  
 23 alteration of their movement patterns from that.

24  
 25 MR. LEE TITUS: I speak in favor of the motion. I  
 26 think it's a pretty good plan. But just for your information,  
 27 it's really -- in the fall time after moose season is over with  
 28 and usually the last part of October or the first part of  
 29 December is when the caribou come over into our area and that's  
 30 when I start getting calls almost every day from the local  
 31 people asking when are they supposed to open the caribou  
 32 season. And it's really difficult for me to explain to our  
 33 Elders the plan, the ratio of the Mentasta and Nelchina Herd. I  
 34 think something should be written to that effect for the  
 35 general public. I mean like I was saying earlier that some of  
 36 the local Elders get frustrated when they can't hunt caribou  
 37 just because that majority of the caribou are Mentasta and  
 38 there's not enough Nelchina. It's kind of difficult to explain  
 39 to them that, and I think C&T is more -- that's where C&T comes  
 40 into effect at that time. But just for the record, it's really  
 41 hard to explain why the hunt is not allowed.

42  
 43 MR. ROUTE: And I understand that concern and, believe  
 44 me, we are trying to take that to heart as much as possible.  
 45 But the other thing you need to, you know, be very aware of as  
 46 mentioned before, your counterparts in the Southcentral  
 47 Interior Regional Council are very concerned about that  
 48 accidental harvest because if there was a lot of Mentasta  
 49 animals harvested in the winter up here, it really means that  
 50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
 277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
 272-7515

they get fewer in the fall for their subsistence hunt. So, you know, it's complex. Maybe just because we know where these Mentasta animals roam now, it makes it more complex, but the fact is we do know and it does relate to their ability to harvest the animals.

6

MR. MATHEWS: Mr. Chairman, before you vote, you may want to reiterate that if anybody in the public wants to share comments or concerns, that your policy and the policy of this Council is that they can be recognized and come forward. There may be someone that wasn't here last night.

12

MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Mr. Chairman?

14

MR. LEE TITUS: Charlie.

16

MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: I think you struck a little nerve in some of the -- well, maybe me since I'm not from this area and knowing the local needs, the customary and additional, where do you draw the line? I mean, what the -- the brought up a good point. How do you tell these people they can't hunt? Well, when do you tell the -- when they see their additional dinner walking by their yard? I have a hard time seeing through that, but it is a good plan seeing how popular the caribou resources are and they're close, they're accessible off road. The Fairbanks people, the Anchorage people, the whole state goes after this caribou. And I'm really thinking the people that really need it, when do they -- like the season is already over for moose and when is their traditional hunts for these resources? That's my concern. I know if I was from this area, I'd probably feel the same way. When do I get....

32

MR. ROUTE: And that is the deliberation that the Southcentral Council has, you know, been on in terms of their fall seasons and that's why the majority of the allocation is provided for Federal subsistence eligibles. For example, anything under 70 would be for Federal subsistence users only in the fall and it's going to be probably rare that the quota would be above 70. So what it does is it provides most of the available quota for Federal subsistence users in the fall.

41

MR. LEE TITUS: Was this management plan presented to the Southcentral Regional Council?

44

MR. ROUTE: Yes. Southcentral voted on it yesterday and they passed it.

47

MR. LEE TITUS: They passed it. Okay. Do we have any comments from the public about discussion on the Mentasta

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

Caribou Herd? If not, I guess we can go into the votes. All  
 in favor of adopting the Mentasta Caribou Herd Management Plan,  
 say aye.

4  
 5 ALL MEMBERS: Aye

6  
 7 MR. LEE TITUS: Opposed? (Pause) Motion carried.  
 Thank you.

9  
 10 MR. ROUTE: Thank you.

11  
 12 MR. LEE TITUS: Fortymile Caribou Herd. Craig, you're  
 in the hot seat.

14  
 15 MR. GARDNER: Thanks, Mr. Chair, Lee. When I got up  
 this morning, I kind of was going through this magazine and one  
 of the first things I saw was this picture. I mean it's of a  
 person down, you know, in the Southwest. But, you know, the  
 caption says, "Once he supported entire civilizations." Well,  
 the Fortymile Herd could have easily been on this picture. I  
 mean, that Fortymile Herd supported, you know, people from, you  
 know, Yukon all the way over to, you know, north of Fairbanks,  
 you know, back in the early 1900s. It's a herd that's been  
 abused, ignored, and that's why today it no longer does support  
 thousands of people nor the ecosystem it lives in. It's a herd  
 that needs a lot more attention by people. So, I kind of  
 thought that one of these days, I'd like to see a Fortymile  
 Caribou Herd on that picture.

29  
 30 But anyway since I talked to you last, the Fortymile  
 planning team has had three meetings. We've been finding out  
 in our discussions that we've taken on a topic that's a lot  
 more complicated than many of us originally thought. We found  
 out that the wheels of bureaucracy and philosophies turn pretty  
 slow. And so we haven't moved very far. But one of the major  
 decisions we've come up with is that we couldn't really come up  
 with a large harvest plan before we came up with actually a  
 whole management plan because we felt that, you know, harvest  
 doesn't drive the herd; the herd, you know, depending on what  
 size it is, will actually drive harvest. And so what the team  
 decided to do is just come up with an interim harvest plan.  
 And so this will just cover like the '95, '95 season, you know,  
 next year and, if necessary, maybe the next year, but really no  
 more. It's just strictly a short-term harvest plan.

45  
 46 So, the first thing that the team kind of decided to do  
 is to kind of follow the -- kind of the harvest regime that's  
 been kind of, you know, been done the last actually ten years.  
 And so what the team decided to do is that they didn't want to

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
 277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
 272-7515

see harvest at any time, limit the herd's ability to grow, or affect the kind of the composition. And so what we kind of looked at was different harvest rates that we could actually harvest the herd under and not affect growth. So, what I just did is I just kind of started where the herd is today and kind of just looked at what's kind of going on, you know, with the calf production and if, you know, weather doesn't change and, you know, affect them negatively. Under different harvest rates, and in these low harvest rates, the herd can grow under them. And so like the top one is "no harvest" and these two here are like two percent and three percent, you know, harvest rates. And what we've been following the last five years is the two percent harvest rate.

14

15 Well, we found that you can actually harvest that herd, you know, at three percent and it can still grow. I mean if weather conditions, environmentally, you know, are favorable for caribou at three percent that caribou herd will still grow. If weather change is poor, you know, the herd will decline, but won't decline because of harvest. This decline is strictly because of just natural predators, snow depth, you know, what have you. So you could actually have a harvest than what we've been offering over the last years. But what happens if you increase that harvest to three percent, this is actually -- what I'm looking at here is bull:cow ratio, because what we also didn't want to do is kind of like, I said, change the herd composition in this beginning. And, again, this top line is "no harvest" and the two middle lines are two and three percent. And you can see the two percent harvest rate, it just -- that bull:cow ratio won't change; it'll stay pretty much status quo. It's a small enough harvest on bulls that, you know, it just won't change. And three percent will actually start causing decline and a five percent will actually drive it pretty fast.

35

36 And so the team pretty much decided to stay with the most conservative: a two percent harvest rate. And, you know, for like next year that means for this population, it will be like 450 bulls. Then we got into the more complicated stuff. The Fortymile Herd being -- is this intense competition for it. You know, I mean people in this area know it probably better than about anybody, but, you know, as Bill was up here before, the Mentasta Herd is closed, the Nelchina Herd is closed unless you have, you know, a State Tier II permit. The McComb Herd is closed, the Denali Herd is closed, the Delta Herd is closed. You know, unless you have a lot of time to drive up to the Dalton Highway, really the only caribou herd you can hunt on the road system pretty much from Fairbanks down to Homer to Juneau is the Fortymile Herd. So the competition

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

for these animals is really quite intense.

2

3           So that allocation issue, you know, the recommended  
Allocation was kind of a difficult one for us and I -- this is  
Embarrassing to me. I think like Lee said like at the last  
meeting, what is customary and traditional? What is the  
traditional use of the herd? And we're trying to put it in  
such easy formulas, you know, something that shouldn't even  
have a formula put on it, but I have one. But, basically, what  
we're looking for to start for the -- let's say the Federal  
allocation is like these things. These are poor. A bunch  
of -- a sea of numbers and it doesn't mean nothing. But  
there's three things that I was looking at, was the number of  
State permits issued to locals and I just put locals here; it's  
just Federal subsistence users. And so I looked at the percent  
of how many, you know, of the permits went to locals. You  
know, it kind of ranged from 23 percent up to 47, this one here  
in '89, but that was a little bit of an anomaly. But up to 36.  
In 1989, what happened is that we opened a season. That's  
when the State was still not out of compliance, and we opened a  
season strictly for locals on the Taylor Highway and it was an  
October season. And so those permits went 100% to locals;  
that's why it was so much higher then.

24

25           And then the next thing I looked at was just this total  
harvest of locals and it came up that during these last six  
years, it's averaged 121, you know, by Federal subsistence  
users. But then the next thing we look at is how many are  
harvested on Federal land, and only like six percent were  
harvested on Federal land. And then under Federal permit, you  
know, much less. And so what we did is we came up with an  
allocation for Federal subsistence users of 150, you know, a  
little higher than what's actually being taken. But it almost  
has to be put, you know, over all the range that the Fortymile  
herd ranges because only 25 of these things are being shot on  
Federal lands. And the main problem is, is that the Federal  
lands, as you've heard before on the Fortymile range, is  
somewhat difficult to access for most people and the other  
thing is the herd doesn't use it very much anymore. Ten years  
ago, they used to cross in big numbers in Jack Wade which is  
actually a portion of Federal land. You know, they just don't  
do that anymore. You know, they've been using more areas that  
are either privately owned or State owned. And so the team, we  
recommend an allocation of 150, but we don't expect those 150  
to be taken strictly on Federal lands. They can be taken  
anywhere where the caribou are, as long as both seasons are  
open, which gets even more complicated.

48

49           And so what we did -- that was, you know, the Federal  
50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515



allocation and then so we recommended a minimum of 150 for that and then we kind of defined for each -- unfortunately, this herd just doesn't stay in one area of the State; it moves all over. And so we just put, you know, what's today's definition of, you know, who the Federal users are, you know, for these different units. And then we recommended the same seasons, dates, bag limits for all these different areas, but what we also had to do was, you know, the State -- we had to meet the State mandates and we also -- there's a small Yukon harvest and to meet the State mandates, we had to throw in a non-resident season which actually is in two real inaccessible areas that have very little subsistence harvest. And we gave them a maximum of 50, but I can show you that doesn't mean much.

14

15 This is something that Jeff asked me to do. I hope this kind of comes up close to what you wanted. This is kind of a scenario of what all this means, like if next year if the quota is around 450 bulls, there's like four things that can happen. Like this group of non-Federal users, non-residents, people that live outside, you know, the Tok-Northway-Tetlin area, you know, maybe Fairbanks, Anchorage, urban type hunters, and Southeast, if they take less than like 280 and the Federal users with less than 150, you know, all lands and seasons will stay open to term and, you know, that makes it easy because nobody has to worry about boundaries. You know, you can hunt where the caribou are. The next scenario is if these non-Federal users shoot more than 280 and the Federal users are still less than 150, I'll close the State hunt. You know, that means the only ones that can still hunt is the Federal subsistence users. But, unfortunately, then, they're kind of -- they're now restricted just to Federal hunts. And the next one is just if the Federal users kill less than this 280 -- now, this is the good side. The Federal users can shoot a lot more than 150. You know, that's not a maximum number; it's a minimum number. And if they shot more than 150 but the total quota still hasn't been met, we'll just leave the season open on all lands and so everybody can hunt again where the caribou are. And then that last one is that worst scenario; that if the herd is shot up, everything gets closed as long as the Federal users kill at least a minimum of 150 caribou. So, actually, this is better than what it used to be.

42

43 The way we propose to administer, the team did -- right now, it's, essentially, you need to get a Federal permit to hunt on Federal lands, a State permit to hunt really on all lands if the State season is open. What we're recommending to do is just have one permit and actually there will be a box on it; you just check if you're a Federal user. The good side of this is that, one, the Federal user only has to go get one

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

permit; he doesn't have to get two. Two, for hunt administration of monitoring, I have a much better kind of way to get everybody tracked. I mean, I'll know how many non-subsistence users are hunting, I'll know how many subsistence users are hunting, and I'll know the total kill on a weekly basis. And so I can keep a much closer tie on the harvest during the year. And the best side of it is on some of this, this 150 quota is across all the herd's range. So that to the hunter, boundaries become transparent again. You know, they don't have to worry about carrying their map on State lands and Federal lands and all that. It's just they can pretty much hunt anywhere as long as that State season is open under one permit.

14

15 And the last thing we were recommending on harvest management is this comes from a lot of complaints from the locals and from actually a protection officer that most abuse, you know, shooting of cows or wanton waste of meat is coming from people that don't have a lot of tie with the herd. You know, they're just here to shoot. They're not real subsistence -- let's say subsistence type hunters. And it turns out that most of those people have only been in the state for not a very long time. And so this is just a commendation, not a requirement, but, you know, for the state, for me to actually offer a class, basically a caribou identification class. It would go -- it'd basically go through different pictures of caribou, you know, groups in the summertime, the fall time, and start seeing if these people can tell bulls from cows. You know, we're making these hunters make....

31

(Audience laughter)

33

34 Yeah, it sounds kind of funny, but they can't do 'er. But we're making these hunters go out and shoot bulls, but we've never really found out if they can tell them. And, you know, so that seems kind of a -- you know, that's a responsibility to, you know, before I send them out that I know what they know. And, also, on that, we'll actually go through and show them how to clean one. So many of these guys, you know, they go out there and, I swear, they won't gut it, you know, they'll throw it on their four-wheeler or throw it on their car and travel with. Or they will gut it, at least, but they won't skin it and then it'll get packed with mud and dirt. I mean, they don't really know how to travel with meat. And I'll actually have a section on how to treat the meat, you know, in this kind of a class. And the last one was just to have a portion of just almost -- it's not PR for the Fortymile, but to kind of take it back to that card, is to have a section

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

in there to say why the Fortymile Herd is so important to the land, to the people, and what we've done to it, you know, has just been -- you know, it's been horrible, you know, to the herd. And it's time that we basically apologize to the herd and to the land and start doing something good for it.

6  
7 But, like I said, the plan is only, you know, for a year or two. It's just a harvest plan. And, again, we're hoping the Council will go ahead and look at recommendations which will somewhat go against the proposal you'll be dealing with the on the Fortymile Herd later on. Questions?

12  
13 MR. ROACH: Mr. Chair?

14  
15 MR. LEE TITUS: Yes, Jeff?

16  
17 MR. ROACH: We have representatives of the other Federal agencies that are on the working team: Conrad Guenther, Jan is here from Yukon-Charlie. He wasn't on the committee, but maybe he has some input. And a representative from BLM is also here, so....

22  
23 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Mr. Chairman?

24  
25 MR. LEE TITUS: Yes, Charlie?

26  
27 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Can I ask a question? You said you have a class? Is this for non-resident hunters?

29  
30 MR. GARDNER: Oh, that's a good question. Now, I was going to have it for non-residents for sure, but residents of three years and less. You know, just -- you know, for everybody, just for people new to caribou hunting, new to the state.

35  
36 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: I think that's an excellent idea because we're not having that problem only with the caribou; it's a problem with the rest of the resources within the State of Alaska. We've always had that problem for years and years. We're aware of that and I think if the outside people from the Lower 48 was to understand that before they even apply for a license to hunt, for a permit, they should go through a class and tell them which type animals to take and what the laws are in our state. And, you know, there's no -- we're not going to look at wanton waste of our resources. That should have been done long ago. I've never seen it done within the State. I don't think the State offers that class of any kind, to give them to anybody.

49  
50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

1 MR. ROACH: Mr. Chairman?

2

3 MR. LEE TITUS: Yes, Jeff?

4

5 MR. ROACH: I would like to make a motion that we  
6 approve the Interim Fortymile Caribou Herd Harvest Plan and  
7 Formula and that it be only for one year and with a  
8 recommendation that the working team continues the planning  
9 process.

10

11 MR. LEE TITUS: Motion on the floor.

12

13 MR. MILLER: I second the motion.

14

15 MR. LEE TITUS: It's been moved and seconded.  
16 Discussion. Under discussion, there was a question I had, but  
17 lost it. Anybody has any more discussion?

18

19 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: I have one more question now.  
20 How much does predator control -- what's the percentage that  
21 predators take of these animals? For instance, is there any  
22 wolf herds -- wolf packs or -- that prey on these herds?

23

24 MR. GARDNER: That's a good question. We've been  
25 actually looking at, you know, kind of limiting factors of the  
26 Fortymile Herd over the last four years and what we've been  
27 finding that, yeah, that definitely wolves and bears are  
28 taking, you know, a large number of the calves and then wolves  
29 continue through the year. The wolf population itself in  
30 (E), if you compare it to other areas of the state, is not  
31 large, but what it is, it is -- you know, if you look at the  
32 ungulate, you know, moose and caribou numbers to the number of  
33 predators, it's still one of the major limiting factors on that  
34 herd right now. The last four years, also, you know, maybe in  
35 other parts of the Interior, too, the weather has been just  
36 horrible for ungulates. You know, so, weather conditions, too,  
37 has been slowing down any kind of chance for this herd to grow.  
38 But like we started last year on a calf mortality study and  
39 wolves and bears are killing 40% of the calf crop as of today,  
40 right now.

41

42 MR. STARR: Mr. Chairman?

43

44 MR. LEE TITUS: Yeah.

45

46 MR. STARR: I've been down the years, I've been through  
47 quite a few meetings with the State, too, and ten years ago  
48 they said the population of wolves is between seven and eight  
49 thousand, and it's still between seven and eight thousand. The

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

Wolf population is. I mean, you know, the numbers in wolves.

2

3 MR. GARDNER: Oh, for the state?

4

5 MR. STARR: Yeah.

6

7 MR. GARDNER: Yeah, it's between -- I think that is the  
estimate, yeah, around seven to ten thousand, around there.  
And then this area....

10

11 MR. STARR: Yeah, but there's been seven to eight  
thousand for the last ten years.

13

14 MR. GARDNER: Yeah, and in this area it's just  
fluctuated a bit. Probably -- I looked at just the wolf  
numbers in the Fortymile Range and it's, oh, heck, what is it?  
You know, it's probably around 300 wolves and, you know, 300  
to 350 wolves in the Fortymile Range.

19

20 MR. ROACH: Mr. Chairman?

21

22 MR. LEE TITUS: Did you guys have comments or....

23

24 MS. RUTH GRONQUIST: I'm a member of the team -- let me  
introduce myself first. I'm Ruth Gronquist with the Bureau of  
Land Management, Steese-White Mountains District, and I'm a  
member of this team. I didn't get to attend the last meeting  
you folks had. Craig, did you outline for them the composition  
of the team?

30

31 MR. GARDNER: Yeah, in the first one.

32

33 MS. GRONQUIST: Okay. BLM, as you may know, is a  
habitat management agency. We are the managers of the  
Fortymile River Corridor and also the Steese National  
Conservation area which the Fortymile Herd uses. And BLM was  
part of crafting this harvest strategy plan.

38

39 MR. ROACH: Mr. Chairman?

40

41 MR. LEE TITUS: Jeff.

42

43 MR. ROACH: Yeah, I just kind of wanted to bring the  
Council up to date on the workings of the team. We have worked  
to get a larger, a little bit larger team together by bringing  
some other interests in and we've attempted to bring together a  
large variety of people to work on this team. We've addressed  
several issues. We've gotten commitments from the agencies to  
both allow people to work on the team and to provide funding

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

for continued team meetings. And I think that cooperative management plans, like I said earlier, are a very good idea. And when you can bring people together to come up with a plan that the agencies agree with and that when you take them out to the public, if the public agrees with those plans, then, I think that's the best way to manage our resources, is to get everybody into the planning process or, you know, get as many people as possible into the planning process and hear those comments.

10

11           The plan is going on, it's not completed yet; that's why we have an interim harvest plan and formula for this year, and we hope to continue to work on the overall management plan. It's a difficult issue because there are so many agencies involved, so many user types involved, and the Canadian government is also involved. And it's not a real easy issue to deal with and we're trying to get as much public input as possible. So, I think that the interim harvest plan meets the needs of these people based on these charts. And I know the charts are really difficult to understand and that's why I asked Craig to draw up those different scenarios. And if the Council needs to look at those again, we can maybe go through those again. But the numbers did not just come from one person; they came from a subcommittee and then they were approved and comments were made by all of the members of the working team. So, I think it's the best thing that we could come up with now in the interim until we have a complete harvest management plan or a complete -- excuse me, complete management plan in place.

30

31           MR. LEE TITUS: Is there anybody from the public like to make any comments or anything? Ask questions or say anything? Just come up to the mike. Let me -- raise your hand to get my attention.

35

36           MR. MATHEWS: Mr. Chairman, we can also set up another table if you want to make this into more of a dialogue. That's up to you. I think the public understands that the Council is open for dialogue. It's not just commenting. And I'll apologize for the mikes, but that allows us to capture it, so please don't let the mikes deter discussion. They're here just to capture. Thank you.

43

44           MR. LEE TITUS: Belinda?

45

46           MS. BELINDA THOMAS: I just wanted to talk....

47

48           MR. LEE TITUS: Belinda, state your name and....

49

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

ANCHORAGE, ALASKA 99501

1 MS. THOMAS: Oh. Belinda Thomas and I'm representing  
 Northway Village. We have a request because we have about ten  
 of our Native people that are here and these discussions are  
 covering a variety of villages. Ideally, we should be packing  
 this whole place with the Natives that will be affected. I  
 guess we have a request of Lee, and that is he serves on your  
 board but he also has a responsibility to our village. And all  
 of you talking about herds, and many of the people are sitting  
 back here and unless they read those books which myself and Lee  
 have read so we kind of can keep up to what you're saying, but  
 some of it is foreign to the other people that are sitting way  
 in the back. So, we're requesting -- it doesn't matter to me  
 how long these meetings take and it's a different request, but  
 I'm requesting that Lee not only serve as your Chair, but he  
 also takes time to come back and address it so that everyone,  
 especially the Natives that are going to be affected by it, put  
 them back into simple words. What does it mean? What do all  
 these studies mean? What do all those numbers mean? What does  
 Nulch- -- you know, we're talking about herds. All we know is  
 the Feds and the State come and give us permits, tell us when  
 to hunt and we have to abide by it. And I'm growing up and,  
 from a young point of view, I've seen the Elders suffer way too  
 much. They used to hunt when they wanted to. And now  
 regulation after regulation is telling us when to hunt and what  
 we can hunt and then they're using books to communicate with  
 us. And only a few of us are reading those books. And we know  
 that it is the responsibility, especially when decisions are  
 being made about the hunting rights of Native people, that we  
 understand exactly what's going on.

30

31 So, I put a request in to the board, to this committee,  
 that Lee not only chair the meeting, but he also take time or  
 in some way try to break those words down better to us. What  
 does it mean to Northway? Does it mean we're not going to be  
 able to hunt in this area and, if it is, tell us the area  
 exactly. I definitely appreciate all the studies and all the  
 hard work that's gone through it, but, you know, continue the  
 meeting, but keep in mind we've got ten Native people back  
 here and we would like to hear more from Lee as far as exactly  
 what's being said and what it means to us. Thank you.

41

42 MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you, Belinda. Did you have a  
 comment, Charlie?

44

45 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Mr. Chairman, I agree with the  
 body. It's been bothering me since I got here. I just wanted  
 to ask a question maybe of the Department of Fish and Game.  
 Did you have any local input or is this the input now on the  
 regulations, the plan, the Fortymile draft plan?

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
 277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
 272-7515

1  
2 MR. GARDNER: I'm sorry? You're asking if there was  
3 rural input?

4  
5 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Yes. Is there a report from  
6 Eagle? The subsistence users themselves? For instance, I see  
7 this -- maybe we should go back to what the Canadians are doing  
8 with this hunt management on the Yukon. It says Native people  
9 on the Yukon have the right to hunt any species of wildlife for  
10 food in any number, in any season on Crown Land. Maybe we  
11 should build on Crown Land because it does deal with the Native  
12 people who -- it's their traditional food.

13  
14 MR. GARDNER: Let me add one thing to it. That was a  
15 good question and that's why like in the team composition,  
16 we've really tried, like Isaac Juneby, you know, from Eagle is  
17 on this committee. A Dawson First Nation representative, you  
18 know, is on. Kenny Thomas from Tanacross, Chuck Miller, Dot  
19 Lake. You know, we really have tried to get, you know, a lot  
20 of the villages' comments through these people. And this  
21 harvest plan was sent -- I know it -- well, through the Dawson  
22 First Nation, they've seen it and they've commented on it, and  
23 the comments have been incorporated, as has Eagle. So there  
24 has been some, but, you know, we're still beating the streets.

25  
26 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: My point of view; nobody  
27 else's.

28  
29 MR. LEE TITUS: Frank?

30  
31 MR. FRANK ENTSMINGER: Good morning, Mr. Chair, members  
32 of the Council. My name is Frank Entsminger. I'm chairman of  
33 the Upper Tanana Fish and Game Advisory Committee. And I know  
34 of the concerns that our committee, our committee which  
35 represents the five communities, Upper Tanana communities, most  
36 of the people felt that the local users weren't getting a fair  
37 share of the harvest in the Fortymile animals. And they  
38 basically put in a recommendation on a Federal level to  
39 actually put in a season change up there on the portion of the  
40 Federal hunt which the early -- after the early season, if  
41 there's still animals left to be harvested, the subsistence  
42 season doesn't really start till December 1 and we wanted to  
43 move that date up to -- originally, they wanted to move it up  
44 right after the rutting season. But after thinking it  
45 completely through and everything, we felt that we could at  
46 least move it up to November 1 which at that time of the year,  
47 formally, the Taylor Highway is still, you know, fairly  
48 travelable. It hasn't been snowed in to a large degree most  
49 years and, you know, we just felt that the herd would be a

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515



little bit more accessible and there might be a little bit better chance for the locals to harvest the caribou at that time of the year.

4

5 Now, I apologize for coming in late and I'm not certain if Craig's plan is actually going to include, or if this would actually accommodate this earlier hunting period. Maybe I could ask that the Chair ask him.

9

10 MR. LEE TITUS: Okay. Ask the comment on earlier hunting period?

12

13 MR. ENTSMINGER: Yes. Um-hum (affirmative).

14

15 MR. ROACH: Mr. Chairman?

16

17 MR. LEE TITUS: Yes?

18

19 MR. ROACH: Just to -- I'll give Craig an opportunity to discuss this as well. The harvest plan and formula that's before us doesn't have dates involved with it and I think that during the proposal when we go in through the proposals, that will be the time to address the advisory committees' desire to have an earlier season.

25

26 MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you. Any more....

27

28 MR. ENTSMINGER: Yeah. I just wanted to make sure, you know, our -- that what we've recommended at least be taken a look at, you know. Okay. Thank you.

31

32 MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you. Just a comment of hunting caribou and seasons and stuff like that, I'd like to see a Federal hunt prior to a State hunt. To tell you the truth, nobody from our area when there's caribou out there hunts during the State hunt because you get a lot of people from outside of the region out there running around on snow-machines, and it's kind of scary to go out there. And we don't hunt like they do. I mean I don't anyway. And for the last -- for ever since I've known, hardly any Northway residents hunt during the State hunt because of the influx of other hunters. The only time I see them really go out and hunt is when they have the Federal hunts because you have less people out there that -- it's more -- less chance of anything happening. Just to keep that in mind about hunting seasons. Yes?

47

48 MR. CONRAD GUENTHER: Mr. Chair, I'm Conrad Guenther and, as your Regional Council's biologist on subsistence

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

division, I have just a couple of comments. I'm also on this Fortymile Management Planning team and we feel, you know, quite strongly that it's very important to develop a comprehensive interagency management plan to promote the Fortymile Herd and hopefully have it reach its great potential and provide the greatest opportunity for the most people to utilize that herd. Along with that, I'd also like to offer my support for the quota and allocation for this next season until a plan is in place which may change or modify that quota and allocation so that we have something to work with at this point.

11

12 I also feel that I need to make sure you're aware that there is a proposal dealing with the Fortymile Caribou Herd and it does have an allocation in the quota even though I believe that that may have been modified, but I've not seen that officially, and that may have some impact; your vote may have some impact on that depending on how that's dealt with. That's all I have. Thank you.

19

20 MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you. Any more questions on discussions? Anybody has anything to -- yeah, as far as discussions, I speak in favor of the motion since it's only a one-year -- it has only a one-year -- it has a time-frame of one year on there, and I assume that we'll probably get more detailed information from the management team there on their future plans. And if nobody else has any questions, I guess we can vote on that. All in favor of the motion, say aye.

28

29 ALL MEMBERS: Aye.

30

31 MR. LEE TITUS: Opposed? (Pause) At this time, we'll take a short break, 10, 15 minutes, whatever.

33

34 (Off record)

35 (On record; 11:05)

36

37 MR. LEE TITUS: Okay. The next item on the agenda is the customary and traditional determination process, statewide. George Sherrod.

40

41 MR. GEORGE SHERROD: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. As some of you know, last fall, they relocated me from Anchorage up to Fairbanks and I'm a little bit out of the information flow these days. What is happening with the statewide C&T is a currently very evolving, rapidly changing, and somewhat elusive process. There was a meeting held on the 13th and 14th in Anchorage in which the staff committee, Federal staff, and the Fairbanks sat down and talked about the ongoing process, some of the studies and basically where we were going. And a number of

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

the people in this room here were at that meeting and, after my remarks, they might have some clarifications or additional comments to add. Mr. Titus also, the Chair, was at that meeting, also.

5

6 The meeting covered a lot of issues and I think there were a lot of concerns aired by Council members as to where we were going. There was a fair amount of discussion as to some of the problems associated with trying to grapple with the customary and traditional process, such things as to measure how much of a community reaches a point in which it is no longer a subsistence community, how long is long-term, et cetera. At the close of the first meeting, there really wasn't any action taken in that a process was put up and people voted yea or nay. There was, to some degree, some general consensus and this conclusion of general consensus is based on my observations, and some people may disagree with me. But I think that there was a general consensus at this meeting that we should be perhaps exploring a new process other than the one that was published in the Federal Register and that perhaps we needed a process that was termed "bottoms-up." In other words, that maybe rather than the staff initiating the work and bringing down conclusions, that maybe there should be a more active role played by the regional councils and the communities, remembering that when we started these first ones, the councils, in many cases, hadn't been formed or were just forming.

28

29 Some of the positive notes or I think general consensus was if we altered this program would be that we could streamline it; that people are looking at the fact that we're looking a long way down the road at the rate we're going of accomplishing our C&T Process or the revisiting it. One of the ideas thrown out that seemed to have appeal would be the possibility of having a C&T Process that paralleled or more closely paralleled the Subpart D process; that in my understanding the proposals would come in very similar to the current bag limits and season proposals and that they would be reviewed by the Council on somewhat of an annual basis and, to some degree, on an as-needed basis, that we would try to fix the problems and if there didn't seem to be a problem, we wouldn't try to fix it.

43

44 And, as I say, there was also a consensus that councils would play an active role in expanding or in developing this new process. But, as I say, when the meeting closed, there was not really a process put down on paper that could be acted upon; just sort of a general consensus that perhaps what we've done in the past is not the best way to do it and we need to

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

come up with some new method. There were some other views that came out in the meeting and I'm a bit reluctant to place them in the category of general consensus just from some of the remarks that the people have told me after the fact and some of the, how shall we say, conversation that occurred in the context of the meeting. One of the considerations or views was perhaps we should look at redefining communities. Communities currently have been defined as a geographic location and that perhaps there should be some consideration given to social communities as opposed to simply geographical communities. That in cases where you have a definable or a recognizable, say, Native community within a larger area, that perhaps that, as a community, could be dealt with despite its geographic location. But, again, this was a view and I think it was a long term from consensus on this.

16

17

There was also a view expressed that we should not shift from the ongoing processes; that we have two, three, and commencing a couple other ones in the works right now; that we should not radically abandon the ongoing studies, but continue with them at the same time that we are looking for new and perhaps improved ways of dealing with this process. On the 23th, the second day of the two-day meeting, the Southeast Council met and the other Chairs and the staff council met with them to review the C&T Process. Because of advertising and some other Federal requirements, the Southeast Council at that time could not take action or vote upon their recommendations. But it was basically their -- how shall we say, they put forth at that time that they had reviewed the C&T Process, they had reviewed the three alternatives and the different proposals put forth by the staff; that they had developed a set of recommendations and that those recommendations, basically, had been thought out, deliberated, and that they were going to go forward with them. Their recommendations did vary in certain areas considerably from the proposals put forth in the three alternatives, that blue book that I'm sure you saw last fall and the other staff recommendations that had been presented at different meetings.

39

It's my understanding that at their meeting last week, the Southeast Council did, in fact, adopt the recommendations they had developed and that those are now in the process of going forward to the board. As I say, currently, this is the changes and the direction. It's in a state of flux. It comes at a time when we are all very occupied with reviewing proposals and I suspect that after the round of the board meetings this spring we'll see this come, coalesce together in a more definable process. And, as I say, there were a number of people at that meeting, including the Chair, and there were a number of people I think that have had perhaps more update

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

information than I have. And I would think it might be wise, if they have comments, that you hear them out. Thank you, Mr. Chair.

4

5 MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you. Comments? Questions? At this time we're at the C&T Determination Process. Just for more information to the local residents, certain areas of the State you can't subsistence hunt or fish there because there's no C&T determination for that area, specific area. And in order to have a subsistence activity going on in that area, there needs to be some kind of a C&T determination. And Southcentral Council and the Upper Tanana are the only active ones that's going through the C&T Determination Process right now, but there's other areas that's going to go through the process later on. And, in the future, I believe that there will be determinations for the whole State of Alaska.

17

18 It's really hard and it's really difficult for me because the process is new, the system is just newly set up, and I'm just now learning more and more how the system operates and a lot of paperwork and a lot of bureaucracy. But I just wanted to say that because we have to do the C&T because there was no determination in some areas in the Upper Tanana and we want more opportunities to continue to live the way we used to live. I know a lot of things that happened within the system, I don't agree with, whether it be the Federal system or whether it be the State system, and I never will agree with either system because I'm a Native person and there's things that I was taught as a little boy that nobody would understand when you're talking about hunting, when you're talking about animals. There's certain things -- when you're talking about animals, there's certain things you can't say about certain species because we have stories, old stories about those animals. And how are we going to put it in a book and say what's law? That's why it's really difficult for me because I could only go so far. I know laws are subject to change and, like I said, there's a lot of things that I don't agree with, but it's just the way things are. And I'm not saying that I'm going to compromise on strong issues with either the State or the Federal agencies because I'm not in the position to compromise.

42

43 With that, I guess if anybody has questions for George? Any of the public has anything they want to say about the C&T process? John?

46

47 MR. STARR: I just want to make a comment. When I first came up here on my first meeting, it was in November. I can say that it's pretty hard to determine because to me

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

it's -- C&T determinations is where I grew up in. I've lived there all my life. You know, like I said, these villages was put here hundreds of years ago where it was easy for the people to get access to food. That's why all these villages are -- even on the Yukon River and they're still here today. The only difference today is they've got English names on them, And these villages will be here for these young people and their children and their grandchildren like I said before. So I can -- to me, that C&T determination, the way I see it is, where we'll live off the land for hundreds of years and we'll still do it for another 100 years coming. Thank you.

12

13 MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you, John. Charlie?

14

15 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: I think I've said this before  
16 the previous meeting that the C&T determination is very  
17 simple to me. I can state it in five minutes. You can take  
18 Mr. Roach and me as an example. I eat and I hunt muskrat and  
19 he doesn't. He wouldn't eat it. In the time of shortage, who  
20 gets the muskrat? There's many other examples I could state  
21 about C&T. For instance, I put another example a couple of  
22 minutes ago about the Crown Lands. It was in the Fortymile  
23 herd. The Natives in Canada, they get all seasons, no limits;  
24 whatever their needs, they go out and get it. I don't see  
25 why -- I think we've crossed some lines years ago on the C&T.

26

27 I remember as a child, this is in Territorial days,  
28 and you, how terrified our parents were of the game wardens.  
29 said, well -- and as I grew older, I was wondering, why are  
30 they scared to hunt something they're going to eat? Why are  
31 they being prosecuted for killing a moose out of season when  
32 they eat it and there's no Safeway down the store (sic)? I  
33 know a couple of incidents, and I grew up with that. I've  
34 grown to be a man and I still don't see the other side. Why  
35 are we being prosecuted for something that we eat on our own  
36 lands? Who has a right to say that's my land, the land you're  
37 born on? I think the sovereignty issue is still deep in my  
38 mind. I'm like Lee, I can't agree with everything the Federal  
39 and the State do because I've never -- I've considered myself a  
40 free man. Nobody bought my birthright or my right to go out  
41 and hunt and eat food that my grandfathers taught me or my  
42 mother taught me to eat, this is our traditional. I never  
43 pushed it away and say, no, I can't eat it because I didn't --  
44 they taught me to eat it. They taught me to eat the food  
45 that they hunt for generations. The same way his mother taught  
46 him to eat food she bought at the store.

47

48 So, I hope you see my point. It's so simple to me  
49 about traditional and cultural, where we draw the line. I

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

don't know, like Lee, I just don't -- I think it's up to the village councils to determine what their people think, how their people -- what they want to eat. I don't know, if I asked the chief in my village, he'd probably feel the same way. I'm at a loss, I don't know.

6

MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you, Charlie. Randy?

8

MR. MAYO: I'd just like to make some comments about what we're talking about here. You know, I'm just new on this board and my first meeting was in Tok last October when this issue came up. And, you know, the way it is, the way I see it, I don't fully understand this system because it's not mine. The way it is, there's two different values here. You know, one is a colonial-based value on sport and recreation and where we come from, you know, it's a whole different story for us based on, you know, cultural and spiritual sustenance. This C&T, from what I saw at that last meeting, was this -- it looked like the agencies determined this. And I guess what I'm trying to say is that instead of talking to you Federal people, I'd rather talk to a council of traditional Elders from the regions from this area.

23

I want to take direction from them. I can't make decisions that aren't mine to make based on an outsider's viewpoint. And the way this was done, you know, I know at home it doesn't mean nothing to the people when an agency proposes to hold a meeting in the village. You know, it's alien to the people so they won't show up, a lot of them won't show up. The agency has to put this out to the chief and the village council with the Elders involved, and this meeting has to come out of the village itself. It can't come from the outside. If it worked this way, then how much money was spent on this study, what the hours and the material put out that was just scrapped? This -- the Council make an agreement with the service or whoever the agency involved to get a local resource survey-baker and go out and interview their Elders, you know, based on territory that was established before statehood and before the United States Constitution was even thought of. This is how it has to be. It has to come from the people.

41

MR. LEE TITUS: Jeff?

43

MR. ROACH: Just briefly. From the things that I'm hearing from George and the Council members as far as -- I would say the Council Chairs, as far as this C&T Process goes, I still think that it's really wide open and I've always been and I'll continue to be interested in hearing anybody's proposal for a process or for determinations based on the local

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

areas. I'd love to have a council of Elders get together and present a process. I'd love to hear it, but I haven't heard it yet and I would love to hear it. And maybe somebody out there or somebody on the Council can get that to happen and, if they can, I think it's a great idea. But we need to hear something from people. Until we hear more from the people -- I mean, I go out and talk to people, I know that other Council members talk to other people in their communities, in the whole region, and we bring that information back here. But I am still interested in hearing anybody's proposals for processes. Anybody can make recommendations, and I would love to hear them.

13

14 One of the -- I understand that Tanana Chiefs is putting together a counter-proposal or some type of proposal for this area, as well. I'd love to see that. I've asked for it, but I haven't seen it yet. I'd love to see what they have, but we need to get that information.

19

20 MR. LEE TITUS: Last Friday we had a meeting, all the local, all the -- we had council members from Dot Lake -- I mean, Healy Lake, the Tanacross Village Council, Tetlin Village Council, and the Tok Native Association had a meeting down here last week. I hope that they all show up later on because under this discussion, there was a lot of really good points that were brought up. And, as we go along throughout the day, if anybody is going to make any comments on some of the issues or whatever we're talking about, I'll kind of like fill in what was said at our last Friday's meeting.

30

31 Any more questions? Anybody from the public has anything to say? Frank?

33

34 MR. ENTSMINGER: Yes, Mr. Chair, members of the Council. As you probably have seen in some of your paperwork up there that the advisory committees submitted a proposal for a possible C&T idea for our area up here and I'm certainly open for any questions or comments on that proposal. The C&T thing, it's really a tough issue and I can see where you folks are coming from, the Native communities. You know, in the past, you were able to pretty much take animals whenever you needed them. And then, you know, under a white person's regime where rules and regulations and harvest and all the like was established with the licenses and all this and that and the other, I can see your frustration. I do want to remind the Council members that, you know, there's just a real large percentage of the white people have got pretty much the same heritage as far as hunting, use of a resource, living off the land, that type of a thing. Maybe not as deeply ingrained,

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515



certainly not as deeply ingrained in the actual country, you know, Alaska, but I know my father was a hunter, his father was a hunter. I go back through a long generation of hunting ethics and whatnot, and our family has used the resource tremendously.

6

7 And, also, just speaking of, you know, the general  
 8 average John Doe person that lives in the Upper Tanana area  
 9 here, as we all know, you know, a person goes to the store and  
 10 they might buy some bread and they might buy this and that and  
 11 the other, but when it comes down to looking at the meat  
 12 department, the meat section, you know, even if you'd like to  
 13 buy up a bunch of it, it's just cost-prohibitive. It's too  
 14 expensive. Simple as that. So, people have utilized the  
 15 resource. They look to the caribou herds, the moose herds,  
 16 sheep, whatever, to harvest animals that they eat. And this  
 17 proposal that our committee submitted, and I might add that all  
 18 of our meetings -- we had an average meeting of once a month  
 19 this year, we had this subsistence issue on the agenda on every  
 20 meeting. People were allowed to comment on it or whatever.  
 21 But this was an attempt to include all of the rightful people  
 22 in subsistence use in this area. We pretty well got away from  
 23 the species-by-species thing and community-by-community.

24

25 I mean, we're all rural people, we all utilize game  
 26 resources, we all take them home and eat them. A lot of the  
 27 federal lands has been prohibitive for parts of us to hunt in  
 28 the past and we don't think it's fair. I lined out some of the  
 29 problems we've had in the past in this area and I think, you  
 30 know, we tried to submit at least a start of a proposal that  
 31 might address a lot of these problems for all the people in  
 32 this area. And, like I say, I'm open for questions or comments  
 33 ideas or whatever.

34

35 MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you, Frank. Any more questions?  
 36 Do you have anything more on your....

37

38 MR. SHERROD: No, Mr. Chairman.

39

40 MR. LEE TITUS: Okay. Before we get into Copper  
 41 Region, I guess -- do you guys want to break for lunch?

42

43 MR. ROACH: Mr. Chair?

44

45 MR. LEE TITUS: Yes?

46

47 MR. ROACH: I believe that, unless I'm mistaken, the  
 48 Copper Region is just going to be an introduction and will be  
 49 fairly short....

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
 277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
 272-7515

1  
2 MR. LEE TITUS: Oh.  
3  
4 MR. ROACH: ....and it would be pretty easy to get that  
5n right now before lunch.  
6  
7 MR. LEE TITUS: Oh, okay. I just didn't know how long  
8t was going to take. Who's going to be doing that one? Oh,  
9ou are?  
10  
11 MR. MATHEWS: Mr. Chairman, while he's getting set up,  
12u do have a copy of the Upper Tanana-Fortymile Alternative  
13nder Tab 8 and that will be discussed when you get into the  
14ll discussion on Upper Tanana.  
15  
16 MR. LEE TITUS: Tab A?  
17  
18 MR. MATHEWS: Tab 8.  
19  
20 MR. LEE TITUS: One?  
21  
22 MR. MATHEWS: Yeah, and I think there's extra copies  
23ound here. It's under Tab 8, just so you know that that is  
24here.  
25  
26 MR. LEE TITUS: There's no Tab 8.  
27  
28 MR. ROACH: Eight.  
29  
30 MR. LEE TITUS: Oh, 8?  
31  
32 MR. MATHEWS: Eight.  
33  
34 MR. LEE TITUS: Oh, okay.  
35  
36 MR. MATHEWS: Ocho.  
37  
38 MR. BRUCE GREENWOOD: Mr. Chair, Council, my name is  
39ruce Greenwood. I work for National Park Service in Anchorage  
40 the subsistence division. And, as Jeff mentioned, I planned  
41 just giving a brief introduction to the Copper Basin C&T  
42roject. There is a map that I handed out to you earlier this  
43orning. You might want to refer to that a little bit later  
44. Vince has a copy of it.  
45  
46 First of, you know, you heard from George and he  
47entioned that there's a lot of changes going on in the C&T  
48rocess right now and the Copper Basin is one where we've  
49itiated writing the report which consists of a compilation of  
50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

existing data sources from Alaska Department of Fish and Game, Copper River Native Association, some Park Service records, and a literature review. So, I just want to emphasize right we're just in the initial stages of preparing the report for that, but I did want to give you a background on it so you'll be more familiar with it.

7

8 This Copper Basin report, the primary council that will be responding to that is the Southcentral Regional Council; however, it is an adjacent area and some of the communities may have uses in Unit 12. So, therefore, we definitely want to have you involved in the process so you can comment to us and let us know what your uses are in this area and how it may affect your existing uses. If you'll refer to the map, I'll just read through the communities real briefly. The communities that we're going to be covering -- I will -- I'll take one step back. We're going to do is we're going to analyze, take this information we have, compile it and analyze it for each community. So we will be studying the C&T uses of each of these communities; therefore, it may cover a variety of different units.

22

23 The communities are Mentasta, Mentasta Pass, Slana, the Homesteads at Slana, Nebesna, Shushana, Chistochina, Gakona, Silkana, Paxson, Sourdough, Glennallen, Lake Louise, East Glenn Highway, West Glenn Highway, and these two -- some of these names maybe are not familiar as communities, but Alaska Department of Fish and Game in their studies designated these 29 communities so as to consolidate a group of people living along the highway. So, I just wanted to emphasize that. Another community is Tazlina, Copper Center, Kenny Lake, Tonsina, Chitina, McCarthy Road area, and the South Wrangell area which includes Dan Creek, May Creek, and Kennicott.

34

35 What we plan on doing is having a report prepared sometime around late summer. At that time, we'll have public meetings which primarily would be in the Copper Basin region. We'll have a distribution of the document and then during the fall and winter, we'll work with the regional councils and the public in putting together the C&T determinations for this area. The Subsistence Board has asked us to have the regulations effective by the first of July 1996. So, we're looking at a little more than a year away. Are there any questions?

45

46 MR. LEE TITUS: Any questions?

47

48 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Yes, Mr. Chairman, I have. You know this letter that was -- do you have a copy of this

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

letter from Mr. Ewan?

2

3 MR. GREENWOOD: Let's see, I'm not sure what letter  
4 you're referring to.

5

6 MR. MATHEWS: Mr. Chairman, that's the letter from Roy  
7 Ewan of the Southcentral commenting on the Upper Tanana C&T.

8

9 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Could you explain what he  
10 means, Vince? Is it related to what he's talking about?

11

12 MR. MATHEWS: What he -- I think it would be best,  
13 unless you want me to discuss it now, it would be best to  
14 discuss the Southcentral's comments on the Upper Tanana....

15

16 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Oh, okay.

17

18 MR. MATHEWS: ....at that time, but....

19

20 MR. LEE TITUS: Yeah, just....

21

22 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: The Copper River, is there  
23 more under that?

24

25 MR. LEE TITUS: Yeah, it's different than that C&T  
26 process that Southcentral is doing, right?

27

28 MR. GREENWOOD: Okay. The Copper Basin C&T covers the  
29 communities that I previously mentioned and that would include  
30 primarily Units 11 and Units 13(A), (B), (C), and (D), and  
31 there is a little bit of use of 12.

32

33 MR. LEE TITUS: Okay. So, it's not the Southcentral as  
34 a whole or what?

35

36 MR. GREENWOOD: No, it's not the Southcentral as a  
37 whole; it's the Copper Basin area and the communities I  
38 covered. However, the Southcentral Regional Council has a  
39 primary responsibility to respond to this C&T Process, as this  
40 Council has to respond to the Upper Tanana Process. However,  
41 we're presenting it to you because we want you to be involved  
42 in this as much as you choose to be so we can get your input  
43 and your knowledge into the uses in these areas. Primarily  
44 where I could see some potential overlaps would be in Unit 12  
45 around Shushana and possibly the communities of Mentasta,  
46 Shushana, and so forth that have used areas within the -- in  
47 Unit 12.

48

49 MR. LEE TITUS: Yeah, I think that's a good idea

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

Because a lot of the -- some of the Native people, whether they be from here or Northway or either -- there's some in Tok and Tanacross and Tetlin have relatives living down around the Copper area and they utilize the Copper River for subsistence purposes in the summer. And I think it will be a good idea to kind of like have a co-op meeting or whatever they call it.

7  
8 MR. GREENWOOD: So your suggestion would be to have a meeting between this Regional Council and the Southcentral Regional Council?

11  
12 MR. LEE TITUS: Not Southcentral Regional Council. The Copper Basin C&T. Do they have some kind of advisory committee or something? Or is this something that's coming from the staff?

16  
17 MR. GREENWOOD: To respond to your question, presently this is coming from the staff; however we have been working with the Copper River Native Association and input they're providing to the document.

21  
22 MR. LEE TITUS: Oh, okay.

23  
24 MR. MATHEWS: Mr. Chairman, I think what you're estimating is that the council that is directly involved with this is Southcentral.

27  
28 MR. LEE TITUS: Right.

29  
30 MR. MATHEWS: There is no planing team like the Upper Tanana....

32  
33 MR. LEE TITUS: Okay. Okay.

34  
35 MR. MATHEWS: ....or for the Fortymile or that. It is within the Council and the board has set up that the lead agency is the National Park Service for that area. So, they've -- the process will be to go through the councils.

39  
40 MR. LEE TITUS: Okay. Yeah, the reason I ask is because at our last meeting down in Anchorage, I got a chance to talk to Roy and Fred John and they were really interested in how our C&T Process was going on because they have relatives that live up this way and we have relatives that live down that way. And I think they really want to be informed on decisions that are made.

47  
48 MR. MATHEWS: Mr. Chairman, an option that's available to you that we've somewhat worked on and continue to work with

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

YK Delta, Yukon-Kuskokwim, and Western Interior, is to have members from one council visit the other council's meeting. So you have an option of having a subcommittee from here - Hopefully there's funding - you would to travel then to Southcentral meeting and attend it, and hopefully the meetings do not overlap, as an example. And if you remember, at your last meeting, I think -- is it Fred John, Junior or is it Senior? I'm not sure.

9

10 MR. LEE TITUS: Junior.

11

12 MR. MATHEWS: He attended the meeting and was able to share some information. So, that option is available. The one that Bruce was mentioning is also available, but a little bit more of a logistic nightmare of having two councils meet together at once. But that option does it exist; it just takes a lot of time.

18

19 MR. GREENWOOD: I did want to comment that we do recognize the close ties between similar use areas and that is recognized. And we want to make all efforts possible to assure that all individuals and groups are -- have a chance to work together on this to come up with what is best for all the people.

25

26 MR. LEE TITUS: Okay. Any more questions? We're talking about a process -- I think I can talk about this later on. Charlie?

29

30 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: What's your name?

31

32 MR. GREENWOOD: My name is Bruce.

33

34 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Bruce. Okay. You were discussing the Copper River, right?

36

37 MR. GREENWOOD: The Copper River Basin area. It's primarily the Drainage of Copper River Basin.

39

40 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: I'm kind of mixed up here. But I know where we're -- what area we're looking at.

42

43 MR. MATHEWS: Mr. Chairman, I don't have them with me, but maybe Bruce and I can work on -- there are maps that show these different areas that are focusing on the present process of C&T and that might help. I know the map here shows the area that's of study, but it doesn't show the surrounding areas. I didn't bring that map. Maybe someone else has one.

49

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

1 MR. GREENWOOD: You know, Vince is referring to is that  
 2 the Federal Subsistence Board divided the state up into  
 3 different areas where a C&T Process is going to be completed  
 4 in. However, for National Park Service, we chose to study each  
 5 community within an area, so we're going to study the C&T uses  
 6 of each of those 23 communities that I listed. So, wherever  
 7 that community has used, we will be studying that area.

8  
 9 MR. LEE TITUS: Okay. At our last meeting in  
 10 Anchorage, I know Vince went through this earlier, this little  
 11 handout sheet that we have. This here was one of the things  
 12 that we discussed at our meeting and since we're talking about  
 13 the C&T Process and No. 4, it says that ". . . Regional Council  
 14 will recommend C&T uses agreed upon during the subregional  
 15 meetings to the Federal Subsistence Board, subject to approval  
 16 by tribal governments." And at that discussion, most of the  
 17 Regional Chairs throughout the state did not agree with the  
 18 current process that was going on pertaining to that C&T Process  
 19 and what they wanted was more local input by the local  
 20 communities. And if there's going to be any kind of a C&T  
 21 study or anything like that, I think the agencies should  
 22 contact the local tribal governments and ask to sit in at their  
 23 council meetings to discuss this. I think you'd get more local  
 24 input when you go to that level, because that's what we want.  
 25 We want local concerns being noticed. And I just brought that  
 26 out because we're still talking about the C&T Process and  
 27 there's a lot of things within the process that I really don't  
 28 agree on. And I think a lot of those -- all this was brought  
 29 up earlier. Vince?

30  
 31 MR. MATHEWS: Mr. Chairman, so we don't lose the  
 32 public that's present here, what you're talking about is that  
 33 there was a joint meeting on February 13th and 14th with the  
 34 staff meeting and Regional Chairs and this was an option that  
 35 was discussed at that meeting. And so people understand, I do  
 36 have copies of the option. But, essentially, it was a  
 37 discussion of a bottom-up approach, a discussion of subregional  
 38 meetings, and et cetera. So it is not the one that's presently  
 39 in play and it's an option that I'm not clear where it stands  
 40 at this moment.

41  
 42 But just so the public understands when you talk about  
 43 No. 4, there were five components of this, and I have copies  
 44 for those that are interested. But I do need to, in fairness  
 45 and as your - I don't know if I'm an acting coordinator or  
 46 what, but whatever I am - out of fairness to that, I would  
 47 encourage you to apply what is in those five aspects to the  
 48 processes that are before you. As an example, during  
 49 subregional meetings, my knowledge is there's been quite a few  
 50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
 277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
 272-7515

meetings done in the Upper Tanana area. So, I'm not defending anything, but I encourage you to apply these standards when the C&T Processes are in front of you. That doesn't mean I'm saying there's not need for improvement; I'm just saying, when it comes up, please remember those same comments. Thank you.

MR. LEE TITUS: Okay. Thank you. Any more questions?

MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: One clarification, Mr. Chairman. Bruce, you're here just to tell us that you're working on a C&T Process in the Copper Region?

MR. GREENWOOD: Yes, I am. I've initiated the process. I've been assigned to complete the task.

MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Oh, okay. I was wondering what the Copper Region was doing....

MR. LEE TITUS: Anything else? I guess we'll break for lunch. Are you done?

MR. GREENWOOD: I'm finished. Thank you.

MR. LEE TITUS: Oh, okay. I guess we'll take a -- come back at 1:15.

(Off record)

(On record; 1:30)

MR. LEE TITUS: We're going to come back to order.

MR. MATHEWS: Mr. Chairman?

MR. LEE TITUS: Yes.

MR. MATHEWS: I just want to let the Council members know that Janis and others will be talking about the Upper Tanana C&T, but within your book under Tab 8 are some materials that you may have at your disposal. It's the July 15, 1994 Federal Register explaining the existing C&T Process. There is a time scheduled for the Upper Tanana C&T and, like I mentioned earlier, there's the letter from the Upper Tanana-Fortymile Fish and Game Advisory Committee with their materials. So, just so you know that that's available. Thank you.

MR. LEE TITUS: Yeah. In our earlier discussions -- well, just for the public, I know we have some new faces in the crowd, some people just got here over the lunch break, and we're just kind of like keeping an open forum. If anybody has

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515



anything they want to say, that they come up to the microphone and state their name and who they represent for the record. If anybody needs to use the telephone, we have a telephone over in the building over here next door. If there's anything they need copied off, we have a copy machine over there, also.

6

7 In this Federal Register that Vince was talking about earlier, on that second page it gives the kind of like diagram of when we were talking about the procedures earlier today. You notice 1 and 2, it says the Upper Tanana and -- the Upper Tanana in '95 and Kenai Peninsula in '95. These are the two regions that are discussed in C&T right now. And I'm just giving this information for the Council members. They're going to be discussing the Yukon-Kuskokwim Delta and Minto and the Yukon Flats next year. So, we'll be dealing with this process. Even after we're done with the Upper Tanana C&T, we're going to still be dealing with C&T determinations in the Yukon Flats and the Minto area. Just a point of information.

19

20 And at this time, we're going to get into the Upper Tanana Region and customary and traditional use determination and, I don't know, did you want to go into the maps right now or did you want to -- how did you want to do this, Janis? Or maybe we can just start with Frank now.

25

26 MS. MELDRUM: Sure.

27

28 MR. LEE TITUS: I guess we can just -- over in "8" section it has the Upper Tanana-Fortymile Fish and Game Committees' recommendations. And I guess there were some questions that other people had, so I'll guess we'll have Frank go through his recommendations.

33

34 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Mr. Chairman?

35

36 MR. LEE TITUS: Yes, Charlie?

37

38 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: I have one question maybe the agency can answer me or Vince. Is there a mandate when we have to take action on this, or a time limit, time period after a certain date on the C&T?

42

43 MR. MATHEWS: Mr. Chairman, Mr. Titus, yes and no. The part of it is that, as you know, this program evolved after the decision with the McDowell case and at that time the process was to adopt all the standing State C&Ts into the Federal system. During the NEPA, the Environmental Protection Act, and environmental impact statement process, there was a request for the public to comment and make recommendations or,

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

I should say, requests to change C&Ts statewide. So, that process developed a list of, I don't know, two hundred plus requests to change C&Ts. The board and the staff committee then looked at that and very simply came up with this schedule that's here. So, in a way, yes, and in a way, no, as that there is no sunset clause on these C&Ts, there's no date like that set. But I'm not -- obviously, I'm not from your area; I don't know if the standing C&Ts negatively impact a subsistence user group or subsistence users. If they do, then that, I think, would charge this Council to look into that. So, there is a time-line but there's not on that.

12

13           Hopefully, I've muddled up the water enough there to --  
14's essentially that the Federal Program is trying to look at  
15 the C&Ts to make sure they reflect customary and traditional  
16 uses. The process is established now to go -- as it stands now  
17 to march across the state with this schedule in each of  
18 those areas, revisit all the C&Ts. The two that they started  
19 with, the schedules started with -- Kenai Peninsula and Upper  
20 Tanana have to be some of the most difficult regions to do.  
21 Other regions, the question of the C&Ts will not be as  
22 difficult because they're very remote communities, the make-up  
23 of the communities are high percent traditional subsistence  
24 users. It's when we get to road systems and et cetera where it  
25 becomes interesting. And you may want to ask others on that.

26

27           MR. LEE TITUS: Yeah, the reason -- yeah, that was the  
28 question that was brought up, you know, was the time-frame and  
29 within the process, there are certain time-frames, you know.

30

31           MR. MATHEWS: Well, on that note, if you look at the  
32 time-frame, this Council challenged that time-frame and changed  
33 it. Essentially, this meeting, according to the original  
34 schedule should have transpired in October. The Council, at  
35 that time, decided there was not enough public input. So, the  
36 time-frame is there to allow people to understand where it's  
37 going in that. But the Council's recommendations are quite  
38 important in this process. So you have influence on that time  
39 schedule.

40

41           MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you. Okay. Frank?

42

43           MR. ENTSMINGER: Yes, thank you, Mr. Chair, members of  
44 the Council. Basically, the recommendation that we put forth  
45 to you folks is a recommendation that includes all the rural  
46 residents of the Upper Tanana area, you know, including not  
47 only the five communities, but even people in some of the  
48 outlying areas or in-between communities that the advisory --  
49 Fish and Game Advisory Committee represents.

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

1  
 2 And, I don't know, I can probably give you a little  
 3 synopsis of the recommendations and report, you know. Because  
 4 of the whole subsistence issue to start with, you know, the  
 5 State's, you know, reluctance, I guess is a good word to apply,  
 6 to subsistence, they seemingly wanted to keep it, you know,  
 7 just as small use areas as possible, limited amount of seasons,  
 8 and it's been kind of a piecemeal approach. Whenever a game  
 9 management unit proposal would come up like to change a hunting  
 10 season on a specific species in a game management unit area,  
 11 they first had to find out if there was a C&T determination on  
 12 the animal before they could even consider the proposal set  
 13 forth to them. So, you know, they would first decide whether  
 14 there was a positive C&T or not on a certain animal somewhere.  
 15 And by doing it in this light, there was a lot of  
 16 misrepresentation, sometimes no representation for the people  
 17 that lived in an area as to whether there was or was not a C&T  
 18 on a particular animal or a species. And it seems to me the  
 19 whole subsistence scenario just kind of started in the middle  
 20 instead of at the start.

21  
 22 And all this recommendation is suggesting to you people  
 23 that all these five communities and the other people around  
 24 the area up here are rural people, we're all subsistence users  
 25 and, to start with, we would all like to get a positive C&T in  
 26 the area that we outlined for all the species that we've  
 27 addressed in this recommendation. Which, also, by the way,  
 28 includes mountain goats in Unit 11 which was -- mountain goats  
 29 just inadvertently went to the wayside, whether or not it was  
 30 even a subsistence species in that area down there. And if  
 31 there -- you know, if there are specific questions you have on  
 32 this recommendation, I'll certainly try to answer them.

33  
 34 MR. LEE TITUS: I had questions on the recommendation  
 35 portion. It says that ". . . we recommend a modified version  
 36 of Alternative B," and maybe you can get into the modified  
 37 version.

38  
 39 MR. ENTSMINGER: Yeah, I'll explain that. Actually, in  
 40 the pink book that is the conclusions on the customary and  
 41 traditional use eligibility, it puts forth all of these  
 42 different alternative options. And there's a series of  
 43 Alternative A options and there's a series of Alternative B  
 44 options. And what our recommendation has done, we've included  
 45 taken in the most liberal Alternative B option and applied  
 46 that to all of the communities, and also adding mountain goats  
 47 Unit 11.

48  
 49 So if you cared to look at all these different  
 50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
 277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
 272-7515

alternative proposals in here, you'll find that, you know, maybe one alternative has a map for a certain area and certain game species, and then the next Alternative B one is maybe a little bit different mapped area with different game species. All we did, we took the most liberal area and included all of the species for all five communities. And the reason, the rationale behind that is this: You know, as near as our community can interpret the subsistence law, the subsistence law was put in place, we feel, to safeguard subsistence hunting in the rural areas. And when you start talking about Federal lands, in the first place, if a species is not in jeopardy or can stand the harvest, everybody is supposed to be able to hunt with the exception of the hard Park areas. But any Park Preserve, any Fish and Wildlife Refuge land, BLM lands, any place that they allow hunting, everybody is supposed to be able to hunt there on these lands.

17

18 So, what our committee is trying to do is make sure that this, in fact, happens. There's a lot of Federal agencies that look at hunting under a lot more restrictive aspect, and the National Park Service is one of them. You know, the only hunting in National Parks is subsistence hunting, but there's a specific allowance for subsistence hunting in a National Park. But unless you have the C&T -- unless you have a C&T, positive C&T determination, you're not going to be hunting in those National Parks. That's only the first hoop that you have to jump through. But all we're saying in this recommendation is that being as we're all rural people and we all use a resource, we should at least be eligible to put our name in the hat if we think we should be able to hunt there, especially when it comes down to a limited resource. Naturally, if there's a limited resource and there's only going to be a certain number of people that will be able to hunt it, it's going to be the people that live the closest there and use the resource the most, and the long-time residents of the area. Does this help clear anything up?

37

38 MR. LEE TITUS: We went over this at our last meeting, this diagram here. It's the Federal law to provide for subsistence for the State of Alaska and within the state, we have urban areas, we have rural areas, and you go down to historic C&T uses. The urban is mostly the sport ethnic. You get the rural-historic is C&T uses. One of the -- Sheldon Katchatag, he's the Chairman of the Seward Peninsula, and he put this in the diagram, too. Also, it was in the urban areas, you have very small percentages of Native populations; in the rural area, it's almost half. And when you get down to C&T uses, it's almost full. And I just kind of used this as when we're going to come to the breakdown of resources when the

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

resources are scarce or who's going to make that determination?  
Is it going to be the biologists or the Fish and Game or  
whoever?

4

5 MR. ENTSMINGER: Excuse me, Lee?

6

7 MR. LEE TITUS: Yeah?

8

9 MR. ENTSMINGER: Yeah. This is basically what this  
recommendation -- it kind of addresses. We didn't get into the  
804 section of it which you're really talking about. But all  
our recommendation is saying is that we're rural and we should  
at least be able to apply for a hunt if a person feels they've  
had a positive C&T use on those critters. And, you know, a  
prime example of that that we've talked about at many of our  
committee meetings is the caribou hunt, the Federal caribou  
hunt on Tetlin and Northway.

18

19 MR. LEE TITUS: Um-hum.

20

21 MR. ENTSMINGER: And by no means do we feel that Tetlin  
and Northway shouldn't hunt them. I mean, there's no question  
that they have the positive C&T use of that resource. But  
there's other people in the Upper Tanana area that have  
probably just as much use of that resource that aren't being  
able to hunt that herd right now, especially the amount of  
animals that are being allowed to be harvested, and this -- our  
recommendation would correct a situation like this. There's  
no -- like I said, we didn't get into the 804 part and, you  
know, this is definitely something that's going to have to be  
worked out either in the future or it might be something that  
the Council here wants to address at this time.

33

34 MR. LEE TITUS: If we get down to the 804 Process, is  
this going to be the process done by the Tetlin Wildlife Refuge  
or the staff from Anchorage or Fairbanks? Or who's going to be  
in charge of the 804 Process?

38

39 MS. SUE MATTHEWS: Do you want me to come up, Lee?

40

41 MR. LEE TITUS: Sure.

42

43 MS. MATTHEWS: I'm not sure I should come up, but I  
think that that's yet to be determined whether that would come  
out of the Subsistence Division of each of the agencies having  
 gotten that far along. So I'm not sure people really know  
exactly who will be making those determinations, whether it  
will be at the local level, say, at the Refuge or whether it  
will be with the Subsistence Division. Wrangell-St. Elias,

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

Would the Park do those 804 determinations?

2

3 MR. WELLS: I don't think anybody knows yet. I know  
 4 that the staff committee was tasked with putting together an  
 5 804 Process. Who actually -- there's three 804 criteria: the  
 6 proximity, the localness, direct dependence, and alternative  
 7 resources. How you evaluate those three criteria on an  
 8 individual or family basis, that hasn't been worked out. But I  
 9 do know the regional councils are supposed to be intimately  
 10 involved in providing recommendations as to how that process  
 11 should occur.

12

13 MR. LEE TITUS: I think this -- yeah, I think the  
 14 process should be more looked at because I think sometime in  
 15 the future we're going to have to deal with that. And I think  
 16 will be a good idea to have the system in place prior to  
 17 having it be forced upon us.

18

19 MS. MATTHEWS: Mr. Chairman, I'd like to recommend that  
 20 maybe in some future council meetings, your Council can start  
 21 to figure out what things you'd like to see in that process,  
 22 just as now, you know, you're getting much more active and  
 23 really assuming a lot of the burden for the C&T. I know you're  
 24 busy, but it would be good to start looking at it from your  
 25 perspective as well.

26

27 MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you.

28

29 MR. ENTSMINGER: One other thing, Lee,....

30

31 MR. LEE TITUS: Yeah.

32

33 MR. ENTSMINGER: ....I wanted to point out. You know,  
 34 while all the people are wrangling with the subsistence stuff  
 35 this subsistence process in general, I feel that there's  
 36 been a lot of hunting opportunities needlessly taken away from  
 37 the people. You know, a lot of Federal agencies, because of  
 38 the different mandates that they work under, they're  
 39 becoming -- they want to become more and more and more  
 40 restrictive. And I'd like to see things get pushed back a  
 41 little bit. You know, let people hunt where they used to hunt  
 42 and allow people into these areas. Try to make it to where  
 43 they can participate in what they used to participate in. But  
 44 while we're bickering and complaining and wrangling over this  
 45 subsistence issue, our hunting rights are being taken away from  
 46 us. And I know the Wrangell SRC -- a prime example there:  
 47 there was a typographical error that deleted hunting sheep in  
 48 Unit 12 as a subsistence animal. It was a typographical error  
 49 that got entered into the Federal Subsistence Regulations right  
 50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
 277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
 272-7515

from the start. Every year we've pointed this out to the agency with a promise that it was going to be corrected. Every year, if you look in the regulation book, that has not been corrected. And, I mean, anything that's more restrictive, they jump on, but anything to liberalize more hunting or more opportunities, they fight against it.

MR. LEE TITUS: Just for a point of information, we were talking about the 804. The 804 is just another term for the current State's Tier II system. The 804 is a State version of the Tier II, only this is on Federal lands. I'd like just to clarify that to the public. Any more questions?

MR. MATHEWS: Mr. Chairman, I think it might be wise to take a few minutes to -- I know that you're up to speed on the Upper Tanana C&T Process and maybe Chuck is and maybe Jeff is, but I'm not sure the other Council members are up to speed, how this process has evolved, and where it's at at this moment. It may be wise to look at that, unless you want to go right in to alternatives. There are several alternatives out there, A, B, C, D, and probably other combinations.

MR. LEE TITUS: Are you going to go through it?

MR. MATHEWS: As a suggestion, you may want to look at background of this. And I'd also like to remind you that this meeting is a meeting that the Council requested, or this topic was requested by the Council early on in the process to comment on the reports and materials that will be provided to the staff committee when they meet to draft the proposed rule to get this out before the public for recommendations. So, that's the gist of the topic and this was to be a round table discussion on this.

MR. LEE TITUS: I know it's hard for some people to come up here and talk in the microphone, so if there's anything you'd like to say but you don't want to come up here, just write your comments down on a piece of paper and give it to me. I know we're going to get a couple of them later on after the school is out. But I'd just like to bring that out because I know there are some people that don't want to come out and talk in front of a whole bunch of strangers. And I'd just like to say if you have anything to say, just write it down on a piece of paper and give it to me.

I really don't know how to get started on this here. I don't know, what's the wishes of the Council? If they want to start discussing alternatives or what's the wishes of the Council? How do they want to go about....

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

1  
2 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Mr. Chairman?  
3  
4 MR. LEE TITUS: Charlie.  
5  
6 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: I like Mr. Entsminger's -- I  
7 guess it's a proposal or whatever you want to call it. I agree  
8 with a lot of it, but I'm still in the same position. I feel  
9 we are not getting enough input from Tanacross, Tok, Tetlin,  
10 and I like Mr. Katchatag's, Sheldon Katchatag's recommendation  
11 of option on No. 4. Before I make any vote, I would like some  
12 input from the communities involved in the C&T. I don't think  
13 I'd feel very comfortable voting for something that is given to  
14 me without input from -- voted on by the tribal councils or the  
15 people that are subsistence users in that area.  
16  
17 MR. ROACH: Mr. Chairman, if I may?  
18  
19 MR. LEE TITUS: Yes, Jeff?  
20  
21 MR. ROACH: I would request that the Fish and Wildlife  
22 Service present their information from the public meetings they  
23 held, if there's anybody here to do that.  
24  
25 MR. ENTSMINGER: Thank you.  
26  
27 MR. LEE TITUS: All right. Thanks, Frank.  
28  
29 MR. SHERROD: Jeff, what public meetings are you  
30 talking about?  
31  
32 MR. ROACH: Weren't there some meetings held by the  
33 Fish and Wildlife Service to talk about C&T determinations or  
34 some meetings that were held and C&T was talked about at those  
35 meetings?  
36  
37 MR. SHERROD: What areas?  
38  
39 MR. ROACH: In this Fortymile -- or in the Upper Tanana  
40 area.  
41  
42 MR. SHERROD: That was the Park Service that did that.  
43  
44 MS. MELDRUM: No.  
45  
46 MR. SHERROD: You didn't?  
47  
48 MS. MELDRUM: No, the Tetlin Refuge did.  
49  
50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515



1 MR. SHERROD: Oh, the Tetlin Refuge.

2

3 MS. MATTHEWS: Hi. I know most of you, but I'm Sue  
Matthews. I'm the refuge manager for Tetlin National Wildlife  
Refuge. I was just out talking to some kids from Northway High  
School because one of the meetings that we did hold was at the  
High school, and we said to the kids this is important stuff  
that's being discussed. Look at the documents, see how you  
feel and come and talk to the Council and tell the Council how  
you feel about this issue. And they're getting scared and I'm  
trying to get them back in the door.

12

13 We did hold meetings, as many as we could in the five  
communities. We had successful meetings at Dot Lake, we had  
meetings that were scheduled for Tanacross and for Northway, as  
well as Tok. We have been working with the Local Fish and Game  
Advisory Committee, and then we were aware that Tanana Chiefs  
Council was interested in having meetings. So, we said, well,  
let's combine. People hate meetings. Let's see if we can  
combine meetings and just tell people again the same story:  
This is important; the Council needs to hear from you. And so  
Tanana Chiefs was able to finally have one at Tetlin. We had  
trouble having to rearrange the ones at Northway because  
everybody was going -- well, because they were in the finals of  
the basketball contest, and so it made it very difficult.

26

27 So, we've been meeting with schools, as well, hoping to  
get at a lot of the hunters and we've had reactions from  
people. We've taken some comments that we've forwarded to  
Janis and her staff, as well as have said for people to  
continue to come into our office. I've seen a lot more  
interest. I think, Chuck, you've certainly been working hard  
to work with communities. And it's real hard, it's real  
difficult, everybody's busy, but I think they will be providing  
comments to you, hopefully, here. We've got a lot of people in  
the back who are real interested. I hope they do come up and  
speak. You know, as far as my job was concerned, I just wanted  
to make sure we got people talking about it and that was really  
the message we had when we went to the meetings, was make sure  
they let everybody know how they felt about it. If it's  
difficult for them, then we try to provide some easy ways for  
them to come into our office or we've handwritten messages  
down.

44

45 Our Refuge information technician has gone around and  
talked to as many people as she can, to try to get an idea, and  
we'll summarize those comments that we've had. But, hopefully,  
they'll tell you themselves, because I think there are several  
people here who do have opinions, even though it's a real

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

difficult subject and it's very complex, especially with so many different alternatives. I think there is interest and it's just real hard to make people feel comfortable coming up and letting you know how they feel.

5

6 MR. LEE TITUS: Anybody have any questions?

7

8 MR. MATHEWS: Mr. Chairman?

9

10 MR. LEE TITUS: Yes?

11

12 MR. MATHEWS: Back to the October meeting, the October meeting you requested that there be meetings held in the communities affected and that Alternative A and Alternative B that you drafted were presented at these meetings. Maybe someone can give a report as to the response to those alternatives and what the communities felt about Alternative A and B, or did they come up with other alternatives.

19

20 MR. STAN NED: I have a question. Sue, can you give a little background on the history of C&T?

22

23 MS. MATTHEWS: Thanks, Stanley, I'll get you for this. Stanley asked me to give you a little background on the history of C&T so far, and I think a little bit has already been done. But, very quickly, customary and traditional use determinations had been made over many years by the State of Alaska before the Federal government assumed responsibility for subsistence management on Federal lands only. And I think that's an important thing because, as I heard Frank Entsminger talk about that for the Tetlin Refuge, caribou hunt is only open to residents of Northway and Tetlin; that that is true, the Federal subsistence hunt on the Refuge is only for those two villages. However, the other villages can hunt those Nelchina animals on the Refuge when the State hunt is open. So what we're all talking about now is just the Federal hunts, subsistence hunts.

38

39 And when the Federal government assumed the responsibility for managing just the subsistence hunts on Federal lands, they just adopted statewide the customary and additional use determinations that the State had made. I mean it was a big effort to all of a sudden have that new responsibility and they said, oh, we can't deal with trying to figure out if the C&T determinations are okay. So, they just adopted the statewide ones. So, this one that's for Tetlin and Northway residents for the Tetlin Refuge is an old State one that was done by Dave Kellyhouse and so it's been around for a long time and it was an effort to make sure that local

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

residents had an opportunity to hunt locally for subsistence.

2

3 Now, there have been a lot people who are saying we  
want those changed. We want, again, just the subsistence  
hunts. We want the Federal government to take a look at those  
customary and traditional use determinations. So, that's the  
process that you're doing right now and the first two areas  
that were started -- were done were for the Upper Tanana five  
communities. The other one was the Kenai Peninsula. Now,  
because it's a Federal program, it includes National Parks and  
National Wildlife Refuges. All of the Federal people, the  
agencies, divided the state up and they said, okay, Park  
Service staff, you take certain of these regions; Fish and  
Wildlife Service staff, you take certain of these regions, and  
they divided them up. So, right now you have Park Service  
staff who worked on this Upper Tanana Region analysis, but  
they're in the subsistence program. They're being the staff  
for the Subsistence Board. The Subsistence Board is the one  
who's going to make the decision and that asks the subsistence  
staff from the different agencies to help do this analysis.

21

22 So that's why you have Janis and Bruce, who are from  
the Park Service, working on the Upper Tanana. In the Kenai  
Peninsula, it was Fish and Wildlife Service staff, and we've  
been moving along and we're now to the point of the regional  
councils looking at this when all of a sudden the process got  
questioned. And they said maybe this isn't the right way to do  
it, and this is the meeting that Lee was attending and all of  
the regional council presidents attended this meeting in  
February 14th - Valentine's Day, I thought it was very  
appropriate - and they took a look at the whole process and  
they said, wait a minute, maybe this isn't the right way to do  
it. So, now we sort of have a confusion going on that we have  
Upper Tanana community's process, you know, was almost getting  
finished and the Kenai process almost getting finished when  
they looked at the process and have maybe changed the approach  
for the other regions around the state. It doesn't mean, I  
don't think, that you have to adopt the Kenai and the Upper  
Tanana process that's gone this far. You certainly should look  
at the work. There's a lot of hard work that's been done and  
people have been involved in it, but, at the same time, other  
proposals were coming in about Upper Tanana. So, that's why we  
have -- Proposal A is the original work that the Park Service  
staff did, that Janis and her staff did. Proposal B is one  
that came up the last time you all looked at this. It was a  
motion by Jeff to maybe consider another one. So, that's  
Proposal B. I don't know what the other ones are. How many  
are there now?

49

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

1 MS. MELDRUM: Three.

2

3 MS. MATTHEWS: There's three. Three so far, A, B,  
4 and C. Who's C? Tanana Chiefs?

5

6 MS. MELDRUM: A local advisory committee.

7

8 MS. MATTHEWS: Local advisory committee. Okay. Chuck  
9 has been working on some other proposals, so I guess we've got  
10 all kinds of different ideas about how this Upper Tanana one  
11 should look like. And I guess that's the decision before you  
12 now, is to give your recommendations. The board will make the  
13 final decision; by law, they have to make that final decision  
14 as I understand it. We have an attorney here who can help us  
15 on that. Did that help you, Stanley?

16

17 MR. NED: Yes, thank you.

18

19 MR. LEE TITUS: Anybody has any more questions for Sue?  
20 Thank you, Sue. Belinda?

21

22 MS. THOMAS: I guess I wanted to address the board one  
23 more time. I was -- I went back to the office at lunch and I  
24 was thinking to myself, when you speak about tradition and  
25 customary use, there's a lot of controversy as to what people  
26 think or what group of people this type of determination  
27 includes. For Native people, it shouldn't be so mysterious.  
28 There's answers to this and the answers lie in to -- really  
29 come from the Elders. For years, the Elders have been fighting  
30 and have left their words and wisdoms in the songs and the  
31 potlatch speeches. The main message of each of their speeches  
32 was to protect and learn your culture, live a traditional life  
33 that you pass these things down to children.

34

35 Some time ago, to make a long story and complicated  
36 story short, there was some legislation going around that made  
37 reference to a created Indian tribe versus a traditional Indian  
38 tribe. What was trying to be said is that the Indians today  
39 aren't really Indian, but were really a created tribe who  
40 should not have the same rights as our great- and our  
41 great-great-grandparents. This type of legislation has been  
42 shot down. Today, we're sitting here listening to how C&T  
43 determinations are being made and who will be included. Years  
44 ago there were no boundaries and even a mere five years ago,  
45 the regulations were less strict. If this type of trend  
46 continues, then, five years from today Natives will be even  
47 more restricted. Some day we'll reach a point where our  
48 customary and traditional hunting rights exist no more.

49

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

1 I got this story at lunch. I had two Elders come in  
 2 and even a couple of my relatives, because they're working and  
 3 they can't talk to you. So, those words aren't really mine,  
 4 but a representation of some of the village words. Years ago,  
 5 my grandfather and village people did a great deal of hunting  
 6 during early August because they knew that the moose were in  
 7 healthy condition. They would find fresh tracks and track  
 8 these animals down using their hunting skills and knowledge of  
 9 the country. The regulations that are often considered have  
 10 little input from the Elders and villages. The Elders know  
 11 when the moose is the healthiest and would never go hunting or  
 12 agree to a hunting regulation during the time that they rut.  
 13 Years ago when some hunting and fishing regulations were coming  
 14 out, people tried to go to the old-timers about these  
 15 regulations that would affect their subsistence rights. Many  
 16 times the Elders would smile and nod their head and they really  
 17 didn't have an understanding of what was being said until he or  
 18 she was arrested for killing an animal illegally and as they  
 19 watched the meat being taken away from the community. This  
 20 hurts the integrity and the pride of our people.

21

22 We hear of Katie John subsistence case, who I believe  
 23 about 75 years old. Look at Katie, not the court case. You  
 24 see a lady who has fished there for 69 years, you see her  
 25 grandchildren fishing beside her, eager to learn the tradition.  
 26 Katie fished in that spot all her life and, all of a sudden,  
 27 she was told that she can't fish there because of State  
 28 regulations. Did anybody ever sit down with Katie and ask if  
 29 it was okay to close the fishing regulations or to try to work  
 30 with the village?

31

32 What it all boils down to is this: The C&T  
 33 determination as it is written is not accurate, it's not a good  
 34 representation of the Elders and of the Native people. You ask  
 35 for a proposal? Our proposal is this: You start over by  
 36 listening to the villages and especially to the Elders.  
 37 Because what you are doing today is deciding what these kids  
 38 and their kids are going to be doing. And these guys wanted to  
 39 talk to you to try and make you listen and, you know, they're  
 40 pretty brave and should be commended. So, I'll let them talk  
 41 to you.

42

43 MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you.

44

45 MR. GARY NORTHWAY: My name is Gary Northway and I'm  
 46 from Northway, and I've been a longtime resident of Northway.  
 47 And over the years, as I've been growing older, I've seen a  
 48 number of changes in the hunting regulations in this area, Unit  
 49 42, from both State and Federal government. Regardless of what  
 50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
 277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
 272-7515

your laws state, I've been living the traditional lifestyle for a long time. Whenever my family needs food, I go out and get it, and I get this food for my family because we need it. That's all I have to state right now.

5

6 MR. A.J. FELIX: My name is A.J. Felix and I represent Northway. All my grandpas and uncles and them all used to go hunting every day because they don't have enough money to go out and buy the food like every other people do. I'd like to say that people should let Natives do what they want to and hunt what they want to. That's all I have to say.

12

13 MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you.

14

15 MS. THOMAS: I think that these guys probably deserve a hand, so would you join me and just give them a hand.

17

18 (Applause)

19

20 MR. LEE TITUS: I know we have some more new faces. I'd just like to say that we're now discussing the Upper Tanana customary and traditional use. We're at the workshop and round table discussion right now. And if there's anything that you'd like to comment or anything you'd like to say, come to the microphone and state your name and who you represent. Danny?

26

27 MR. ADAMS: My name is Don Adams. I'm from Tetlin. I'm here to re-support Belinda's alternative on this C&T report; that it be taken off from all the proposals that are being submitted and redone to have villages have more say-so in determining their future here. There's just too many uncertainties with this C&T report. I think -- I hate to use these kinds of words, but "impact studies," "usage," "regulations," all those play a factor and I think it needs to go back to grassroots level and, to me, that's in the villages. You know, you've heard words such as "cooperative management." I don't know if that's even something that we'd like to see. Under whose management? It seems like the Federal and the State will sit and wrestle out these issues for the next century and what happens is the Native people that live in these communities get left out on the determination.

42

43 And I've also looked at and read some of Mr. Frank Atsminger's alternative. A lot of this stuff in here has points and has good recommendations. But, I mean, did these recommendations come from the villages? I mean, does it benefit the villages in the years to come? I don't know how to make this one sentence that he put in here about subsistence hunting in many instances is an opportunist's -- while hunting

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

of one species, others may encounter and harvest another animal. I, for one, was never brought up to be an opportunist. I was never raised by my grandfather to go out and see how many moose I can kill and eat within a season or within certain months. I was taught to go out to gather food for my family in the times that we need them and use them and apply to our diet. I do not go out there to see how big a moose I killed, the horn or the trophy size. I go out there for the meat when my family needs it, so I'm not an opportunist. I don't go out there just to hunt. And I hope that this C&T here, I hope that we can have an Alternative D applied to it. I see A, B, and C. I wish there was a D there saying let's take it back to the villages and see where it goes.

14

15 MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you, Dan. Anybody else has any comments?

17

18 MR. NED: My name is Stanley Ned. I work for Tanana Chiefs in the Wildlife and Parks Department, and I'm also from Adlakaket. This C&T determination, we need to be really careful in how we decide what we're going to do for these villages. I think the villages themselves need to come up with their version of customary and traditional uses because they're the people that are using the area, they're the people that live in that area. The decision that is made now will be there for a long time. Most of you here, you people that are Westerners, will probably be moving back Outside to retire, and those people that are going to be really affected by it are the people that are going to be here for a long time. Our grandchildren. So we need to be really careful in that.

31

32 I would recommend that decisions be made by the villagers themselves, the people that are directly affected by and that their hunting area be their traditional use area, the whole area, be it the Park, State land, Federal land, Dot Lake, Tanacross, Northway, Tetlin, all five of the communities. I think like Sue was saying earlier, they could combine all of these decisions that have been made so far or these recommendations or proposals, whatever you might call it. If you could combine all those and come up with something that best suits your region, it will satisfy us because we can only -- me, at Tanana Chiefs, I can only recommend and try to help you in your process. I cannot tell you this is the way it's going to be. Thank you.

45

46 MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you, Stanley.

47

48 MR. DANNY GRANGAARD: My name is Danny Grangaard. I live in Tok. One thing I'd kind of like to clear up a little

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

Bit of what Danny just said about what Frank said, I guess, is what he meant by opportunity like that was to hunt more than one species at a time. I don't think Danny quite understood what Frank was trying to get at there, that if you're hunting sheep and there's a goat there, to be able to take a goat or if you're hunting caribou and you see a caribou (sic), you can take it. That's what Frank meant by that comment, I think. Wasn't it?

9

10 MR. ENTSMINGER: (Nods head.)

11

12 MR. GRANGAARD: Yeah. Did I make myself clear there?

13 MR. LEE TITUS: Okay.

14

15 MR. GRANGAARD: Frank has said most of what I want to say. But one thing that I think we ought to do, whatever area you take, is do all species at this time, birds, fur animals, hunting of animals. I hate to see us go through this again on a plan that when we should take birds and hunting with this on fur animals at one time. You know, as far as which plan, you know, like I sat through the advisory committee and that plan C that the advisory committee adopted -- the main reason they adopted that was because Tetlin was getting nicked out on the south end of their land. So, plan C would take -- encompass Tetlin, to encompass it all, too, all the way down to what like the rest of them are up there on the map and then to add goats or all species of animals again. And that's the only difference between C and B, is to add Tetlin, more land. That's all I've got.

30

31 MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you. Yes, Vince?

32

33 MR. MATHEWS: I just want to make it clear to you that at the last meeting, it was discussed that - and Janis can back this up - that that Alternative A was just an alternative for discussion based on their interpretation. B was to solicit additional inputs. You're not limited to those alternatives. The process is set up now that this Council asked to comment prior to the staff committee meeting to come up with a proposed rule, and so we're at that stage now to look at that. So, I just want to make you aware that there was a public request here that there should be Alternative D or E. This is the opportunity for F and G, if need be.

44

45 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Vince, you're saying that a motion would be in order?

47

48 MR. MATHEWS: I would -- that's not my call, Mr. Chair, Mr. Titus. I think you need some further discussion on this

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515



process. I'm not sure if Council members from outside this area -- maybe they can ask what other additional information they need to know on this process.

4  
5 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: You mean I can't make a motion?

7  
8 MR. MATHEWS: Oh, no, I thought you were making a motion to pass one of the alternatives or support one.

10  
11 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: No, could I add an alternative?

13  
14 MR. MATHEWS: Oh, sure. Sure, I'm sorry. I thought you meant another way.

16  
17 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Well, what I'm saying is, could I move to accept Mr. Katchatag's Option 4?

19  
20 MR. LEE TITUS: I believe that's in order.

21  
22 MR. MATHEWS: Yes, it's a possibility.

23  
24 MR. LEE TITUS: Sure.

25  
26 MR. MATHEWS: The process, as it stands now, is the one that's in that Federal Register notice. The process that's before you that was presented by Seward Peninsula Regional Council is one that's not in effect at this time; it's just a potential idea that's out there. But, sure, you can take action on that. I think Sue laid it out pretty well, that the fact that the process right now is being discussed as to what process to apply. My understanding, and this is my only -- my understanding, is that the Kenai and Upper Tanana C&T Processes were to go to completion because of the investment of all people involved in it. So, that's all I have to say on that; that was my understanding, and that looking at these other processes would be for future ones. But, again, you represent this area, you were selected based on your subsistence expertise and knowledge, and this process is set up to hear from you, so....

42  
43 MR. LEE TITUS: So, is that a motion or you were just....

45  
46 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: I would like to make the motion if it's in order.

48  
49 MR. LEE TITUS: The motion's in order.

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

1  
2 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: I make a motion that we -- I  
move to accept - I don't know, how am I going to state it -  
Sheldon Katchatag's option No. 4.

5  
6 MR. LEE TITUS: The motion is on the floor to accept  
Option No. 4. It just states that the regional council will  
Recommend C&T uses agreed upon during subregional meetings to  
Federal Subsistence Board subject to approval by tribal  
Governments. (Pause) No second? (Pause) Motion dies from  
lack of a second. So, we're back commenting on Upper Tanana  
Customary and traditional use determinations.

13  
14 I'd like to just make a point, and we are subject to  
provide subsistence use by law for all residents of Alaska,  
whether they be Native or non-Native. And I brought this up  
over and over again at our meetings in Anchorage. Because I'm  
Native, I know some of my customs and I know some of my  
traditions, but I don't know all of it. But one question that  
really comes to my mind over and over again is that what are  
the customs and traditions of the non-Native? And I can't seem  
to get an answer for that.

23  
24 Do we have any more public comments? Charlie?

25  
26 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Mr. Chairman, one more thing.  
I just want to clarify that I don't want to vote on anything  
that will come back and haunt me. That's one of the reasons I  
moved to accept Sheldon Katchatag's option, because at least  
we'll hear from the Council, we'll hear from the village  
Councils on this before we vote on anything; their concerns,  
their traditional cultures in their villages. So, I wash my  
hands of this, so....

34  
35 MR. ROACH: Mr. Chairman, I think we have a speaker.

36  
37 MR. LEE TITUS: Oh, go ahead, Gary.

38  
39 MR. NORTHWAY: A few of our Elders just came in and I'd  
like to invite them up. Enna and Darlene.

41  
42 MS. DARLENE JOHN: My name is Darlene John, and I  
represent Northway. And, first of all, I would like to talk  
about my lifestyle as I was growing up. It's kind of hard for  
me to sit up here. I lost my dad when I was year old and my  
mom had only three of us. There was one boy and two sisters,  
and my mom used to take us out from school in March. I didn't  
get my high school diploma, but I'm well educated for out in  
the wilderness. That's how my mom brought me up. And today

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

the way I understand it, you try to take everything away from us; that's how I look at it. You don't know how it's like to live here in the village and you out here in the cities where you can see city lights. You come out from work, you jump in your car and you go home, and you stop by -- on your way home, you stop by at the Safeway and grab yourself a hamburger to cook. We can't do that.

8

9           It's very hard for us villages to go to the cities and  
10 we how you live because of how we were brought up by our  
11 parents, by our grandmas and grandpas. And today you try to  
12 tell us how to live our life and how to go out and when to go  
13 out and where to go. It's so easy for you to go to  
14 supermarket, meat market. For us, we have to walk miles and  
15 miles and miles before we get anything for our supper that  
16 night. For these three little guys that's up here right now,  
17 one of them is my son and he's the only son I have, and I'm  
18 doing very hard, the best I could to teach him how to go on  
19 living on this subsistence life. State's giving out food  
20 stamps, all that good stuff. For I, myself, I can't even get  
21 that. And you try to tell me that I can't go out and get what  
22 want for my supper when you can't supporting me? It's not  
23 that easy to live out here in the village. For other people  
24 like you states to come over our neck and watch us to live our  
25 life, how we want to live, to bring our food to our tables, to  
26 our children, to our grandkids. Bad enough you give us  
27 license, we have to get license to go hunting, to go fishing.  
28 What more do we have to have to try to go on living?

29           I lost my dad when I was year old and my mom struggled  
30 through all these years without food stamps, without welfare,  
31 and that's how I was brought up out there. She take us out  
32 from school in March, we stay out till June hunting muskrat.  
33 What our dessert is going to be is what we call muskrat candy.  
34 That's our dessert. We don't run to store and grab an apple  
35 can of fruit for our dessert, ice cream. Making these laws  
36 for us, you're just taking everything away from us. These  
37 three little guys that just sat here a few minutes ago, I think  
38 they're the ones that's going to be the leader of this Northway  
39 after we lost our chief, Walter Northway. If you go by this  
40 now, what you say that where we're going to hunt, when we're  
41 going to hunt, where we're supposed to hunt, what we're  
42 supposed to get, you guys are going to shut the door to these  
43 three little guys here that's going to try to make a living off  
44 and whenever they get old enough to have their own family.

45

46           My mom used to take us out from school. We go out  
47 rapping for muskrat, we come back in June. During the  
48 summertime, we go out fishing, we move to fish camp, we cut the  
49 fish there. By fall time come, she take us out for berries,

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

She take us out for roots, those sweet roots, and then there is just enough time for us to go out and start cutting wood for winter. It's not that easy to live out here in this village, and you want to look over us, over our head and tell us how to live when you don't put our supper on our table. All those fancy words you have in those books, we don't even understand what you're talking about. You should try to break it down where we can understand it, where these Elders can understand it.

10

11 Like my cousin here, she's been a long ways, she know how it is to live off land. Our land is our Safeway market, if that's how you want to call it. We live off our land. We don't waste nothing. We get a moose, we don't throw away nothing. We're not out there just for trophy. For me, myself, from my heart, I believe in this community area, around the villages, from different villages, Native people, they should help each other. If they come to us and ask us if they want to hunt on our land, we should let our Native people hunt on our land, too. Share. That's how I feel in my heart. If you can go by the law and close everything down and what you're sitting out there for, you're just going to shut the door to these three little guys here, that's the ones that are going to be the leader of Northway. They're outgoing boys, they love their sport, and what's going to happen if one of them got slammed in the jail? It's easy for you to see, but it's not going to be easy for us Elders to see it when we know why he's out there and we know what he went out to get. That's all I can say.

29

30 MS. ENNA ALBERT: My name is Enna Albert from Northway. I don't have much to say, but whatever I think I'll just say. Like my sister say that we live out of land, you know, myself, just like the way she say we grow up out of land. My dad is Walter Northway. Now, my dad been out, around 6:00 in the morning, he go, come back at night just to feed us. We didn't even eat what you eat today. We are healthy out of when we live out in -- out of land. We never get sick like we sick today. Well, I say sickness, I remember ever since I was a little girl, I remember I never see the Elders people be sick. Today, a lot of the Elders people sick. Those days, the only time they die is when they get old, old age. Nowadays, we see all kinds of sickness. We should go back to where -- what food we been living on. We would never get sickness. That's I believe it. Even my dad been told us, "Don't eat things out of the store. That's where you get sickness." It's true. Canned stuff and all those things that we eat. And we -- you know, how I used to grow up, I'm just going to tell you how I used to grow up. We used to live out -- we never go to school. We go out in November. My dad is trapping. We stay out all

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

that time. Only three days for holiday. We come back on Christmas. We health, we strong, and we do a lot of work around our house, home. We're out in woods, we stay in tent all that months just to make a living.

5

6 That's true, you guys is coming out from city, come out from state, out from city, and we get tired of people try tell us what to do. We used to go out and do our business. We used to go out in the woods and go look for something to eat and nobody -- we don't have to be scared. Nowadays, when my kids go out fishing, I used to get scared for them. I don't want them broke law. We never been like that before. We go out hunt and it's nobody's business. We don't watch for nobody to watch us. Out on river, there is one man that I remember that he used to -- he belongs around here. He used to take his sugar and tea to go out. What do you think he take? He don't take no sandwich meat or bread or anything. He just go pick up tea and sugar; he go. He didn't have any blanket. He go out in woods and he get what he wants to eat for supper. Go moose hunting and stay overnight under big tree. Two, three days he been gone hunting, hunting moose.

22

23 In here, you people want to tell us what to do, want to look over us, try put the law for us Indian. You know, I'm not educated like you people. I'm not. I just made it to fourth grade and sometimes it just down me. But the like the way I look -- that's right, she said this book you bring it out, I look, I didn't -- I can -- I probably will read only two or three words. I just don't understand. I'm not educated, but I know I -- like she say, we are educated out of land. We know what to do, we know where to go, we know how to do it. That's the way we -- one of is my grandson that's sitting up here. He wants to go out right after school. They want to learn, but they're scared. I just don't know where -- I just don't know. We, as Indians, that we should look over on our lands and not state's people try tell us what to do. We should -- us Indians, we should just look on our kind and leave us alone. We've been living most so many years and the more you kill, the more moose come back. Nowadays, they make law for it and I don't know where they go, I can't see no moose any more. We used to live year-round killing moose. Those days, no one make law for us. That's all I can say.

43

44 MS. ADA GALLEN: I'm Ada Gallen from Northway. I grew up two family with -- at the world food. No food stamp, no welfare, nothing. My mom left me with five kids when I was 17 years old, and I grow them up with hunting and berries and everything. Now, I've got my own kids and they had school. They're going to have a lunch. I had to trap muskrat

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

year-round to get loaf of bread. I don't want to talk about it; it makes me sad. I used to go out trapping and get muskrat, sell those and get groceries. And only time I got five kids, only two months I get welfare. The white man gets -- they don't want to help me, but this little hand can handle, trap and sew, even I cut wood to sell for lunch. Now you have a permit for your wood, they say. How about they chop off their hand for that.

9

10 I make living with the worldly things. Two families I grow up and I don't want nobody telling me what not to do. We should make our own law. Alaska is ours. Sew, trap, hunting. My dad left me when I was 11 years old. I still pack, I still scratch around. So that's how I did with my own hand, with snowshoes, too. No snow-go or nothing. I had to walk. It makes me mad when they try to tell me not to kill moose, not to kill caribou. That's how we lived years ago. Put in freezer and it froze up and lose the taste up and I don't like. We could kill our moose right now if we needed. Just like Darlene say, we used to get berries for our dessert. That's what we still do right now.

22

23 MS. JOHN: I'd like to make one more comment now. Make, if we go to town, if we go to town from here, then if we go to McDonald's and have something to eat there and if we spend two days in town, we would all get gassed up from whatever you eat in the city. So, you know, we're not well -- we don't have that kind of money to go out to McDonald's and have whatever you eat out there. So, another thing, the way I feel, our community, our village council, and this whole community, they're the ones should tell State's people and Federal what to do. Instead, they come in and want to tell us people what to do and how to run our community. Us people in the village, we should tell them how to -- we should run our own village, how we want to run it. Instead we, like dummies, we have to have somebody from different states and different cities come in and tell us how to run our village, how to run our community. I think the village council and the community itself should tell them, step out to them and tell them that they're not going to tell us what to here in our community. That's all I can say.

42

43 Applause)

44

45 MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you. At this time, we'll take a 45-minute break and then we'll go back to some more discussions. Just a reminder that in our agenda review, we're going to go through the Federal proposals tomorrow at 1:00. If anybody wants to make any comments on certain proposals

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

pertaining to the Eastern Interior, we'll be going through those proposals at 1:00 tomorrow afternoon. We're going to take a 15-minute break.

4

5 (Off record; 3:00)

6 (On record)

7

8 MR. LEE TITUS: Just a reminder that we're going to have dinner later on this evening at, I don't know, probably around 6:00 for anybody that wants to stay around for dinner. We're still taking public comments if anybody wants to come up -- oh, we have two there. Go ahead and state your name for the record.

14

15 MR. TEDDY NORTHWAY: My name is Teddy Northway, Jr. I represent Northway. I've learned a lot from my father and I've learned too much off of this land and I don't want other people to tell me when and where to hunt. And for myself and my family, as one of the teams of this village, I am one of the hunters. I hunt this land and hunting is what I do best. When I hunt, I do not leave anything behind. This past State hunt, I saw one caribou lying there. It was all shot up. When other people come on our land, I don't want to see any anything -- leftovers. That's all I've got to say.

25

26 MR. GARY NORTHWAY: My name is Gary Northway and I was up here earlier. I know for years on end, my great-grandfathers have hunted this land, this region, free from rules and regulations. These were very smart people because they had set aside their own regulations and, as the seasons changed, they moved from camp to camp. They knew when was enough. But when the White came in, they set up these laws and regulations and for years our people, the Native people, did not understand these laws. And until recent years, we, the Natives, have finally been standing up for our rights.

36

37 And this is what I have to say: I've been living the traditional style of living and regardless of what your laws and regulations say, State and Federal, I'm going to go ahead and keep on living the Native style, the traditional Native style I've been living. We're a sovereign and we have a right to govern, we have a right to govern our tribe. Thank you.

43

44 MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you. Cheryl?

45

46 MS. CHERYL SILAS: Hi. My name is Cheryl Silas from Northway. I represent my community here in Northway. I work for the Northway Village Council. I'm up here to testify on our traditional grounds and how we gather here for potlatches

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

and any kind of gathering that we have here in Northway. It's all off of subsistence. Each and every one of us in this community were brought up off of subsistence. Many times I've heard over the years that the Native people are hostile people. When something like this comes up, yeah, it makes us hostile down to our hearts. My mother spoke here earlier and she spoke of how she was brought up. I'm the eldest of five sisters and one brother. Sitting next to me is my youngest brother. I'm 94 years old and he's 16 years old. In between that time, my mother and my father brought us up off of subsistence. Like she said, there was no welfare, no food stamps or anything like that to bring us up. My father told me once, out of all of us, me being the oldest, I was the hardest one to bring in money for to feed me milk, to change my diapers. He said that I was the hardest one. He had to get up early in the morning and go check his trapline, hoping that there was something in his trapline so that he can bring milk home for me to feed.

18

19 It gets pretty heartbreaking and it gets pretty hard on our people when you try to bring in regulations to tell us where we can and cannot hunt. Try to be fair with us and we'll be fair with you.

23

24 MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you, Cheryl. Thank you, guys. Anybody else have comments?

26

27 MR. JERRY ISAAC: I really don't have any fancy for fanfare or anything, but, you know, that's what I was referring to. My name is Jerry Isaac. I've been the president of the Tanacross IRA Tribal Council for -- since 1980. And before I make any statements, I came here with this confusion as I started out from my village. I wanted to know where all this C&T fit in concerning what I was doing today. I was back in the village before I came over here and that I was fancying myself with the cattle that we're were raising, you know. I was wondering, and really wondering, where all this C&T would apply to the cattle that we're raising. So, anyway, with that I guess I'll always be confused on that one particular subject.

39

40

41 Anyway, there's things that I need to say. I understand that this board is charged with the duty to come up with a determination concerning fish and game use. I have been quiet long enough. As a person, as a leader, I've always lent credence to a man's ability to reason and to reason sensibly in all fairness and equality. At times I get a feeling that being Native alone makes me be treated like I'm the bottom rung on the ladder. To tell you the truth, I sat on the Tanana Chiefs Executive board in 1990 when the Federal government, the

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515



Federal agencies had taken over the management and control of fish and game on all Federal lands in the State of Alaska. Quietly, by myself, I welcomed that. At least we would be dealing with people that have the sense to listen. I'm sorry to say, but I have never felt that kind of sense of relief and comfort with the Alaska Fish and Game Department. That's simply put. The bottom line is it's a fact, it's a fact that I was born and raised in this little village nobody knows about, but it's called Tanacross. I went to Western society's educational institution. I learned their concepts, I learned their language, I learned every damn thing I should know or should learn. I've never graduated from college. In fact, I failed in that institution. But I graduated from a subsistence lifestyle, and the way we respect land, the spirits of the living things that live off of these lands.

16

17 You are charged with duty to determine the customary and traditional usage. After consultation with several of the leaders, I would like to state our interim position of the Tanacross Village Council and its people; is that we would support something in terms of Option B or C on an interim basis. But I would like to recommend that these -- this interim position be revisited at a later date when we can come up with different languages. There are problems with the language.

26

27 In any case, I feel comfortable and I would like to commend some Refuge staff that had done everything they could last year to assist us in drafting up languages. I forget the guy's name, but there's a couple of them here, Cherie Marunde and Sue Matthews. I'd like to commend their department for doing what they could to assist us in traversing the two different realms of game management. All in all, it seems to me that there are many conceptual differences that we're working out and it would take more than a hundred meetings to come to resolve issues on a common basis. But, there, it remains. I am fearful. I'd like to, before I depart, relate a story with you and I'd like this advisory board to keep this -- to take this into consideration and take it seriously.

40

As of September 20th of 1985, I have -- as a person, as a citizen, and a tribal member of the Village of Tanacross, I have resolved to never hunt the Fortymile Caribou Herd again, not because of my reverence for the wildlife, but the way I felt I was treated unfairly by the State of Alaska's enforcement agencies. My father is an Elder. We drove up the Fortymile since the caribou had finally started crossing the Taylor Highway on the 20th of September 1985. The Alaska Fish and Game enforcement officer was running up and down the Taylor Highway watching every local person as to what -- which sex

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

they were shooting at, in terms of the caribou. And then  
 Nightfall came and my father and I decided to depart back for  
 Bome and, lo and behold, three miles up the exit where the  
 Taylor Highway connects with the Alaska Highway, the Fish and  
 Game enforcement officer was sitting there with his lights on  
 stopping everyone going back down to the highway to get back to  
 their homes. I wonder if this Fish and Game officer,  
 enforcement officer flies to every fly-in hunting campgrounds  
 and enforce by this means. Or is it just on the local people?

10

11 To me, it smacks of racist, discriminatory practice and  
 12resent that. I think I treat all people on the basis of  
 fairness and equality. I try to at least understand. The  
 14ast I can ask anyone is to respect me along these lines.  
 Thank you for your time.

16

17 MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you, Jerry.

18

19 MR. EDDIE DEMIT: Hi, I'm Eddie Demit, and I'm here to  
 make a comment on C&T. There's a few of us without a job and  
 we don't have any choice but subsistence and trapping. So, we  
 go out and break your laws hunting, and we don't have any  
 choice but to hunt, or starve. And I was brought up on  
 subsistence by my grandmother and we followed the game as they  
 moved. I was brought up in a tent in my childhood years. So,  
 people that were making laws, they have their paychecks coming  
 every two weeks or so, you know, and they don't consider the  
 native people that don't have a job that live by hunting,  
 trapping, and whatever, fishing. So, now they're making up new  
 laws so we could, you know, sneak around like, you know. I  
 don't like that. And I've heard that there's going to be some  
 boundaries on where we should hunt, where we should trap, and  
 I'm against that, too. I'm all for subsistence lifestyle.  
 Thank you.

35

36 MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you, Eddie. Is there any more  
 comments from the public?

38

39 MS. ROSE ISAAC: Hello, my name is Rose Isaac from  
 Tanacross, Alaska. I am the subregional director of the Upper  
 Tanana Subregion, a consortium of the Tanana Chiefs Conference  
 located in Tok. The Upper Tanana Subregional Office is in  
 complete full support of whatever the village councils of Dot  
 Lake, Northway, Tanacross, and Tetlin would like to do.  
 Personally, as a tribal member of Tanacross, I really don't  
 think there should be no question on the customary and  
 traditional usage of any of these villages as my people have  
 always hunted and gathered to sustain our way of life. It is  
 our life. Our whole being exists because of our way of life.

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
 277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
 272-7515

1  
2 The people of these villages are closely tied in our  
3 culture, our tradition, and our language. Getting down to the  
4 moose and the caribou, we have utilized the complete animal  
5 whether it's the head, the brain, the nose, the stomach which  
6 to me is the most delicate part of the entire animal, including  
7 the heart and the liver. The muscle is made into sinews.  
8 These are what my grandmothers used as threads to sew our  
9occasins and our clothing. People from the White society, the  
10 Western society, even today refer to my grandmother and my  
11 grandfather's clothing as "costumes." I have always resented  
12 that. They are clothes. Those are the clothes that my people  
13 have utilized completely from the animal that walked on this  
14 land. Just how many people in this building can stand up and  
15 proudly say I have eaten a moose stomach? The Native people  
16 would, I know that for a fact.

17  
18 We are not sport hunters. My people do not go out and  
19 hunt these animals and put the head it's stuffed on our living  
20 room. We actually eat the head. I, too, have had some  
21 experience with the Fortymile Herd. In fact, I testified to  
22 the Alaska State Board of Game in Anchorage. I had made some  
23 damaging statements at that -- on that date. By the time the  
24 quota is reached, my people cannot afford airplanes. This kind  
25 hunting season, any time, if you're in the area and you're  
26 Tok, take a drive by Fortymile Air. Take a look at all the  
27 sport hunters. You'll be amazed what kind of license those --  
28 and how far people come to go out into the Fortymile country  
29 and to hunt caribou so that they can bring that caribou back  
30 and stuff its head and put it on their wall.

31  
32 There are hundreds of animals that are being  
33 slaughtered for what? So people can stuff the head and put it  
34 on their wall. By the time the quota is reached, it's too late  
35 for my people to go out there and even get one animal. We also  
36 feel that the regulations should correlate very closely with my  
37 people's way of life, meaning that we would like to take the  
38 meat when the animal is in its prime and that's usually in July  
39 and August.

40  
41 Finally, I would like to commend Sue Matthews and her  
42 staff of Tetlin Wildlife Refuge for assisting myself and my  
43 staff with everything they have done on the C&T. I also would  
44 like to commend Janis Meldrum of National Park Service from  
45 Anchorage. She, too, has done everything she could to work  
46 with my office. Thank you.

47  
48 MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you, Rose. Vince?  
49

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

1 MR. MATHEWS: Mr. Chairman, it seems like we're at the  
 2 phase of comments on this and I feel obligated to read into the  
 3 record the letter from Southcentral Regional Council on this.

4  
 5 MR. LEE TITUS: Yeah, I was just going to....

6  
 7 MR. MATHEWS: Would you like me to do that at this  
 8 time?

9  
 10 MR. LEE TITUS: Sure. It's from Roy Ewan? The one  
 11 from Roy Ewan?

12  
 13 MR. MATHEWS: Yes.

14  
 15 MR. LEE TITUS: Okay.

16  
 17 MR. MATHEWS: Okay. I'll go ahead with that. This is  
 18 Southcentral Alaska Subsistence Regional Advisory Council,  
 19 February 28th, 1995 to the Eastern Interior Regional Advisory  
 20 Council through Ms. Janis Meldrum of the National Park Service.  
 21 Dear Sirs: As the Southcentral Regional Subsistence Advisory  
 22 Council, we would like to express our concerns with some of the  
 23 suggested findings on C&T in the Upper Tanana Region. While  
 24 all of those communities share access to the road system and  
 25 are in relatively close proximity," I think it is, "to each  
 26 other, there seems to be a greater findings for some of the  
 27 larger and newer communities. When we compare this with  
 28 current mobility and the oral information and relationships of  
 29 members of this Council, we feel that this may be the result of  
 30 incomplete information or even a reluctance on the part of some  
 31 cultures to share information or even see the need to provide  
 32 this type of information. In summary, we can see an apparent  
 33 inequity when the oldest communities have a C&T finding on a  
 34 smaller area of land than the newer communities. Roy Ewan,  
 35 Chair of the Southcentral Council."

36  
 37 I also want to remind the Council that within reason at  
 38 800 or thereof was going to be a discussion of the  
 39 Environmental Impact Statement Process associated with  
 40 expanding or dealing with military operations in Alaska. So, I  
 41 noticed that both staffs from the Air Force and Ecological  
 42 Services are here and will need -- I think they'll need at  
 43 least five minutes or so to set up when you do desire to have  
 44 them present their materials. Thank you.

45  
 46 MR. LEE TITUS: They're not here yet, huh? They're not  
 47 here yet?

48  
 49 MR. MATHEWS: Oh, they're here.

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
 277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
 272-7515

1  
2 MR. LEE TITUS: Oh, they're here? Oh, okay. I was  
3 booking for....

4  
5 MR. MATHEWS: I didn't want to break what you were  
6 doing. I just wanted to remind you of that.

7  
8 MR. LEE TITUS: Okay. Do we have any more comments  
9 from the public? Keith?

10  
11 MR. KEITH JONATHAN: My name is Keith Jonathan. I'm  
12 from Tanacross. I sit on that Tanacross Tribal Council  
13 and I'd like to put some comments in this C&T. The first thing  
14 I would like to say about the C&T is that I hope they could  
15 leave it open and then send each one of us back to our villages  
16 so we could decide on which options to support. I don't feel  
17 very good making decisions on people at home, not knowing what  
18 decisions to support. And on the -- I had attended meetings in  
19 Tok on the C&T and it was on the Fortymile Herd. We had  
20 problems before when the Fortymile Herds head toward Taylor  
21 Mountain. By the time we get up there, there's people that's  
22 lying in to Molly Creek that's cutting the herds off until --  
23 so they never get to the road. They cut them off there and  
24 then by the time the hunting season is closed, we've got to get  
25 out of there and they cross after it's closed. So we never get  
26 a chance to get our hunting done up there and not getting any  
27 up there, leads us to come up around Northway area to do our  
28 hunting.

29  
30 On that boundary line, I don't feel we need any  
31 boundary lines. We never did have it. There's people a long  
32 time ago got along good, respected each other's hunting  
33 grounds, and I think the -- let's see, we always hunted  
34 whenever we wanted to get some meat and I had -- all that  
35 hunting season they're putting on, we never did -- we just  
36 hunted whenever we wanted to.

37  
38 On hunting, we always hunted down toward Copper River  
39 just the Upper Tanana area. We never had any problems when  
40 there was salmon run. We had -- we've got some relatives  
41 down toward Copper area, through my dad who is from down that way.  
42 They'd always call after they catch all their salmon and tell  
43 us to come down to pick our -- get some fish for the winter.

44  
45 I just got on this advisory committee and a couple  
46 years now, and there wasn't very many participation in this  
47 around our area. And even yet, we need a lot more people  
48 coming up here. We need leaders going back. And it was good  
49 to see the kids here protecting their hunting rights. And it's  
50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

Good to see the Elders up here. I'd like to see that more around our home area. And hunting for me has gotten even harder right now because of an injury I got on my hip and it's limited me from even simple road-hunting. To get out of truck and shoot will take me time and there's times I lost a moose not being able to stand in boat, sitting down in a boat for periods of time or even camping out. And we always had used subsistence for our tribal gatherings and all our potlatches and now we're going to need it even more for hunting for our Elders who won't be able to hunt for themselves any more. And need the hunting to go on for our children. That's all I have for now, Mr. Chairman. Thank you for your time.

13

14 MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you, Keith. At this time, before we take further comments, I guess we'll have the U.S. Air Force and U.S. Fish and Wildlife prepare for their presentation on the Environmental Impact Military Operations in Alaska. I believe we went over this at our last council meeting in Tok, but only portions of that. Jeff?

20

21 MR. ROACH: Mr. Chairman, I suggest we take a 10-minute break and allow them to set up and begin again at 4:00.

23

24 MR. LEE TITUS: Okay. We'll take a 10-minute break.

25

26 (Off record)

27 (On record; 4:00)

28

29 MR. LEE TITUS: Okay. We're at the -- we're going to have the presentation of the Update and Status Report on the Draft Environmental Impact for adjustments to military operations in Alaska. And with that,....

33

34 LT. COL. SITER: Thank you, Mr. Titus. I'd like to thank the Eastern Interior Subsistence Council for giving us the opportunity to come and talk with you today about our proposal. And that's exactly what it is, it's a proposal. We're more than nine months away from a decision, and we've been out in the public for about two years. Again, the Environmental Impact Statement process is a very lengthy one, and necessary, so that we can get as much input from the public, from the agencies. We've been working with the tribal councils, the CATG, a lot of people. The idea is to get a lot of input, put that input into analysis and take a look and study it very closely so that the best decision can be made.

46

47 So, the reasons why the Air Force has come to the public to explain why it needs to adjust airspace in Alaska starts with -- we have changing training needs. Part of the

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

change with the Cold War going away is that the Air Force, as well as the overall military, has significantly changed where it has based its forces. We used to have a lot more forces overseas. A lot of those forces have come back from there and have been based in the United States. The missions that we train to be ready to go to combat have also been adjusted, but yet the airspace we have in Alaska has been the same since 1976, and it met our need back then nearly 20 years ago, but today because of all these changes around the world and in the United States, adjustments are being reviewed so that we can better meet our training requirements and our readiness training requirements.

13

14 Additionally, Alaska holds a special position in the world as a crossroads, both for international commercial aviation but also for the military. Aircraft from Alaska can reach Europe and Asia a lot easier than aircraft can from the lower 48; again, Alaska being an important part of the National Defense Policy. Another reason why we use the Environmental Impact Statement process, again, I alluded to earlier is that we want up-front participation. The EIS process forces that upon the Federal agency to get, again, the maximum up-front input from the public and from the various agencies: State, Federal, local, and Native. Also, to save tax dollars. We've been using airspace structure -- you'll note there's a lot of blue designated airspace on the outside here. The green airspace is that airspace I talked about earlier, created over 20 years ago. The blue airspace, we applied for that and we've been using that airspace for a long time. And every time we ask to use that airspace, we spend a lot of money, hundreds of thousands of dollars a year, and we've spent several million dollars over the last couple years in bureaucratic red-tape paperwork to get that airspace activated to do exercises. And it's our belief that we can save the taxpayers millions of dollars over the next couple of years by charting this airspace so that we have access to it, one, and we don't have to go through this repetitive process to get airspace.

39

40 And the last thing is improved flight safety. This blue airspace is never charted on maps. So, when it's activated, civil aviators oftentimes do not know that that airspace is being used by the military. And we don't want to keep anybody out; we just want to let them know where we are and how we're training. That's why these boxes were created a long, long time ago. It wasn't to keep anybody out; it was to keep us inside of those boxes so people would know where to look for us. Okay. And so we want to try to have these charted so people know where we are.

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

1  
2       The approach is we wanted to go with an Environmental  
3 Impact Statement versus an Environmental Assessment because  
4 Environmental Assessments do not necessarily involve the public  
5 talking to us before a decision is made. The Environmental  
6 Impact Statement, however, forces that. Essentially, it's a  
7 process again: Information up front, decision at the end. It  
8 involves, obviously, the public quite extensively.

9  
10       Some key points: I mentioned earlier that this is a  
11 proposal. Okay. We're still more than nine months away from a  
12 decision. Realize, whenever you're dealing with airspace in  
13 the United States, the Federal Aviation Administration is the  
14 final approving authority for any airspace decision. The Air  
15 Force does not have final approval authority for this. We make  
16 a recommendation and then they do an additional review of their  
17 own before a final decision is rendered. The proposal doesn't  
18 increase the overall military flying in the state. This is not  
19 about bringing more aircraft into the state. Right now there  
20 are limits on the number of aircraft we can fly out of our  
21 airports, and this is about restructuring airspace that we  
22 already have access to. Okay. So it's restructure; not an  
23 increase of the overall flying. Again, it doesn't change the  
24 existing right of the public to use aviation, for example, to  
25 subsistence hunt. These airspaces are joint-use airspaces,  
26 meaning that the military does not have exclusive use of the  
27 airspace. It is shared with the public.

28  
29       And then the last thing is we're committed through the  
30 public process to adjusting the proposal. We've made  
31 significant adjustments already. And one of the reasons why  
32 the Council has asked us to come talk today is that after we  
33 issued our Draft Environmental Impact Statement, the public had  
34 the opportunity in hearings throughout the state and we are  
35 essentially up at a lot of places like Arctic Village, Venetie,  
36 Fort Yukon, Chalkyitsik, Eagle, we were down in Tok, and many  
37 other places around the state and the western side of the  
38 state, with the idea of we put out an initial level of analysis  
39 to see what the public thought about our analysis, whether we  
40 had been thorough, whether there were other inputs that maybe  
41 we were not aware of. And so we did that last fall. We've now  
42 taken quite a bit of comment from the public. Of course, in  
43 our own analysis, we did find impact; some of it significant.  
44 And our -- Susan is going to talk in a little bit about the  
45 subsistence area because, obviously, that's of prime importance  
46 to you. And, well, now we have to look at how can we address  
47 those impacts? How do we find that balance? We need to  
48 gain, but we also have to show concern and our actions have to  
49 show a concern for the environment. How do we find that

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515



Balance?

2

3           Again, the proposal is to adjust and upgrade Alaskan  
MOAs. We want to modify some of our existing MOAs, not by  
5 changing where they're located, but in some instances we're  
6 either raising floors or lowering floors. We're also looking  
7 to convert these existing two MOAs - as I mentioned earlier,  
8 they're charted on maps - so that they will be charted. We're  
9 also looking to get connection to our bombing ranges. It's  
10 kind of interesting, back in the Second World War, the bombing  
11 ranges that we have today, they were created. Unfortunately,  
12 when they were created, they weren't connected to these  
13 military operating areas. And so that's caused serious  
14 problems for our ability to train. We have this airspace and  
15 it's not connected to where we actually have the ability to  
16 drop a bomb on an impact area that's essentially safe, which is  
17 away from everybody. And we want to have just the ability to  
18 get to the bombing ranges from our airspace and then back out.  
19 We're not looking to maneuver. You'll note the Buffalo MOA  
20 which is of concern in this area is over -- Dot Lake is on the  
21 eastern side of the airspace and Delta Junction near the  
22 western side. This airspace, unlike the other airspaces, is  
23 not an airspace where we would do turning and fighting, but  
24 rather would simply be to get from this part of the airspace to  
25 the bombing range and back. We call that navigation as opposed  
26 to fighting or maneuvering, if you will. So, we're looking to  
27 do that.

28

29           And then the last thing is, Alaska, because of the  
30 airspace array and the fact that we had overseas training that  
31 we've lost -- for example, we used to do a lot of our training  
32 in the Philippines. Well, we're no longer able to train there,  
33 so we brought a lot of our training, as I mentioned earlier,  
34 back to America. And so this is an area where we train our  
35 forces from the Pacific Theater, from Korea, from Japan. And  
36 we know that that's of concern to you because it's just not  
37 Alaskans flying in this airspace. How do they think about and  
38 what do they feel about respect for the Alaskan environment?  
39 Well, we have a team of people who put these exercises  
40 together. Their sole purpose in life is essentially articulate  
41 the rules to the pilots who visit, to train them before they  
42 fly, put them out in a familiarization ride. Before they fly  
43 any kind of training mission, they have to go out on a  
44 navigation mission and fly around the airspace, look at the map  
45 that has all the environmentally sensitive areas on the map,  
46 and then the next day they can fly in a combat mission, if you  
47 will. What happens if they mess up? If they essentially go  
48 through some of the environmentally sensitive areas, they get  
49 sent home. And in some instances, they've lost their jobs.

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

We've had squadron commanders sent home and they essentially were out of the Air Force before too long.

3

4 The point is, there's a commitment to try to comply and we have a strong enforcement program and we're again trying to be responsive to the public. We've added a lot of things like an 800 service so that we are accessible to input. If we've done something wrong, a lot of times we sometimes are not even aware we've done something wrong. Sometimes it's misperception. Okay. We want to clear that up. And so we're trying to be more accessible through the 800 service. We're also trying to share radar systems. We have new radar systems in the Interior here that now show aircraft at lower altitudes that the FAA can't show. Well, the military doesn't want to keep that information to itself. We want to share that information so that we all can fly together more safely.

17

18 Yes, sir?

19

20 MR. GOLTZ: Is the word "MOAs" in the dictionary?

21

22 LT. COL. SITER: I'm sorry, sir?

23

24 MR. GOLTZ: M-O-A-S. Is that in my dictionary?

25

26 LT. COL. SITER: What that stands for is Military Operations Area. Again, those are these boxes of airspace that confine where we can fly. Okay. It's just a technical term for a box of airspace.

30

31 What's our goal? Our goal is to find a balance. Okay. And the public process is helping us to do that, whether it's working with the CATG resource advisors from Native councils, whether it's working with the Fairbanks Borough -- North Star Borough Council, with the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, the Department of Interior. That's what it's all about. We're trying to find a balance between our mandate to have a strong national defense, the ability to do readiness training, but also to show respect and concern for the Alaska environment and its citizens. So, we want to respond. We've been out, literally, in a hundred forums. Whenever we go out, we try to go to as many villages as we can. We want to maintain open communications. We're committed for formalizing the communication channels over the long-term. This is not just about the Environmental Impact Statement; it's about dialogue into the next century. Exactly -- and we want to be more real-time about where animals calve so that we don't fly in those areas when they calve. But we need help to find out where they are and the idea is to set up committees so that we can be

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

responsive and real-time deconflict these critical life-cycle patterns from our flying.

3

4 We also want to have, you know, include reasonable  
5 recommendations as they occur. Very productive in the last --  
6 this last fall. We got some very specific recommendations on  
7 how we could change how we fly. For example, some of the  
8 things we're now going to study, because they were offered to  
9 us, is in Yukon 3, you see Eagle is up here, and Chicken, this  
10 whole area, we're looking to raise the floor of that area.  
11 Instead of having it at 100 feet above the ground - certainly  
12 low - is to raise that to 2,000 feet above the ground and  
13 reduce the impacts that you have on the large-hoofed animals  
14 and other wildlife. We're also looking in Yukon 5, in the  
15 Chalkyitsik area east of Fort Yukon. You'll note that even  
16 though a lot of these villages that are out here aren't in the  
17 airspace, they're affected because they subsistence hunt in  
18 this area here. We've raised the floor of that area; we're  
19 analyzing it now for 5,000 feet above the ground. The reason  
20 being is these areas are much further away from our bombing  
21 ranges and the further away airspace is from where we have to  
22 our bombing events, the less we need to have lower altitude  
23 airspace. Okay. We need it more essential to here than we do  
24 at the periphery, out on the perimeter, if you will.

25

26 We're also making changes to the Fox MOA here. Again,  
27 this is a subsistence area and a high recreation area. Floor  
28 of Fox is being raised to 5,000 feet and we're actually cutting  
29 off a large area here on the eastern corner that's a high  
30 recreation use area, trumpeter swans, a lot of waterfowl. The  
31 same thing with wild and scenic rivers. A lot of people either  
32 subsistence hunt along the drainages or they recreate and we're  
33 looking at mitigating along some of key rivers around the  
34 state. Again, trying to minimize our impact, trying to find  
35 that balance. We don't need to train at low altitude  
36 everywhere. We just need to have a representative amount that  
37 we can reach.

38

39 Where were the impacts? One of the things I'm going to  
40 throw up now, the Airspace Management Aviation Safety, one of  
41 the key things that I note because it goes to the Northway area  
42 all the way through Tok, all the way up to Fairbanks through  
43 Delta Junction, a lot of people are concerned because aviation  
44 is a way of life. I mean it's unlike any other state in the  
45 Union. We're dependent upon aviation to literally lift and,  
46 obviously, if we have high-speed military aircraft coming  
47 through these connecting MOAs, it affects what's going on in  
48 the VFR flyway. Additionally, we have an alternative, it's  
49 called Alternative B, that it actually involves airspace over

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

Here in the Tok area, all the way through here. We have also analyzed that, to see can that airspace meet our training need via some airspace up here. And so we've looked at that, also. How is that affecting -- and one of the things we're looking at now is instead of having the Air Force have a MOA that goes through the whole altitude structure and just having us essentially fly and mix it up, if you will, maybe we can deconflict our flying. Have aircraft, our aircraft at one altitude and civilian altitude at another. So, you'd have the choice of flying at an altitude that you'd have sanctuary. Okay. And what we're looking at here now is these connecting MOAs, is essentially saying the military will not fly at 100 feet AGL; we'll bring our altitude up here. Civil aviation, if they want to fly low because there's poor weather will have the opportunity to have the lowest altitude. Okay. We would have the next altitude here, and then we offer the civilians the standard VFR hemispheric altitudes that you all use for VFR navigation and then over in the Buffalo MOA, we would have some high airspace over that. So, we have a high-weather option.

20

21 So, the idea is that we -- if one of the ways to make  
22 the aviation a little safer is to take a look at where there's  
23 much traffic and we know in the summertime and even  
24 year-round, there's a lot of traffic here, maybe we can do some  
25 segmentation and make it safer. We also had other impacts and  
26 am going to let my associate, Susan, come up and talk about  
27 wildlife, recreation, and sub- -- actually, wildlife and  
28 subsistence being the focus, given the forum that's here today.  
29 Okay.

30

31 MS. SUSAN MEANS: When we sat down to work on this EIS,  
32 the first thing we did was take a look at some existing EISs  
33 and other literature and try to find out if there was a  
34 methodology already in place for assessing potential impacts to  
35 subsistence from aircraft overflights from low-altitude  
36 aircraft activity. And there wasn't anything that we could  
37 use, so we were faced with trying to develop our own. We  
38 looked at some other literature out there and developed, based  
39 on discussions with agencies, with U.S. Fish and Wildlife  
40 Service, and ADF&G and some of the management agencies based on  
41 discussions that took place during the scoping where we went  
42 out and met with people in affected villages, and based on a  
43 review of the literature to look at potential impacts on  
44 wildlife species that are subsistence resources, we came up  
45 with a methodology. And the approach was first to identify the  
46 communities that would underlie the MOAs or be adjacent to them  
47 and would presumably have subsistence use areas that could be  
48 affected by these aircraft operations, and we mapped those out.

49

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

1  
2 We also assigned a sensitivity ranking to the affected  
3 communities and that sensitivity ranking was based on three  
4 things. It was based on the amount of subsistence use area  
5 that was likely to underlie a MOA use of airspace and was the  
6 majority of a community subsistence use area likely to be under  
7 a MOA. The second the percent of population of an individual  
8 community that was Alaskan Native, and the third thing was the  
9 degree to which the community had a cash- or a wage-based  
10 economy versus a purely subsistence economy. So, using those  
11 three factors we,....

12  
13 MR. LEE TITUS: Please speak into the mike. Some  
14 people can't hear back there.

15  
16 MS. MEANS: Directly into it? All right. Thanks. Do  
17 you want me to start over?

18  
19 (Audience laughter)

20  
21 MS. MEANS: Well, it's so fascinating. All right. So,  
22 using those three criteria, we ranked communities as either  
23 having a high, medium, or a low sensitivity to any impact,  
24 whatever it might be, to their subsistence resources or to  
25 their ability to conduct subsistence activities. And that  
26 ranking was really critical as we moved into the attempt to  
27 assess potential impacts. We then predicted impacts, based on  
28 the degree to which the resource availability, in this case  
29 wildlife, could be diminished by the proposed or alternative  
30 actions. And that finding relied heavily on the assessment  
31 that was conducted by our biologist for the potential to impact  
32 wildlife resources. Were caribou likely to be affected by low-  
33 altitude aircraft overflights? Were moose likely to be  
34 affected and to what degree? Would they suffer significant  
35 adverse impacts, adverse impacts, or something less?

36  
37 The second thing we looked at was the level, type,  
38 seasons, et cetera, of subsistence activities that would take  
39 place under a MOA, and the third thing, of course, was the  
40 sensitivity ranking that we used. The impact levels that we  
41 assigned were Level 1, 2, and 3. Level 1 was considered a  
42 negligible impact. It's safe to say that if an aircraft flies  
43 over you or a moose or a caribou or anything, there is some  
44 impact. But if it occurs very infrequently at high altitude,  
45 whatever, then it's probably fairly safe to say that that's a  
46 negligible impact. If there's a lot of overflight, if it's  
47 occurring during a sensitive period of time, then it might be  
48 moving into something more akin to an adverse or a  
49 significantly adverse impact. So, we assigned three levels of  
50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

impact, Level 1, Level 2, and Level 3. And, again, a community sensitivity ranking was the deciding factor in most cases, particularly between assessing an impact level at a Level 2, an adverse impact, or Level 3. If we were dealing with a community that we had ranked as having a high sensitivity to any impact to subsistence resources or subsistence activities, it was accorded a Level 3, or a significant adverse impact ranking.

9  
10 And so with that in mind, these are the communities  
that we came up with. Under the proposed action, we identified  
Level 3 impacts, or significant adverse impact, to three  
communities. Up here in this airspace down in the southeast  
quadrant, we identified Level 3 significant adverse impacts to  
the community of Eagle Village. There. And also to the  
communities of Healy Lake and Dot Lake under the Buffalo MOA.  
Now, these impacts were predicted to occur during the August  
and September hunting season and when there would be MFE, when  
there would be major flying exercises going on, large-scale  
exercises. Level 2, or adverse but not significantly impacts,  
were identified for the communities of Central and Eagle, not  
Eagle Village, and Chicken. And, again, the impacts would be  
expected to occur primarily during the fall hunts, during  
August and September.

25  
26 We also looked at another alternative which Bob talked  
about, which we called Alternative B, and that would be  
establish airspace down here called the Tanana MOA.

29  
30 LT. COL. SITER: Substituting for airspace up here  
would be -- we looked at an alternative of putting airspace  
here and removing airspace here.

33  
34 MS. MEANS: Right. And as far as subsistence was  
concerned, that actually winds up, using our methodology, with  
having a more -- more impact on more communities and, in one  
case, more impact throughout the year. We would still wind up  
with Level 2 impacts to the community of Central, to Chicken,  
and to Eagle; Level 3 impacts to Eagle Village; Level 3 impacts  
to Dot Lake, Healy Lake, and Tanacross because of the use areas  
that would occur now under the Buffalo MOA as well as the  
Tanana MOA. That was it. Any questions?

43  
44 LT. COL. SITER: When we mention impacts, one of the  
things that we have already started to deal with, we're not --  
for example, we're doing exercises already. And so as we have  
gone out to the public and talked about some of the changes we  
would like to make, we've made adjustments already. For  
example, the exercise schedule. We mentioned that subsistence,  
50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

realizing it goes around year-round, still has some focus in August and September. What the Air Force is committed to now is that we're now no longer scheduling any exercises in September, trying again to reduce the amount of impact that we have and so we don't want to concentrate aircraft during, again, a time where people are trying to get their animals. And other things have changed. For example, I pointed out some of the floor changes, raising floors. Again, collectively trying to find that balance so that wildlife resources are not put under extreme pressure.

11

12 And what I'd like to do -- I know we've talked a little while. I'd rather spend the rest of the time and answer questions or issues or concerns that you might have. I can give you a time line right now just so you kind of keep abreast of what's next. I mentioned that we're now in the process of analyzing all the input that the public has given to us, okay, with the idea -- again, these were hearings this past fall. Our goal is to produce a document back to the public in the late summer time-frame with the idea of being able to issue a record decision, realizing the FAA will have to then take this decision and assess it for itself. Again, as a national airspace manager, they have the final say on exactly what will happen. But, again, we have a newsletter that's going out to the public. In fact, we just started mailing it out. If you're not on our mailing list, and we have literally over 700 Alaskans on the mailing list, I can take your name and make sure you get a full newsletter. It's about eight pages and it goes through a lot of the things that we have put out initiatives on. For example, we have a couple of councils that we now are part of with the civilian -- the Alaskan civilian population. One of them is -- it's an aviation form. What it is, is so many Alaskans fly and so many different types of users fly that the Air Force, going through this EIS process, what we've discovered is we figure out exactly what each other is doing with enough advance warning, we can work out our flying with theirs. For example, just the other day, 48 hours ago, I got called by the National Park Service and the U.S. Fish and Wildlife. They're doing a wolf study in the Yukon-Charlie Drainage -- in the Charlie Drainage, excuse me. Well, we're also involved in an exercise during that same time period. They called us up and said is there a way that we can adjust our exercise and altitudes in that area so that they can do their wolf study. Because they're going to be looking for wolves visually. They won't have collars on them, so they're going to be heads-down. Well, obviously, us, in the Air Force, we don't want to be flying around where maybe people can't look and see and avoid as well as they might because they have a job to do. Well, what we've done is we've set up a no-fly area

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

over that whole study area and we'll stay above 7,000 feet above mean sea level. So, the idea is they can do their study unimpeded, not worry about us hitting them or vice versa. Those are the kind of things, if they're done in advance, we can work those things out.

6

7 We're finding out as we talk that we don't have as much as a conflict as we might have thought we had in the past. Another type of committee that's been formed is called a Resource Protection Committee. For example, a lot of the resource agencies have a pretty good idea of where animals calve, where they rut, and we have been gathering that information from them, but those things do change a bit. The Native population has also told us a lot about where the animals are and we want to take those types of inputs and make them real-time so that season-to-season we're adjusting exactly where we're not flying. Okay. So, we don't want to do it on some predicted place because we might affect animals that if we just knew where they were, we could move the area where we aren't supposed to fly. And so we want a committee that gets us that information real-time to the best of their ability.

22

23 Another thing is studies. We don't have all the answers. We're using as best of state-of-the-art research that's available in the United States, but we're not satisfied to say, hey, we know enough. You know, we want to continue to monitoring studies of the animals. We're doing noise studies. We've been doing for several years noise study -- putting boom boxes and sound boxes out, watching animals as we fly over. I mean, funded studies from the Air Force. The reason being is if we can better understand what's going on, then maybe we can make more adjustments to the airspace. So, it's tailored to find that balance. We're not satisfied that this record decision that's going to come up in November, we hope, is going to be the final answer. We need to have a mechanism that gets us the help we need to help keep it going because the balance is not always going to be there. We want to make sure it stays in balance. Okay.

39

40 Are there questions out there? I don't want to take up more time than -- are there questions about the project or where we're going? Anything else from anybody?

43

44 MR. LEE TITUS: I have a question.

45

46 LT. COL. SITER: Yes, sir.

47

48 MR. LEE TITUS: On your low-level flying, you do that far-round?

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515



1  
 2 LT. COL. SITER: Yes, sir, we do, realizing in the  
 winter, the weather is usually a little poorer so it's a little  
 more difficult for us to fly at low altitudes than, obviously,  
 when the weather is more fair weather like in the summer. But  
 we do train year-round. That's a skill that you don't --  
 certain things that we train, we do each day. If you don't do  
 that every so often, that skill goes away. Once you learn  
 something, if you're going to -- in these high-performance  
 aircraft, you have to practice year-round.

11  
 12 MR. LEE TITUS: Okay. The reason I'm asking is about  
 low-flying in calving areas on certain portions of  
 Yukon-Charlie.

15  
 16 LT. COL. SITER: One of the things we've instituted  
 with the U.S. Fish and Wildlife in the Yukon -- the whole  
 Yukon-Charlie Drainage, we have a 2,000 foot above-ground level  
 minimum altitude, that we're not allowed to fly over that river  
 unless we're at least 2,000 feet away from it. We've got to  
 stay two miles away from it -- we're below 2,000. So it's sort  
 of a funnel, if you will, that protects that river. And the  
 major impetus was the peregrine falcon. But there's also other  
 things going on in that river like rafting and recreation and  
 all that. What has helped -- I'm not saying that the Air Force  
 has been the catalyst of this, but rather the birds are  
 starting to come back pretty good.

28  
 29 So, what we're trying to do is cooperate and we have a  
 long-term commitment to continue to avoid those areas. And  
 you'll note, again, all these other areas are places where  
 we're trying to, again, help out these populations of animals  
 but yet still get the training that we need to get done so that  
 we're ready to go to war if we have to. Sir?

35  
 36 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: How do you come up with this  
 30-mile area hunting zone or radius?

38  
 39 MS. MEANS: The 30-mile radius was sort of a visual  
 tool that we used to begin with to try and figure out which  
 communities had the majority of their subsistence use area  
 under a MOA. That information, that radius was then  
 supplemented with information from ADF&G technical reports,  
 from information that we gathered during the scoping meetings  
 at different villages. So, it wasn't just limited to that 30  
 miles; that was the preliminary tool that we used. Once a  
 community had been identified as having its majority  
 subsistence use area under a MOA, that radius really becomes  
 meaningless. It was just a starting point to try and figure  
 50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
 277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
 272-7515

but which communities we should be looking at.

2

3 MR. LEE TITUS: Craig?

4

5 MR. GARDNER: A couple questions. What's (inaudible;  
6 too far from microphone) I mean, you've got like the Fortymile  
7 Herd that would be calving in that area. You know, we sent the  
8 comments in about three or four times and, you know, I guess I  
9 haven't really seen any kind of changes in what you guys plan  
10 to do. But, I mean, the calving area of the Fortymile is huge  
11 and, you know, it is -- and it's also -- it doesn't seem to be  
12 the same every year. And that might take in the lower half of  
13 your area. I mean, if you look at that total calving area of  
14 the Fortymile, they take up a huge chunk of real estate.

15

16 LT. COL. SITER: One of the things when we elected to  
17 analyze raising the MOA of Yukon 3 in this whole south -- I  
18 mean, essentially, just half of the MOA, was about animals and  
19 about subsistence. It was also about aviation safety. One of  
20 the predicaments that we had for the radars that I told you  
21 that we put in here to help give us a better low-altitude look,  
22 doesn't reach out this far. So, we have aviation concerns  
23 here, subsistence concerns, calving and wildlife concerns.  
24 And so what we tried to do, because we know that there's a lot  
25 pressure on the Fortymile Herd and that this is an  
26 airspace -- we're a little further away from the bombing range  
27 from it, so we had the flexibility to look at raising the  
28 floor. Okay. Now, as far as a particular calving area, one  
29 thing about calving areas, you have a set of areas where the  
30 calving might occur, you know, in any given year, but it's  
31 not -- they don't calve in the whole area. What we want to do  
32 work with the resource guys and figure out exactly where is  
33 that calving area. And, in fact, we are committed to  
34 mitigating that area as long as we can identify where it is.  
35 We don't want to mitigate the whole historical subset of where  
36 calving has ever occurred because year to year, like you said,  
37 they don't stay in the same place. It moves around.

38

39 MR. GARDNER: No, but my question is, how high are we  
40 talking are we talking that you're going to mitigate for  
41 calving? And, two, how flexible within that three or four week  
42 period that....

43

44 LT. COL. SITER: Three thousand feet above ground level  
45 where we have discovered most -- where the serious impact on  
46 the animals is because of startle effect, because -- and,  
47 again, that's equated to our -- the noise that comes out of our  
48 aircraft. Three thousand feet I believe -- is it 80 decibels?

49

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

1 MS. MEANS: Eighty-five.

2

3 LT. COL. SITER: Eighty-five decibels is the level that  
4 we have discovered from the studies - and there's not just one  
5 study - but from the studies that are available is where that  
6 effect is. So, that's what we're looking at. If we're going  
7 to mitigate for these animals, we have to go up to 3,000 feet  
8 to eliminate that effect.

9

10 MR. GARDNER: Okay. So, you've got 3,000 feet and  
11 then, you know, caribou calve and they'll calve them, you know,  
12 say in the Middle Fork Drainage and they'll roll over to the  
13 South Fork and then they're going to roll up on Harper, then  
14 they're going to move right up to the Upper Charlie and then  
15 right over to Cross Creek. That's in a three-week period that  
16 that herd is going to do that. Now, are you guys going to be  
17 flexible enough to change your flying or how can we contact you  
18 within three weeks?

19

20 LT. COL. SITER: We're....

21

22 MR. GARDNER: I mean, this is what the herd is going to  
23 do.

24

25 LT. COL. SITER: Yeah, yeah. That's the whole point  
26 when I mentioned the fact that there's no way you can just  
27 write one letter and say, hey, we're going to mitigate around  
28 28. You've got to have a committee that's, no joke, on the  
29 phone because a lot of times we're the first ones that find  
30 out. We've got a lot -- we've got our aircraft out there. We  
31 see the herd has moved. Our goal then is to contact the  
32 agencies that are concerned about it and update that mitigation  
33 area. Okay? So the idea is it very well may move with the  
34 herd. Okay. But, realize, the key is during the calving  
35 period, we want to be particularly sensitive about that for  
36 moose and rutting, we want -- we're concerned about that for  
37 the moose as well. It's not just one place. Hey, the calving  
38 season starts on umpty-dump date and this is where we're going  
39 to mitigate and if it moves, we're not going to budge. We want  
40 to stay real-time with it, too. We need some help, though. I  
41 mean, if we don't get the information that it's moved, then we  
42 can't respond and we want to respond. But we need the  
43 information. So, again, I think this committee is going to  
44 help us to get that kind of information. That's our goal.  
45 That's our commitment. We want real-time information.

46

47 MR. GARDNER: Well, then, my second question was in  
48 August. You're still going to do low-level in August?

49

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

1 LT. COL. SITER: Yes, yes.

2

3 MR. GARDNER: Okay. I mean, this is a subsistence area  
4 and August is -- you know, there will be thousands of people  
5 hunting and flying and walking in the Upper Chicken area.

6

7 LT. COL. SITER: Right. And that's -- again, realize,  
8 year-round this restriction of staying above 3,000 feet would  
9 be in effect. That's not a seasonal thing. We're committed to  
10 not doing exercises in September because we want to try to find  
11 a balance. We do need to do exercises. In Alaska you can't do  
12 exercises very easily up here in January and February. The  
13 weather is too cold. The weather is just not good enough to  
14 get a flying exercise. It's forced us to focus more than we  
15 would really like to. We would like to be able to fly our  
16 exercises year-round because then we could spread them out  
17 more.

18

19 MR. GARDNER: Yeah, but there's more people in August  
20 than September, actually, up there I would think.

21

22 LT. COL. SITER: We've heard -- you know, the bottom  
23 line is what we've heard from the public. That's not to say  
24 we've heard different, but rather September was what they  
25 considered to be more valuable to them. But we're trying to  
26 help where we can, sir. Other questions? Yes, sir?

27

28 MR. JERRY ISAAC: Yeah. What criteria do you use to  
29 designate the fly zones? I mean, does it have a....

30

31 LT. COL. SITER: That's a good question.

32

33 MR. ISAAC: Did you take into consideration tactical or  
34 strategic concerns, or did you take a map and decide that we're  
35 going to learn how to -- we're going to teach or instruct our  
36 pilots to learn how to fly this country? How....

37

38 LT. COL. SITER: That's a very good question. When we  
39 were out in the public, the first thing we did before we talked  
40 about, hey, what's this proposal about, was to talk that  
41 very -- to answer that very question. How does the Air Force  
42 select areas for training? One of the first and foremost  
43 things is, where are our bases? In the Second World War, they  
44 put the bases at Anchorage and at Fairbanks. That drives a lot  
45 (inaudible). That's where our planes take off and land  
46 from. Right? Well, the next thing was the bombing ranges.  
47 The bombing ranges were put in 50 years ago and they were all  
48 put in one part of the state. That was very unfortunate. I'm  
49 not saying we didn't have any foresight, but if they were to

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

locate them in other places in the state, we would be flying more over there. But they put all three of them here. We've been dealing with that for nearly 50 years. That affects where we can go because there's no bombing ranges over here, over here, over here.

6

7 Another thing is planes only carry so much fuel. If we had an unlimited fuel supply, maybe we could fly further away from the bases. But most of the -- for example, the training ranges for the F-16 force, the air active team, is about like this. They can't come up here. They can't go way out here. They're in this area here. Their planes are based at Eielson. Their radius is a little smaller because they carry less fuel. F-16s carry less fuel than an F-15. And so if you look at these concentric -- these circles here, this defines the area that they can even begin to fly. Okay. And so that's how these regions of the state where there's military operating areas were placed. Okay. So, then you look at now if this where we -- this is the region where we would fly, another question is, what else is going on? That's why we've come to you and said, okay, talk to us some more about what you're doing. What are your activities, your hunting activities, your recreation activities? All that, so that we can analyze it and, again, trying to figure out, well, can we make adjustments.

26

27 You'll note again we're trying to change borders. I mean we're trying to track the things that get our air -- our activity away from things where we can. I've mentioned earlier we don't need to fly as much at low altitude away from the bombing ranges out here than we do in the middle here. Okay? So, we are trying to accommodate that by changing altitudes where we can. And then we do some things that are seasonable because a lot of these impacts are not there year-round. Some of them are summer only; others are very certain life-cycle things. That's why we need to have real-time information. It's not enough to say we have a study, therefore we know all the answers. We need a committee because things move around. Okay? So, that's our commitment, is to try to formalize, to be more responsive to these resources as they move around and as the seasons change.

42

43 MR. JERRY ISAAC: Why is the fly zone being expanded? And then the other statement more than a question that I'd like to make is there are very mountainous regions due west of Eielson. Why can't those be considered as alternatives to those....

48

49 LT. COL. SITER: That's another good question. One of  
50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

the things when I talked about the bombing ranges here, one of the other structures that's out there that is not controlled by the Air Force, it's controlled by the Federal Aviation Administration, it's where airliners and you fly your airplanes. You want to fly on instrument flight rules. There's all kinds of routes in here and they won't let us put military operating areas there. The FAA says in its regulations that military operating areas should not be placed where there's jet traffic and commercial aviation and other general aviation that's using those routes. So, right now there's no way we can put them here. Because we did look over here and what we'd have to do is ask the FAA to completely change the national transportation network that they have in Alaska that we all rely on. So our hands were tied because you're right, if you look at it from a resource standpoint, this would be a better place to be. But there's no way to put the airspace there because of the interference with those routes. We did look there, sir, though.

19

20 MR. LEE TITUS: Danny, you had a question?

21

22 MR. GRANGAARD: Yeah. Is there any new existing bombing range in any of that?

24

25 LT. COL. SITER: What's that?

26

27 MR. GRANGAARD: Are you going to put any new bombing....

29

30 LT. COL. SITER: No, no. Again, the environmental impact of adding more bombing ranges is something that we -- we were not looking for new bombing ranges. Right now that -- we don't want to put any more iron into the ground, if you will. We already -- we have our impact areas. We're satisfied with that, sir.

36

37 MR. GRANGAARD: One more question. In August, like Craig was saying, is when all those small aircraft are up there flying around and taking hunters in and out, and the Chicken Tail has got hundreds of people on it. How is a small aircraft going to contact the Air Force to find out -- what's going on up there? I work south of Fairbanks quite a bit and it's real flat scary working out there....

44

45 LT. COL. SITER: Yeah, one of the things about it....

46

47 MR. GRANGAARD: ....without any contact.

48

49 LT. COL. SITER: Last summer the Air Force spent a

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

couple million dollars and got some radars and, admittedly, they were bought for military purposes and they were positioned in key places that, one, helped us to monitor our military aircraft as they're flying in the airspace, but they were positioned so they could see someone like yourself flying along the flyway. We now have an advisor service, okay, on 128.3. It's called Eielson Range Control. Has anyone ever contacted Eielson Range Control on their aircraft?

9

10 MR. ROACH: (Raises hand)

11

12 LT. COL. SITER: Okay. Eielson Range Control has now been given a set of eyes to see at low altitude, they never had before. Come up on their frequency, sir, and say, hey, I'm inbound from Delta Junction to Fairbanks and ask them what's the status of the MOAs and is there any military traffic of concern to me. And here's how he should respond: He should say that which MOAs are hot which means that there are aircraft in the MOA and tell you that there may be aircraft -- for example, it might be you have high-speed military aircraft 30 miles north of your position southbound. He's not going to tell you to turn; he's not a controller. Okay? He's not even an Air Force person. He's a contractor that runs Eielson Range Control. What he's trying to tell you is to give you situational awareness so that you can make your own decision. We're not going to tell you what altitude to fly at, we're not going to tell you which direction to go at because we're not authorized by the FAA to do that. But you can now take that information and either make a decision to change your altitude, change your direction; it'll be your choice.

31

32 MR. GRANGARD: I can reach that at 2,000 feet on the Charlie River?

34

35 LT. COL. SITER: No, sir, you're going to have to get closer or be back over here. Again, I....

37

38 MR. GRANGAARD: Well, that's what I'm saying, if you're up there on the ground and you leave the Charlie River coming back towards Tok, how are you going to deal with that?

41

42 LT. COL. SITER: One of the things, too, again -- remember, the Air Force doesn't have all the answers and we don't have all the money in the world either. But what we're committed to, we're actually looking now at trying to fill some of those holes, put in more radar/radio relay sites so that maybe we someday can say I can answer, yes, sir, to you that we can see and hear you. I can tell you right now that we're committed to continuing to improve it. We started with putting

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

a radar down in the Dolly Dome area right here and we put one right at the eastern edge -- excuse me, right here out at the Yukon bombing range. And the idea is this is just a start. We put in a whole bunch of radio coverage about three years ago. If you'd have asked me what's the low altitude radio coverage in the Interior, I would have told you to circle around Fairbanks at that date. You know what it is today? Again, the Air Force has made the investment. We're sharing the radio delays with the FAA. It's all the way out to the Yukon River. How long will that take? We don't know, but we're committed to continue to invest in the state because it helps our own training. We're not doing this just to, you know, to give you radio coverage. We're helping ourselves because we need to be heard and seen as well as you. It's not going to be solved -- but that's -- again, having the committees together can tell us where do you think we ought to position these radio relay sites so that we're not just doing it ourselves. If we can position a radio site, get our military mission done, and, oh, by the way, help get better coverage to the civilians, we'll elect to take that option because that's an extra bonus. It's the same thing with these radar. If we put them in there for military purpose, why not share the information? We've already made the investment. And, besides, if you know more about what we're doing, that's safer for us. I think that's good.

26

27 MR. SEAN MCGUINNESS: How many flights are you talking about in a particular week in August over one of those Yukon areas?

30

31 LT. COL. SITER: On a daily -- are you talking exercise routine training?

33

34 MR. MCGUINNESS: I'm talking airplanes in the air flying around.

36

37 LT. COL. SITER: Okay. Well, I meant -- my question was on certain days of the summer, we do what's called routine training. These are just Alaskan units, flying what they do day to day. On occasion, we bring in exercise people from outside of Alaska and then the number of sorties increases. But day to day, the average sortie count in the Yukon is probably about 15 aircraft, 15 to 18 aircraft. Okay? And that's over the course of the whole day. Okay. During an exercise, our average exercise, oh, I'll say probably around 40 aircraft or 50 aircraft from the Air Force. A lot of these aircraft are high-speed fighters flying at low altitude. Some of them are tanker aircraft that carry gas and pass it to other aircraft and stay very, very high. Others are commanding

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515



control aircraft like the AWACS or it's called an early warning system, it's the radar vision on a plane, and it stays very high. But then there's aircraft that do fly at low altitude and fly into the bombing ranges and practice what they would do in real combat. The whole purpose of major flying exercises, if we weren't doing this, we would be losing airplanes like we did in Vietnam. They had a lot of POWs because all they ever did was fly one-on-one and two-on-two. Okay? When I first learned to fly, that's what I started out in. I'd fly with one other guy and then eventually they put you on the wing with someone else and you go two-on-two. That's the way they were training people in Vietnam and they were losing people in the first ten missions. We created these major flying exercises and put them in this (inaudible) size arena to train so that we can get ten missions on it in peace time. What we have found is that those mistakes that the beginners make, they make them the first ten missions. If they make it in actual combat, they're going to either lose the plane, lose their life, or be a prisoner. We don't want that to happen. So we're trying to put our young pilots in an arena that puts them under some pressure. Let them make mistakes because it's peace time. And so it's a very important part of our training. It finishes up -- we also train as units. When we go out on these exercises, we take all our maintenance people with us. They have to learn how do we simulate combat. It's not just done in the airspace; it's done in the ramps at our bases. The tempo of doing that is something that you just can't replicate day to day. You've got to practice it every once in awhile. So it's very important to us. Very important.

30

31 MR. ROACH: Bob? You might just mention how long  
32 you've been using the temporary MOAs and if you've had any  
33 incidents so far.

34

35 LT. COL. SITER: The temporary MOAs, the concept of  
36 temporary MOAs was great back in 1976 when the permanent MOAs  
37 were created throughout America, not just Alaska. We have had  
38 temporary MOAs throughout the state for over 20 years. Okay.  
39 (inaudible) 20 years, excuse me. We've also airspace,  
40 temporary airspace in these areas for nearly as long. They  
41 have just in the last three or four years been formalized in  
42 these particular locations. Okay. And what was your second  
43 question, sir? I'm sorry?

44

45 MR. ROACH: Just if you've had any incidents with  
46 civilian aircraft.

47

48 LT. COL. SITER: What we've had, we've had pilots tell  
49, hey, I've had a near-miss. What we are encouraging because  
50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

it's kind of -- what we would like is to know about it. Sometimes a near-miss occurs and the military pilot doesn't even know it and other times the military knows it, but the civilian doesn't. Okay. That's why we put the 800 service in, so that we can get a call real-time and say, hey, this happened. And it may be something, for example, we've had calls from people on the ground: So-and-so flew over my cabin and he's not supposed to be at that altitude. We want to know that. Okay. Part of our enforcement stuff is -- don't get me wrong. I think the Air Force enforces better, we have better compliance, we have a more professional force than we've ever had. It doesn't mean that we don't ever have somebody stray and fly over the wrong area. Most of the time it's a mistake; the guy gets lost. We have navigation systems that are very, very sophisticated; sometimes they malfunction. Other times people misunderstand. It's very complicated information and they don't know where they are. Okay. They know they're in Alaska, but they don't know exactly where they are. Okay. We want to know about that because we need to train that guy better. Okay? And we want to be sensitive. Okay. We want to correct our own errors if we can. We do a full investigation. We owe it to you all to do that, but it's got to start with a phone call. We don't want you to pay a quarter to do it, though, so we're going to -- essentially, it's a statewide 800 service number and, again, if you get on our mailing list, I can make sure you get all that information. Again, the 800 service is in the newsletter. And -- but the idea is that we're not perfect. We are committed to doing full investigations and where crimes are committed, they will be prosecuted, and we have done that. People have been sent out of state or they've lost their jobs in the past. It's not often pretty.

33

34 MS. MEANS: Let me add something. In terms of actual reported near-misses, there have been none recorded in that airspace. There have been near-misses reported to the FAA around the Air Force bases. Often they're with -- often, they occur while they're on the ground, but there have been no near-misses reported to FAA in that airspace.

40

41 MR. LEE TITUS: Any more questions? Vince?

42

43 MR. MATHEWS: Yeah. I just need to ask two questions. One, obviously, there is Larry Bright here that will be presenting some comments on the EIS. But is it fair to say that -- well, what opportunities do subsistence users and subsistence communities have now to plug into this EIS process? And that -- I didn't hear all of it, but you had subsistence 2, and 3 zoning. My understanding is subsistence -- I'm not

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

a subsistence user, is the fact that it's based on flexibility and the data that you used is basically data from a five to ten year span, but it's only a one-picture shot. Is this going to be a fluid process in there because the subsistence economy moves with the wildlife. So will this be as fluid with that as you are with the other aspects that you talked about?

7  
8 MS. MEANS: In terms of mitigating, in terms of what comes out in the actual record of decision and what the Air Force does in the future, I think that flexibility is there. The EIS, by nature, must take a snapshot in time and a decision gets made. One of the things the Air Force is doing is committing to mitigating certain hard and fast things, but also setting up these councils and mechanisms for continuing dialogue. And they're committing not only to that dialogue, but to mitigate based on the outcome of that dialogue.

17  
18 MR. MATHEWS: Well, how do leaders from the different communities tack into those councils? And do they meet....

20  
21 MS. MEANS: The councils are -- okay.

22  
23 MR. MATHEWS: Let's....

24  
25 LT. COL. SITER: To answer the bulk of the questions, as I mentioned earlier, anyone in here today by simply writing down your address, will automatically be locked into the process. If you would like to do that, I'm here today to take your address and I will get you that newsletter. And anything -- once you're on that mailing list, any other mailing that comes out -- for example, the Draft EIS is a very, very sizeable document. The reason being is not to make it heavy, but rather to have an in-depth analysis because the issues at hand are very complicated. But what we also did is to all 700 people, we gave them the Executive Summary. It was about 30 pages of the main thrust of what the analysis showed. We will do the same for the Final EIS. So, if you would like -- and you may not be accessible to a library. We sent them out to all the village libraries, not just to Anchorage and Fairbanks. I mean lots -- every archive in the state just about. You can get that information. So today might be a good day to say I would like to get more information. I'm willing to take down every name in here, whatever it takes to link in.

44  
45 The other issue about subsistence, the Resource Protection Committee that's been formed, okay, we have yet to meet yet; we've just started this thing. We're hoping to start soon, will involve subsistence type of issues. It's not just about wildlife. We're interested in the subsistence viewpoint

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

from a resource protection as well. So, again, it's not -- it's about the whole picture of how do we protect the resources, how can we minimize our effect on resources, whether it be subsistence resources or wildlife resources? It's not a separate group, if you will.

6  
7 MR. MATHEWS: And will that be continued after....

8  
9 LT. COL. SITER: Yes, yes.

10  
11 MR. MATHEWS: After the process?

12  
13 LT. COL. SITER: The 800 number -- see, the 800 number goes beyond the EIS because we're using it for noise complaints, for people that are on a raft trip or they don't -- they see an aircraft and they're going, hey, I thought -- maybe in their minds, they thought at this location there shouldn't be an aircraft and there was one. Make the call. We'll probably be able to get you an answer real-time. If there's not supposed to be an aircraft there, we will do an investigation and then get back to you. If it's an area where we're allowed to fly, then we'll say so. If we're getting complaints, maybe we ought to mitigate that area. Okay. The point is sometimes we don't realize -- we're in an allowable area to fly and we don't realize that we have an impact. And maybe the phone call gets us to think about should we or should we not be flying in this area. Okay. So make -- I encourage you to make the call. We're not (inaudible) hope they don't call. Yeah, we don't want -- you know, we would like to be able to minimize our interface with these types of things, but pick up the phone. Trust me. I'd much rather hear from you than you be frustrated, going why are they doing this. Okay. Maybe there's a reason for us to make a change. Your phone call might make -- start that process in happening. I encourage you to call us.

36  
37 MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you. Did you have a presentation?

39  
40 MR. LARRY BRIGHT: Sure.

41  
42 MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you.

43  
44 MR. BRIGHT: I'll try and be brief here. It's about time for a break, I think. My name is Larry Bright and I work with the Fish and Wildlife Service out of Fairbanks, and I would like to thank the Council for inviting me here today to talk to you a little bit about the Department of Interior's position and their recommendations with regard to the Air Force  
50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

proposal.

2

3 I'd like to be perfectly clear. It's not our proposal.  
4 It's the Air Force proposal. We're making comments on it.  
5 And what I have, I brought copies of our comments on the Draft  
6 EIS and if you'd like a copy of that, anybody is free to have a  
7 copy of that. I'm not going to go into detail. I'll try and  
8 just summarize and give you what the strategy is. Again, I  
9 work for the Fish and Wildlife Service, Ecological Services in  
10 Fairbanks. We don't -- I'm not associated with a particular  
11 refuge, so we work on proposals like this one, other State and  
12 Federal proposals and make recommendations to minimize impacts  
13 on fish and wildlife.

14

15

16 Just a little background. When the Air Force made  
17 their proposal, came out with their first draft, the Department  
18 of Interior decided to team their agencies up, primarily the  
19 BLM, Bureau of Land Management, the National Park Service, and  
20 Fish and Wildlife Service. Bring those agencies together as a  
21 team to work with the Air Force in modifying their proposal to  
22 minimize impacts. So, what I'm going to do, I can address what  
23 the Department of Interior comments are. I can't speak for any  
24 specific agency, except for the Fish and Wildlife Service  
25 position, but primarily what I'm here to do is to give you an  
26 idea of what the Department position is on the Draft EIS thus  
27 far. I can say since I have been in this team, the Department  
28 of Interior team, working with the Air Force, the Air Force has  
29 been very open, they've been accommodating. They've worked  
30 with us to try and I think honestly resolve conflicts and solve  
31 problems. So, I think they have been very open in the process  
32 thus far.

33

34 So, I'll get to the point here. Can everybody hear me?  
35 Okay. The position, first of all, the Department of Interior  
36 has been up front right off the bat with the Air Force; that we  
37 do not question the legitimate mission of the Air Force to  
38 train their pilots to be ready for war, to defend the United  
39 States and territories of the United States. We have made that  
40 clear up front. We do recognize that they certainly do have a  
41 legitimate mission here in Alaska. We do believe there is  
42 enough common ground here for all of us, the public and  
43 agencies alike, to come together and to resolve problems. And  
44 there are definitely problems out there; that we've heard some  
45 of them. But I think there is enough common ground to solve  
46 those problems. It's not easy; it's complex, but I think  
47 there's common ground out there. Okay.

48

49 In general, the Department of Interior feels that the  
50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

environment, particularly the flight training environment in Alaska has changed dramatically since 1990. And I think most of you have been here since then and you can recognize the fact that since 1990 there's been additional planes, F-16s instead of 8-10s at Eielson. There have been additional F-15s out of Elmendorf. There's been the big Cope Thunder exercises that, essentially, with the closing of the base in the Philippines, we have Cope Thunder exercises now in Alaska, changes in military training routes, and so on. Now the proposal is to change -- essentially, the biggest change is changing temporary airspace that was used only for exercises before. Change that to permanent airspace that can be used throughout the year, and some big chunks of airspace. We feel like there has been a significant change. Our primary position here as an agency concerned about subsistence, recreation, wildlife impacts, is that we feel like the -- over in some -- a gentleman over here asked a question earlier about how many planes are in the air at a particular time. Our primary concern is about levels of flying. How many planes are in the air at any particular time? We feel that we need to hold overall levels of flight training to no more than what they have been in the past four years. We're trying to hold the Air Force to what is currently being done. That's kind of our first line of defense or line of measuring impacts.

25

26 There are some problems in measuring how much flying is actually going on at any given time, any given year, and we're trying to resolve some of those problems and we are working on that, trying to set a cap, if you will, on flying time per month or per year. Okay. So, that's the first point. We have primarily three points here that we're dealing with in our recommendations to the Air Force. That's the first one: A cap on flying activity.

34

35 The second point: We realize that's very general, it's not site-specific, and there are certain areas, especially in the Yukon MOAs that have very specific problems. Calving, for example, sheep lambing, subsistence hunting, other recreational concerns. So, in addition to that cap on flying, we also have asked for some very specific time and space restrictions. You know, stay out of this area at this time or above a certain altitude at a certain time. And Colonel Siter has actually mentioned some of those and we've talked about quite a few of those. So, that's the second point.

45

46 And then the third point: We feel like we really don't know that much about the impacts and so we've asked the Air Force in addition to the flight restrictions in altitude and in space and as far as the cap on flying time, we've also asked

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

the Air Force to initiate a monitoring program where we actually put some real dollars to some on-the-ground efforts out there to measure impacts on specific wildlife, specific herds, and specific species, and also activities like recreation and subsistence. And we are right now in the process of talking about what exactly that monitoring program would entail. So, those are kind of the three points that are discussed in more detail in this letter, but that's kind of our strategy as far as a department in looking at the impacts that currently exist and the potential impacts for this proposal and trying to mitigate those impacts so that we can minimize the impacts out there, allow the Air Force to fly and not be terribly disruptive on subsistence resources and uses as well as other resources out there.

15

16 Let's see. Let's see what I'm forgetting to talk about here. I think that's the biggest part of it. I could go into more detail about specific studies, but, you know, we've picked these three main points to focus on because we do feel like there is a certain amount of literature out there that suggests that low-level flying has a chronic impact on wildlife and people; that the longer it goes on for a longer period, the greater the impact. So, there's a cumulative effect and I think we can all relate to that. If you go out and you get buzzed once during a two-week period, you're probably -- by the time you come back home, you've forgotten about it. But if it's something that happens every day, by the time you get back, you're hopping mad about it. So, a lot of these recommendations that we're making deal with trying to space the impacts out, trying to space the flying out, have breaks in between exercises so that you don't have several exercises with a hundred planes involved, you know, one week after another. You have one and then you have a couple of weeks break before you can think about having another one.

35

36 Also, there's some research that shows that the higher the noise level the greater the impact. And, again, that's part of the reason for getting the altitudes up to decrease the noise levels. And, also, there's a fair amount of research that actually shows the slower the aircraft the greater the impact. And, actually, a lot of the studies on waterfowl, particularly, the small light aircraft that are going slower have a greater impact than the higher speed aircraft at the equivalent altitude. So, anyway, that's kind of it in a nutshell.

46

47 MR. McGUINNESS: Are you talking about the difference between an F-15 and Supercub?

49

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

1 MR. BRIGHT: Um-hum (affirmative). Yeah, I am. Yeah,  
 particularly like in the Copper Valley on swans. And this is a  
 problem in Alaska. In a lot of cases, there's just one study  
 that I'm referencing, you know. But one study that's been done  
 on swans in the Copper River Delta, the slower the aircraft,  
 the small fixed-wing aircraft that were slower, were more of an  
 impact, they created a greater disturbance among swans, is what  
 they're looking at, than higher altitude jets. And the jets  
 were higher altitude, but louder. So, you know, in some cases,  
 again in particularly waterfowl that I'm thinking about, the  
 slower the aircraft and, again, the closer the -- the slower,  
 the closer, and the noisier the aircraft the greater response.  
 And that is in general terms, but -- because every situation  
 is different. That's part of the problem up here. Every  
 situation is different, every species is different, and there  
 hasn't been that much done up here. There's been some good  
 work on the caribou, the Delta Caribou Herd, in terms of  
 military overflights and I know these folks have looked at that  
 information quite a bit and based some of their restrictions on  
 what's coming out of that study.

21

22 Anything else? Questions?

23

24 MR. LEE TITUS: Anybody has any more questions? Dan,  
 did you have a question?

26

27 MR. GRANGAARD: (Shakes head "no")

28

29 MR. BRIGHT: Again, if you'd like more specifics, I've  
 got copies up here if you'd like to look at it.

31

32 MR. LEE TITUS: You? All right. Thank you.

33

34 MR. BRIGHT: Sure.

35

36 MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you. Did you have something?

37

38 MR. MATHEWS: (Shakes head "no")

39

40 MR. LEE TITUS: All right. Yeah, before we go any  
 further, I want to ask what's the wishes of the Council members  
 as far as quitting time and if we're going to meet later on  
 after dinner or....

44

45 (Council members shake heads in negative response)

46

47 MR. LEE TITUS: Okay. That settles it. No meeting  
 after dinner. Yeah, I think we're pretty well up to date on  
 our agenda. So, I guess we can go for another 15 or 20 minutes

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
 277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
 272-7515

ANCHORAGE, ALASKA 99501



or whatever and then have to set up and get stuff ready for lunch at six. Then you can fly to Tok after that. Right? Is that okay?

4

5 MR. MILLER: Sounds good.

6

7 MR. LEE TITUS: Is that okay? Go for another 15 minutes or so? Vince?

9

10 MR. MATHEWS: Mr. Chairman, I failed to mention when you were dealing with your agenda, there is an item that you may want to look at. I'm not sure if you want to go back or continue with the Upper Tanana C&T or do you want to, in this period of time, bring up another issue that is coming up that you may be interested in. It's dealing with trapping on National Park Service lands.

17

18 MR. ROACH: Mr. Chair? Could you be more specific?

19

20 MR. MATHEWS: Once I start specifics, we're down the slope. Essentially, what it is, it's a clarification in the regulations dealing with same-day airborne hunting on Park Service lands and also addressing a clarification of trapping regulations on Park Service lands. And my material is over here, so I'm a little hesitant to paraphrase that, but essentially what has happened is when that Federal Register notice went out, there was agreement in general with the public on the same-day airborne stand. There has been a lot of talk about the clarification on trapping. So, when I contacted the Regional office of Park Service, they said that they're going to split out same-day airborne and make that final, and the section on trapping is going to go out for public comment. But the public comment period may have started today or it may start in a day or two, but you're not meeting until next fall. So, I have a copy of the Federal Register notice and I believe some of the Park Service staff can touch upon this issue.

37

38 MR. LEE TITUS: I think we can deal with that when the Park Service makes their....

40

41 MR. MATHEWS: Makes their report?

42

43 MR. LEE TITUS: ....presentation tomorrow.

44

45 MR. MATHEWS: Okay.

46

47 MR. LEE TITUS: But I'd like to have all the Council to have copies of the Federal Register....

49

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

1 MR. MATHEWS: Sure.

2

3 MR. LEE TITUS: ....for their....

4

5 MR. MATHEWS: Sure. I'll pass that out when I pass out  
what Larry offered, and I made it green so it will stand out  
because we've been using so much white paper here and I -- at  
other meetings, I'll try to make sure those are three-hole  
punched so you can just insert it in your book because you're  
getting quite a few hand-outs.

11

12 MR. LEE TITUS: Okay. I don't know, at this time is  
there any more comments from the public concerning C&T or  
anything else they want to talk about? Don't be afraid to come  
up here. Not everybody is a game warden. Most of them are  
first college graduates.

17

18 audience laughter)

19

20 MR. MATHEWS: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

21

22 MR. LEE TITUS: Any more comments? Dan?

23

24 MR. GRANGAARD: Why can't we include -- if we adopted  
one of those areas, why can't we include all three of these,  
including trapping in those areas? If we feel like it's fair  
or -- let's say Northway wants that C or B and just include  
trapping in that -- and birds, too. Can that be done?

29

30 MR. MATHEWS: Well, since no one is volunteering.  
Essentially, the board, in my understanding, was going to look  
at the large mammal species first on C&T and I'm not sure when  
they're going to come up with the other. Maybe someone else  
can throw me a line here, but that's my understanding that they  
were....

36

37 MR. GRANGAARD: We'll have to do this again?

38

39 MR. MATHEWS: Your question, will they have to do this  
again? Under those species under this present mode, correct.  
And I see other heads nodding, so I must be on fairly thick  
ice.

43

44 MR. ROACH: Mr. Chairman?

45

46 MR. LEE TITUS: Yes, Jeff.

47

48 MR. ROACH: It's my understanding that the  
commendations that we make can be fairly broad and I don't

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

1 think that there's anything stopping us for making a  
 2 recommendation to include other species, if that's what the  
 3 Council would like to do. But it just hasn't been -- I don't  
 4 think it's been very well discussed yet. But I don't think  
 5 there's anything stopping us from making that recommendation.

6  
 7 MR. MATHEWS: That's correct, Mr. Chairman.

8  
 9 MR. LEE TITUS: So nobody has any more comments? I  
 10 don't know, what's the wishes of the board at this time?  
 11 Nobody has any comments from the public? When was this -- when  
 12 did I see this Forestry thing is supposed to be done?

13  
 14 MR. ROACH: The Forestry thing is scheduled for Friday  
 15 afternoon, and that's the next item under Old Business, unless  
 16 we want to start in New Business and....

17  
 18 MR. LEE TITUS: I think we'll start with the -- the  
 19 first thing we're going to do tomorrow morning is do the New  
 20 Business and get all the agencies' reports done in the morning.  
 21 And then we'll do the Federal Regulation proposals at 1:00.

22  
 23 MR. MATHEWS: Mr. Chairman, are you indicating that the  
 24 Council is completed with the Upper Tanana C&T review and the  
 25 review of the C&T in general?

26  
 27 MR. LEE TITUS: If there's any comments has to -- that  
 28 people want to make between now and tomorrow, they still have  
 29 that opportunity.

30  
 31 MR. MATHEWS: Oh.

32  
 33 MR. LEE TITUS: Because I noticed that -- I know that  
 34 some people that wasn't here yesterday or wasn't here today  
 35 will be here tomorrow.

36  
 37 MR. MATHEWS: So, you're indicating then tomorrow that  
 38 the Council is going to decide to take some action -- and  
 39 when I say that action, it can be no action, that you'll be  
 40 doing that tomorrow?

41  
 42 MR. LEE TITUS: Um-hum (affirmative).

43  
 44 MR. MATHEWS: I just....

45  
 46 MR. LEE TITUS: Yeah, from the -- I don't know, really,  
 47 I don't know.

48  
 49 MR. MATHEWS: Okay.

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
 277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
 272-7515

1  
2 MR. LEE TITUS: But just hearing the comments from the  
3 other Council, I heard a lot of suggestions that they won't  
4 make any kind of actions without further input from the  
5 communities. I mean, that -- I heard that over and over. And  
6 I think that we should at least start from one point and kind  
7 of like focus on that so that we'll have -- I just don't want  
8 to leave this Council meeting without nowhere to start from,  
9 you know. I think that we should come up with something to get  
10 the ball rolling and keep everything open so that we don't get  
11 into something that we're going to regret later on. So, to  
12 answer your question, I think we're going to have to come back  
13 to this C&T thing after we're done with Federal proposals.

14  
15 MR. MATHEWS: Mr. Chairman, it sounds to me, and I'm  
16 not trying to put words in your mouth, that the Council will be  
17 looking and thinking overnight about what process they would  
18 like....

19  
20 MR. LEE TITUS: Right.

21  
22 MR. MATHEWS: ....with the C&T overall process and,  
23 maybe in that light, also looking specifically to Upper Tanana.  
24 Is that a fair assumption?

25  
26 MR. LEE TITUS: Right.

27  
28 MR. MATHEWS: Okay. Thank you.

29  
30 MR. ROACH: Mr. Chairman, do we need to, just as kind  
31 of a point, do we need to table this until a later point in the  
32 agenda so that it's -- it will be brought up at a specific time  
33 is that necessary?

34  
35 MR. MATHEWS: It would help because you still have a  
36 lot of stuff on your agenda and once we start going into  
37 proposals, that's going to take time. So, it would be easier  
38 -- it makes it easier for us on staff to get direction more  
39 than when you guys are leaving out the door, saying, well, do  
40 this, do that, do that, because this is a very important  
41 subject. So, I think we could -- it would make it better just  
42 to target some time, and there's enough staff here to assist in  
43 drafting items if that's where the resistance or hesitation is.  
44 I mean, there's enough of us here to lay out enough  
45 alternatives. Just give us the charge to do that and we can go  
46 ahead.

47  
48 MR. LEE TITUS: Okay.

49  
50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

1 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Mr. Chairman?

2

3 MR. LEE TITUS: Yeah, Charlie?

4

5 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: I think we spent most of the  
6 afternoon on C&T. I think I'm ready to face it. I mean, I'm  
7 ready to do something about it, because if we spend tomorrow --  
8 if we spend the rest of tomorrow on it, I don't....

9

10 MR. MATHEWS: Mr. Chairman, Mr. Titus, I don't think  
11 what the Council, where they're at now, will need that much  
12 time tomorrow. It is apparent to me that the Council does not  
13 want to go into depth into the Upper Tanana C&T report and  
14 alternatives. I assume that's a fair assumption. So that is a  
15 lot of detail. So, using the Air Force, going up a few  
16 elevation from there, then, we have to deal with the process.  
17 It's pretty clear, with a little thinking overnight, where  
18 you're going with your recommendations. So, I would recommend  
19 the Council members talk a little bit amongst themselves about  
20 it. I don't envision it taking more than an hour unless we go  
21 back down into the details of the particular C&T Process.  
22 Then, we'll -- it may take more time. Correct me if I'm wrong,  
23 from other council members. I'm really kind of overstepping my  
24 advisory role here.

25

26 MR. LEE TITUS: No, I think you're pretty well --  
27 because I think all we're going to be dealing with is going to  
28 be dealing with the alternatives, which alternatives that we,  
29 as a Council, will support and just start from there. Because  
30 there's a lot of things in the final report that, coming from  
31 me, that's going to fall through the cracks. And it's really  
32 hard to make a decision because there's a lot of things that,  
33 like I say, is going to fall through the cracks. But other  
34 than that, I think -- yeah?

35

36 MR. MATHEWS: Mr. Chairman, to give you some direction  
37 here, the reason you asked or the Council asked for the delay  
38 was to have additional meetings with the community to get  
39 additional information to make a decision on the alternatives  
40 other alternatives that are available. The question, then,  
41 before you is, Did you receive that information? And if you  
42 haven't, then you have to decide do you want to continue to  
43 request that information, are you satisfied with the process  
44 that was utilized during that, or do you have another process  
45 you want, or do you want to opt out of this totally. And  
46 that's what's before you. And I asked on the record earlier  
47 for reports from those meetings and I didn't receive any  
48 indication of reports from those meetings. So, that would be a  
49 starting point to see there if you want to go back into it.

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

So, you have taken action. Has your action gone to -- met your needs? My assessment is, no, you still feel you need more information. So, then we need to focus there of how to get that information and that brings in the process.

5

6 MR. LEE TITUS: For how long?

7

8 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Mr. Chairman?

9

10 MR. LEE TITUS: Yeah.

11

12 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: I think now at this point I'm  
13 totally lost. I think I will sleep on it.

14

15 MR. MATHEWS: Okay.

16

17 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Because, Mr. Chairman, I don't  
18 think I'm in any position to make any -- I won't vote on  
19 anything.

20

21 MR. LEE TITUS: Well, if a lot of people really don't  
22 want to make a decision, I'd like to -- if we're going to get  
23 into the process thing, I'd like to reintroduce a motion that  
24 was not seconded earlier that Charlie Titus Jr. made. I'd like  
25 make a motion that the Regional Council will recommend C&T  
26 uses agreed upon during the subregional meeting to the Federal  
27 Subsistence Board, subject to approval by tribal governments.  
28 Once?

29

30 MR. MATHEWS: Mr. Chairman, you asked me before during  
31 a break to kind of explain this option. The motion that you've  
32 requested -- well, I'll wait and see if there's a second.

33

34 MR. LEE TITUS: Yep. Wait for a second.

35

36 MR. MAYO: I'd like to second that.

37

38 MR. LEE TITUS: Okay. Randy seconded. Okay.

39 Discussion.

40

41 MR. MATHEWS: Okay. Mr. Chairman, what your motion is,  
42 one component of a five-component system. It's got five  
43 parts to it. And, again, I'm only going by my interpretation  
44 that meeting. That meeting was an informational meeting.  
45 There was no final conclusion voted up or down or drafted or  
46 whatever; this was just an option and there's five parts of it.  
47 Overall, this surfaced and I don't like attaching names to  
48 people's actions, so I'm going to call this the Seward  
49 Peninsula Option, was that they felt that the C&T Process

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

needed to start from the bottom up. That was one thing.

2

3       The second part of it was that they felt the process  
 4 that is existing now is too time-consuming, it takes too long  
 5 to get to the problems that are at hand. From those two  
 6 platforms, and hopefully there's others that were here at the  
 7 meeting if I missed other platforms will speak up, from that  
 8 this was drafted. There's five parts of it; you've just taken  
 9 a motion for No. 4. No. 1 is to hold subregional hearings with  
 10 full council (affected tribal governments), lead agencies, and  
 11 staff committee present. So, they wanted subregional hearings.  
 12 Underneath that, they wanted adequately publicized meetings  
 13 and hearings on discussion of C&T in subregions so that public  
 14 have input. So, they wanted well-publicized subregional  
 15 meetings. At the meetings, they wanted to reach consensus  
 16 on -- at the meetings -- excuse me. To reach consensus at  
 17 meetings/hearings on definitions of terms, and that's why I'm  
 18 drawing a blank on all the terms that were brought up during  
 19 that discussion. But the terms  
 20 that I thought they were going to -- addressing were definition  
 21 of terms like "long and consistent pattern of use." What does  
 22 that mean? Terms dealing with "what is subsistence" and other  
 23 key terms.

24

25       The third thing is to determine, chronologically by  
 26 species, the longest use and user groups. The way it was  
 27 presented is that you would look at each species and whichever  
 28 one was the longest pattern would be put together and then  
 29 you'd work your way back in time, back towards you in time.  
 30 And No. 4 is the one that you motioned which is regional  
 31 councils will recommend C&T uses agreed upon during the  
 32 subregional meetings to the Federal Subsistence Board (subject  
 33 to approval by tribal governments). Okay. So, they make  
 34 recommendations. No. 5: In case of resource shortage,  
 35 preference will be determined inversely, i.e. restricting the  
 36 newest user first and the oldest C&T user last. That also was  
 37 presented as, under No. 3, where you go chronologically by use;  
 38 that the newest use would be restricted first versus the oldest  
 39 one. And that was the presentation that was presented. It  
 40 would be -- it's hard for me to say if there was a consensus  
 41 with the group present there which was eight of the ten Chairs,  
 42 the staff committee, if there was consensus on this process.  
 43 But it would be fair to say there was consensus that the  
 44 present process needs to be looked at and somehow meet the  
 45 needs that are present here. Sorry to take so much time on  
 46 that, but you're taking one part of a process.

47

48       MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Mr. Chairman?

49

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
 277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
 272-7515

1 MR. LEE TITUS: Charlie.

2

3 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: I don't see -- it's plain and  
4 simple, Vince. What we're saying is give it back to the  
5 people. That's what they wanted anyway, to give it back to the  
6 tribes and let them make the determination and go over this and  
7 then give it to us. Maybe we can vote on -- come to a  
8 consensus on it. After all, they're the ones that are going to  
9 be affected.

10

11 MR. ROACH: Mr. Chair?

12

13 MR. LEE TITUS: Yes?

14

15 MR. ROACH: This -- pulling this portion four out of  
16 the entire option, I don't see how that differs from what we're  
17 doing right now by separating Option 4 out of this paragraph,  
18 whatever it is, this sentence four out of the entire option.  
19 How does that change what we're doing right now?

20

21 MR. LEE TITUS: It changes because it addresses the  
22 problems and the concerns that the local communities made  
23 earlier; that some of the people that came up here and  
24 testified, belonging on village councils, stated to us that  
25 they can't make decisions until they take this thing back to  
26 their communities and go over it with their communities and get  
27 directions from their communities on what to do. And without  
28 the local communities' support, I can't make any kind of  
29 decisions to overrule them.

30

31 MR. ROACH: Mr. Chairman, we -- that's what we asked  
32 for last fall and that's when Tetlin went to the communities  
33 and had their meetings and that's -- Chuck brought Dot Lake's  
34 information here, Tok was represented through the LAC, and I've  
35 heard some of the other comments from the Tanacross council  
36 members. Those comments have been made here today. I don't  
37 understand what else we need. How this will meet that....

38

39 MR. LEE TITUS: The motion that we're discussing right  
40 now is the local communities as affected by this book will have  
41 the opportunity to either -- I mean, they didn't want nothing  
42 be forced upon them. They didn't want this law to be forced  
43 upon them and this motion states that they have the opportunity  
44 either approve it or deny it, and I think it's a more  
45 stronger -- it gives the local communities more stronger input  
46 the process.

47

48 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: I don't know how much --  
49 excuse me, Mr. Chairman. I don't know if I can state my

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515



opinion any more than I have to, but I'm not going to vote on something that was given to me and say, here, vote on this, you have either A or B. No input at all from any of these tribal councils. I don't see them voting and saying, hey, we support this idea or any written thing saying they support A or B.

6

7 MR. ROACH: Mr. Chairman?

8

9 MR. JERRY ISAAC: Are you open for public comment?

10

11 MR. LEE TITUS: Concerning the motion on the floor  
12 right now? Concerning the motion that's on the floor right  
13 now?

14

15 MR. ISAAC: To that effect, yes.

16

17 MR. LEE TITUS: Oh, okay. Go ahead.

18

19 MR. ISAAC: I think I'd better make a statement, a  
20 point of clarification on the statement that I previously made  
21 on record. And that is that in the event that there has to be  
22 a decision made here, then and only then will Tanacross Village  
23 council decide on Options B or C, but that does not mean that  
24 we are ready to make a decision. We would rather that we be  
25 able to take all of the testimonies here into consideration,  
26 take it home, chew it up and digest it and then come back with  
27 a fair statement that is equal to all.

28

29 MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you. Jeff?

30

31 MR. ROACH: I understand what you're saying. There's a  
32 time -- we're not going to meet again for a while and there's a  
33 timing problem that I see here. We'll be asking for another  
34 delay. I'm curious as to the possibility of me making another  
35 motion that might relate to this and -- can I do that or does  
36 this one have to be voted on first? What is the....

37

38 MR. STARR: No, you can make a motion, but....

39

40 MR. LEE TITUS: The motion -- I think we'll have to act  
41 on this motion prior -- I mean before another motion can be  
42 made.

43

44 MR. MATHEWS: You could amend the motion and go that  
45 route, but I'm not sure that's what you're....

46

47 MR. ROACH: Can I make a suggestion for an amendment to  
48 the motion?

49

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

1 MR. LEE TITUS: Um-hum (affirmative).  
2

3 MR. ROACH: I'd like to amend the motion to read that  
4 at this time Alternative C be accepted and that the Regional  
5 Council will recommend C&T uses agreed upon during the  
6 Subregional meetings to the Federal Subsistence Board which is  
7 what the motion was, and we will revisit the C&T issue at our  
8 next meeting, requesting that the village councils draft  
9 proposals for review by the Council.  
10

11 MR. MATHEWS: Mr. Chairman?  
12

13 MR. LEE TITUS: Yes, Vince.  
14

15 MR. MATHEWS: You know, the -- oh, nothing. If it goes  
16 through, we need to clarify what Option C is so it's clear on  
17 the record....  
18

19 MR. LEE TITUS: Right.  
20

21 MR. MATHEWS: ....what Option C is because all our  
22 documentation have A and B. So, that was one concern.  
23

24 MR. LEE TITUS: Okay. Was that a suggestion or was  
25 that an amendment to the main motion?  
26

27 MR. ROACH: Yes, it was an amendment to the main  
28 motion.  
29

30 MR. LEE TITUS: There's a motion to amend the main  
31 motion. Second? Do I hear a second to amend?  
32

33 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Can you read that again,  
34 Vince? Mr. Chairman, can he....  
35

36 MR. ROACH: I can restate it again.  
37

38 MR. LEE TITUS: Yeah.  
39

40 MR. ROACH: The amendment was to....  
41

42 MR. ISAAC: Mr. Chair, has the main motion received a  
43 second?  
44

45 MR. LEE TITUS: Yeah, yeah. We're in discussion now.  
46

47 MR. ROACH: Okay. There were two parts to my motion.  
48

49 MR. LEE TITUS: Yeah.  
50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

1  
2 MR. ROACH: I'm clarifying that motion now. There are  
3 two parts. The first is that at this time we accept Option C  
4 as an interim and that we revisit the C&T at our next meeting,  
5 requesting that the village councils draft proposals for review  
6 by this Council. Did I complicate things extremely?  
7  
8 MR. LEE TITUS: No. No second?  
9  
10 MR. MILLER: I'll -- just for a -- go ahead and  
11 question. I'll second that.  
12  
13 MR. LEE TITUS: Oh, you'll second that.  
14  
15 MR. MATHEWS: Has there been a second on the amendment?  
16  
17 MR. LEE TITUS: He just seconded the amendment.  
18  
19 MR. MATHEWS: Oh.  
20  
21 MR. LEE TITUS: Okay. We have an amendment. We have a  
22 motion on amendment and we have a second on the amendment.  
23 We're under discussion of the amendment.  
24  
25 MR. MATHEWS: No, you're under -- go ahead.  
26  
27 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Mr. Chairman?  
28  
29 MR. LEE TITUS: Yes, Charlie?  
30  
31 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: I think it's better down the  
32 lines I'm thinking because it does give us six months or four  
33 months, five months,....  
34  
35 MR. ROACH: About six months.  
36  
37 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: ....and it does give the  
38 Council -- take it back to the council for their  
39 commendation, right? The village council....  
40  
41 MR. ROACH: Yes.  
42  
43 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: ....for us.  
44  
45 MR. LEE TITUS: What's Option C?  
46  
47 MR. ROACH: Option C is listed -- it's presented on the  
48 wall over there and it's also in our book under Tab....  
49  
50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

1 MR. MATHEWS: Is that the Upper Tanana?

2

3 MR. ROACH: It's the Upper Tanana LAC. It's under  
4 Tab 8.

5

6 MR. MATHEWS: Mr. Chairman, there's a timing factor  
7 that seems to be coming up here.

8

9 MR. LEE TITUS: Right, right.

10

11 MR. MATHEWS: Yes. A passage of this would change the  
12 scheduling of this C&T Process that was laid out early on, but  
13 the board -- I'll have to defer to Council on that, but the  
14 board is not under, to my knowledge, any requirement to have  
15 such and such done by such and such a date. And maybe Council  
16 can address that, and that may clear up this timing question.  
17 If you desire to have the solicitor speak on that....

18

19 MR. GOLTZ: No, there's no legal requirement that you  
20 act at any certain time. There's no legal requirement that you  
21 do this at all. You could also just stick with seasons and bag  
22 limits and methods and means, and work with the local councils  
23 that way. What's driving this is an administrative schedule,  
24 not a law or a regulation. One thing I'd like to emphasize is  
25 that these regulations were put together for your assistance.  
26 If you find that you're tripping over them and they're getting  
27 in your way, you should consider recommending changes. You're  
28 not required to act in any sort of a schedule on this.

29

30 MR. LEE TITUS: Randy?

31

32 MR. MAYO: Mr. Chairman, I'm of the same mind as  
33 Charlie is. You know, I can't -- not being from this area, I  
34 want to get direction from the councils and the people and the  
35 chief before I can do anything, you know, otherwise, I can't  
36 act on this because I don't know this traditional use areas  
37 around here. You know, the way I see it, it has to come from  
38 within the affected villages. Then only when I hear from the  
39 people, then I'll go with what they want.

40

41 MR. LEE TITUS: Since we're under discussion of the  
42 amendment, I'm going to speak in opposing the motion to amend.  
43 I believe that we can deal with Option C either later on when  
44 we come back to C&T on the agenda. And I am in favor of the  
45 main motion, like I said earlier, because it will have the  
46 communities -- right now, there's nothing written in law saying  
47 that -- the only way that things are written now is that when  
48 this thing becomes law, it's force upon by a community. And  
49 the main motion says that a community will have an opportunity

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

either to go for this book or against it and that's one of the main focuses that I support the main motion, is that a law is not forced upon a community. Any more discussion on the amendment?

5

6 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Mr. Chairman?

7

8 MR. LEE TITUS: Charlie?

9

10 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Yes, I think I agree with you.  
11 didn't see the C, Option C. I'm sorry.

12

13 MR. ENTSMINGER: Mr. Chair, can I....

14

15 MR. LEE TITUS: Yeah, Frank, go ahead.

16

17 MR. ENTSMINGER: In defense of that recommendation C which I'm the basic author of, all that's saying -- that's, you know, white man's terminology of expressing what you people are actually wanting through your Council involvement and all. According to all of the documented records and everything which all of these communities have had input saying that we hunt here and we use these animals here, it's a very broad scope that includes everything that any one of our communities have asked for as far as C&T hunting. And the outline is that there's nothing in that recommendation that will preclude the long-term users from using the resource first if, you know, in times of need it has to be that way.

29

30 Basically, it's my white cultural saying the same thing that the Native culture is saying. So, that's about as simple as I can put it.

33

34 MR. LEE TITUS: Thank you, Frank. I'm not opposing the amendment because of Option C. No. I think that's a really good option. I'm just opposing the amendment because I think that we can deal with Option C, like I said, later on as we come back to C&T. I'm just -- what -- right now what I'm dealing with is the process. I think we have to get the process kind of straightened out. A lot of the Council members are really -- they're at a loss on the process. And, like I said, from -- what I hear from them earlier, they'd like to have community input prior to this coming in the Federal Register. That's all I'm dealing with right now.

45

46 MR. ENTSMINGER: Yeah, I understand, Mr. Chair.

47

48 MR. LEE TITUS: Okay.

49

50

#### R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

1 MR. ENTSMINGER: And I'm not trying to push you one way  
 2 or another. I tried to draw up something that I felt was  
 3 completely fair with everybody in this area. I do want to say  
 4 that I'm not going to be able to be here tomorrow, so I just  
 5 wish you good luck in solving the problem. Thank you.

6  
 7 MR. LEE TITUS: All right. Thank you, Frank. Any more  
 8 discussion on the amendment? John?

9  
 10 MR. STARR: Mr. Chairman, I feel the same way, too.  
 11 It's pretty hard to make decisions for -- we said that in our  
 12 first meeting here, you know, and we don't have input from the  
 13 people. Now we're getting that and I'd like to see what they  
 14 come up with in our next meeting because it's pretty hard to  
 15 vote on something when that's -- especially when you don't live  
 16 in this area.

17  
 18 (Pause; Mr. Lee Titus reviewing maps on wall)

19  
 20 MR. ROACH: Is there any further discussion?

21  
 22 MR. LEE TITUS: Yeah?

23  
 24 MR. ROACH: I just asked if there was any further  
 25 discussion.

26  
 27 MR. LEE TITUS: Oh, okay.

28  
 29 MR. ROACH: There doesn't appear to be any.

30  
 31 MR. LEE TITUS: No more further discussion on the  
 32 amendment? Motion to amend. Hearing none, all in favor of the  
 33 amended motion, signify by saying aye.

34  
 35 MR. ROACH: Aye.

36  
 37 MR. MILLER: Aye.

38  
 39 MR. LEE TITUS: All those opposed? Aye.

40  
 41 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Aye.

42  
 43 MR. STARR: Aye.

44  
 45 MR. MAYO: Aye.

46  
 47 MS. PETRUSKA: Aye.

48  
 49 MR. LEE TITUS: The ayes have it.

50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
 277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
 272-7515

1  
2 Audience laughter)  
3  
4 MR. MATHEWS: Mr. Chairman, so then the vote was one  
5 for and six against?  
6  
7 MR. LEE TITUS: I believe it was two for or....  
8  
9 MR. ROACH: Two for.  
10  
11 MR. LEE TITUS: Two for.  
12  
13 MR. MATHEWS: Two for.  
14  
15 MR. LEE TITUS: Two for and....  
16  
17 MR. ROACH: Mr. Chairman?  
18  
19 MR. LEE TITUS: Yeah.  
20  
21 MR. ROACH: I have a question on the main motion as it  
22 stands right now. The main motion will not preclude us, then,  
23 from taking action during this meeting at a later time on one  
24 of the options?  
25  
26 MR. LEE TITUS: No. No.  
27  
28 MR. MATHEWS: It doesn't deter you at all, no.  
29  
30 MR. LEE TITUS: No.  
31  
32 MR. ROACH: Okay.  
33  
34 MR. LEE TITUS: Okay. We're back to the main motion.  
35 I got a question about all these other options here. I'm only  
36 dealing with No. 4. I think if Council feels it appropriate  
37 later on when we do C&Ts or when we discuss this some more, I  
38 don't know, maybe they want -- maybe you want to make a motion  
39 adopting the whole thing. But right now, I'm just dealing  
40 with No. 4. Charlie?  
41  
42 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Mr. Chairman, my intent  
43 earlier was to eliminate all that and give it back to -- give  
44 it to the council, just -- I mean give it to the tribal council  
45 whoever is in these villages. Let them make a decision. If  
46 they want to modify it, fine. I'm only dealing -- like you  
47 said, you're only dealing with No. 4. I feel the same way.  
48  
49 MR. STARR: Mr. Chairman?  
50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515

1  
2 MR. LEE TITUS: Yes, John?

3  
4 MR. STARR: I feel the same way, too, about that.  
5

6 MR. LEE TITUS: Okay. All right. We're back to the  
main motion. I speak in favor of the main motion because off  
and on we had local residents here come up and say that they  
didn't like State and Federal laws being imposed upon them.  
And if a C&T is going to be determined, this motion says that  
it will have to be approved by a village council prior to it  
becoming law and, therefore, I speak in favor of the main  
motion. Any more discussion?

14  
15 MR. CHARLIE TITUS, JR.: Call for the question.

16  
17 MR. LEE TITUS: The question is called. All in favor  
of the motion, signify by saying aye.

19  
20 ALL MEMBERS: Aye.

21  
22 MR. LEE TITUS: Opposed? Motion carries. The ayes  
have it. I guess we're going to take a break and we're going  
to have lunch provided. People are going to come by and -- I  
mean, we're going to have to set up for lunch. Everybody is  
invited to stay for lunch, all the visitors, all the staff  
agencies. Stick around for refreshments.

28  
29 (Audience laughter)

30  
31 MR. LEE TITUS: Yeah, we're going to recess till nine.  
32 I'm just joking. I'm just joking. Stick around. We're going  
to recess till nine a.m. in the morning. We're going to have  
the State and Federal agencies give their report, and the  
National Park Service will give their report at nine a.m., and  
then Fish and Wildlife, BLM, Alaska -- are you going to -- oh,  
okay. Craig will do the Alaska Fish and Game. So, we'll see  
you at nine a.m.

39  
40 (Off record; 6:00 p.m.)

41  
42 \*\*\*\*\*  
43 MEETING ADJOURNED  
44 \*\*\*\*\*

45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
272-7515



C E R T I F I C A T E

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA )

) ss.

STATE OF ALASKA )

I, Elizabeth D'Amour, Notary Public in and for the  
 State of Alaska and Reporter for R & R Court Reporters, Inc.,  
 do hereby certify:

THAT the foregoing pages numbered through  
 contain a full, true, and correct Transcript of the Eastern  
 Interior Regional Subsistence Advisory Council meeting taken  
 electronically by me on the 2nd day of March, 1995, beginning  
 at the hour of 9:30 o'clock a.m. at the Community Center,  
 Northway, Alaska;

THAT the transcript is a true and correct transcript  
 requested to be transcribed and thereafter transcribed by me to  
 the best of my knowledge and ability;

THAT I am not an employee, attorney, or party  
 interested in any way in this action.

DATED at Fairbanks, Alaska, this 8th day of March,  
 1995.

Notary Public in and for Alaska  
 My Commission Expires: 5/12/98

S E A L

R & R COURT REPORTERS

810 N STREET  
 277-0572/Fax 274-8982

1007 WEST THIRD AVENUE  
 272-7515